



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

COLOMBIA

OTI's Integrated Governance Response Program (IGRP)

Final Evaluation by
Caroline Hartzell, Robert D. Lamb, Phillip McLean, and Johanna Mendelson Forman,
with Maria Cristina Olano

CSIS | CENTER FOR STRATEGIC &
INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

April 2011





Chronology of Significant Events

- 2004-2006: President Uribe's *Plan Patriota* reestablishes security around Bogotá, and establishes a presence in some parts of the country held by the FARC
- 2007: Minister of Defense Juan Manuel Santos recognizes cannot consolidate state presence in areas recently cleared of illegal groups without civilian institutions; Vice Minister Sergio Jaramillo leads effort to conceptualize, design consolidation strategy and pilot project
- 2007: OTI creates Integrated Governance Response Program (IGRP) to help; goals are:
 - strengthen credibility, legitimacy of Gov't of Colombia (GoC) in post-conflict zones
 - increase willingness, capacity of communities in transition to interact with government
 - increase GoC capacity to respond (timely, credibly) to community-prioritized needs
- 2007: OTI helps GoC create Integrated Consolidation Plan of Macarena (PCIM) to establish security presence, eradicate illicit funding source (coca), establish legitimate state presence
- 2009: PCIM becomes model for GoC's National Consolidation Plan (PNC)
- 2009: U.S. Embassy launches Colombia Strategic Development Initiative (CSDI) to coordinate U.S. support to consolidation among all U.S. entities operating in Colombia
- 2010: Santos becomes president, Jaramillo national security adviser, prioritizes consolidation, PNC into National Development Plan (PND), land restitution a new issue



Integrated Governance Response Program (IGRP)

- 2007-2011: pilot, IGRP, PCIM, PNC, CSDI, PND
 - IGRP ends June 30, 2011; transition to USAID Mission
- Programs in Meta (PCIM), Tolima, Montes de Maria
 - GoC Coordination—Acción Social, CCAI, RCCs
 - Colombia Responde—infrastructure, community priorities
 - Progreso—income-generation, agricultural inputs, small biz
 - Post-Eradication Projects—associations, small farmers
- IGRP: financial, technical support from OTI
- Colombia Strategic Development Initiative (CSDI) to coordinate U.S. aid among all USG entities



Final Evaluation of OTI's Colombia Programs (IGRP)

- Feb. 2011: Washington, Bogotá, 25+ project sites:
 - Meta: Granada, La Macarena, Puerto Rico, San Juan de Arama, Santo Domingo, Villavicencio, and Vista Hermosa
 - Tolima: Ibagué, Chaparral, El Limón, and Rioblanco
 - Montes de Maria: Cartagena and El Salado
- Documents, interviews: Did IGRP meet objectives?
 - Help GoC meet its strategic objectives on consolidation?
 - Project activities help achieve overall program objectives?
 - Contribute to fulfillment of OTI's mission?
- Review progress since 2009 mid-term evaluation



General Observations: Positives

- Team found improved security, new infrastructure, growth of economic opportunities in all three regions
- Presence of project staff contributed to positive local attitudes about the state, communities' place in Colombian society
- Positive comments on speed, flexibility, transparency of projects supported by Acción Social, Colombia Responde, and Progreso



General Observations: Negatives

- Serious concerns about transition, cost, sustainability
- Justice sector needs attention (e.g., prosecutors)
- Communities expressed concern consolidation projects provided only short-term solutions
- Increased state presence raised community expectations, possibly too high

- Caveat: some less secure, outlying areas could not be evaluated directly (only document, survey review)



Main Findings: Overall Successful Program

- OTI helped GoC establish effective state presence.
 - catalyzed GoC action: encouraged planning, coordination
 - catalyzed USG action: demonstration effect, OTI approach
 - catalyzed community action by encouraging participation
- OTI achieved program objectives.
 - state present, more responsive, community interacting
 - Colombia Responde, Progreso clear ongoing contribution
 - less evidence on post-eradication projects (most in past)
- OTI's support fast, flexible, accountable, anonymous.
 - helped build capacity of GoC to take lead and credit



Lessons Learned and Recommendations

- Colombia program's lessons relevant to:
 - programming in other post-conflict and transition countries
 - transition and future U.S. programs in Colombia
- Recommendations:
 - coordinated transition planning: OTI and Mission
 - recruit private-sector funding partners
 - manage community expectations from the start
 - let host-nation government take lead and credit
 - emphasize self-sufficiency, e.g. renewable energy
 - emphasize programs for women and elderly



Recommendations: Transition Planning

- Concerns about sustainability, hand-off from special ‘transition’ programs to ‘normal’ processes
 - from OTI (with CCAI, Acción Social, Progreso, Responde)
 - to Mission (with ministries, departmental & municipal gov’ts)
- Coordinated planning for transition needed on both sides of hand-off as early in program as possible
 - OTI and Mission: coordinate transition planning
- Hard-won gains to stability can be lost quickly



Recommendations: Private-Sector Funding

- Concerns about cost of consolidation, sources of funding
- Improved security & infrastructure lowers costs, opens opportunities to large enterprises in consolidation zones;
 - many already taking advantage of improvements, investing
 - encourage major beneficiaries to become funding partners
- Caveat: Balance rights of small enterprises, farmers
- Fundación Semana, El Salado, Montes: linking private-public for income projects, social services



Recommendations: Managing Expectations

- Expectation cycles normal part of development
- Consolidation programs meant to build trust, so raising then dashing expectations self-defeating
- Program design, strategic communication plan both need to include expectations management from start
- U.S. agencies should not over-promise to partners; partners should not over-promise to communities
 - engage communities in explicit discussions
 - best defense: honest and modest in promises



Recommendations: Strat. Communication, Branding

- Point of consolidation is to build credibility of state institutions, confidence in gov't as service provider.
 - letting host-nation government take lead builds its capacity and its relationships with communities in consolidation zones
 - creating Colombian brand for development projects helped make the state visible in consolidation zones
 - message of host-country ownership promoted U.S. foreign policy goals more effectively than taking credit would have
- In some places, public U.S. role delegitimizes partner
 - minimize U.S. brand in transition zones where U.S. role would be questioned by communities or stigmatize partner



Recommendations: Fostering Self-Sufficiency

- Progreso and Colombia Responde laid a foundation for greater community self-sufficiency
- Obstacles to sustaining self-sufficiency arose from:
 - distance to municipal center (i.e., isolated outlying districts)
 - ‘luck of the draw’ with mayors
 - quality of infrastructure (e.g., access to roads, electric grid)
- Renewable energy an important option to consider



Recommendations: Women and Elderly

- Many households in consolidation zones headed by single women with children
 - focus on women is ‘force multiplier’ in development
 - income-generating projects, vocational training, credit, small-business support, child care
 - greatest effect in outlying districts
- Few services currently available to elderly
 - GoC’s social safety net did not reach them
 - only some consolidation projects provided support



Recommendations to USAID Mission

- Take advantage of transition window
 - for successful projects, no gaps in timing or resources
 - smooth handoff of transition programs to Mission:
 - seamless continuity of projects (and field staff if possible)
 - lower risk of dashing recipients' raised expectations
- Colombia today poses both an opportunity and a risk
 - opportunity: successful OTI programming fostered state legitimacy and helped Colombian state exercise control over its territory—consistent with U.S. interests in Colombia
 - risk: this hard-earned success is likely to be undermined if projects go dark for many months—counter to U.S. interests



Recommendations to USAID Mission, cont.

- Link land titling and restitution to consolidation
- Continue supporting civil-sector projects to help GoC (national, departmental, local) improve consolidation
 - involve communities in prioritizing projects, contributing to implementation, establishing producer associations, connecting with state institutions
 - manage community expectations
- Strengthen strategic communication in major cities to maintain political support for consolidation



Recommendations to USAID Mission, cont.

- Emphasize municipal capacity and participation in USAID projects in consolidation zones so that communities see more of a local ‘face’ on projects
- Strengthen support to Regional Coordination Centers as key link among national, departmental, and local governments
- Continue integrated approach to post-eradication efforts to minimize coca re-planting
 - study sociocultural factors contributing to families’ desire to stay in legal economy post-eradication



Conclusion

- U.S. interests are best served when consolidation programs make smooth transition to long-term, sustainable programs sponsored by host country
- Accomplishing this objective often requires host-nation branding and a low U.S. profile in the field



USAID | **COLOMBIA**
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

Questions?



USAID | COLOMBIA

FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



- The central plaza being rebuilt in El Limón, Tolima



USAID | COLOMBIA



- A Colombian military officer browses the stacks at the municipal library in Vista Hermosa, Meta



USAID | COLOMBIA

FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



- Children's section of Vista Hermosa municipal library



USAID | COLOMBIA

FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



- In Santo Domingo, a clinic never completed by the FARC (top left)
- Below, the OTI-funded clinic stands nearby



USAID | COLOMBIA

FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



- A young girl drinks water at the Vista Hermosa sewing cooperative



USAID | COLOMBIA

FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



- A security manager for OTI implementing partner Crea Colombia stands at the end of a newly rehabilitated road in Meta



USAID | COLOMBIA

FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



- A staff member from PCIM (left) speaks with two members of the evaluation team in Puerto Rico, Meta



USAID | COLOMBIA

FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



- A sign on a small store in Santo Domingo reads “Peace for Colombia”