

ENTER JOVEM

End Of Project Evaluation



August - 2007

Prepared by:

**Ramon Balestino,
Independent Consultant**

Acknowledgements

The team would first like to acknowledge the leadership and commitment of all agencies linked to Enter Jovem and working for the social and economic empowerment of disadvantaged young people in Brazil. In particular, we recognize the US Agency for International Development / Brazil, American Institutes for Research/Brazil (AIR), the Committee for the Democratization for Information and Communication Technology (CDI) and the Brazilian Administrative Institute for Development (IBRAD).

The team has benefited from the generous contributions of individuals that reach from Brazil to Washington DC. In Salvador we are grateful to: Tanya Andrade, Silvana Jonas, Alejandro Arber, Ana Carolina Dalcum, Lorena Davalos, Edméa Dourado Nunes Lopes, Kleber Bernardes and Jusciney Santana. In Recife thanks go to: Josélia Caldas, Ana Cláudia Ferreira, Karla Lavrador, Cleide de Moraes, Jonas Soares, Tiago Galvão and Ricardo Brasileiro. In Washington we would like to acknowledge: Joseph Lombardo, Carlos Penagos and Clinton Doggett. Special appreciation is also offered to current and previous USAID/Brazil staff for providing key insights into this program: Jennifer Adams, Gabriela Goulart and Nena Lentini.

The evaluation was also enormously enriched by the participation of Brazilian young people who served as advisors, facilitators and analytical partners throughout the entire process: Rute Borges and Gabriella Maia (Salvador); Ana Luiza Gonçalves Ferreira and Ana Célia Arcanjo dos Santos (Recife); and, Lucíola Limaverde Ribeiro and Ivna Bessa Siqueira Campos (Fortaleza).

Finally we would like to appreciate the young women and men who participated in the 39 focus groups across Salvador, Recife and Fortaleza. Our understanding of Enter Jovem was greatly informed by their critical insights as well as enthusiasm and ideas for its future.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acknowledgements	ii
Table of Contents	iii
Executive Summary	v
List of Acronyms	vii
I. PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION	1
II. BACKGROUND	1
III. EVALUATION DESIGN	2
A. Methodology	2
B. Research Sample	3
IV. SUMMARY OF PROGRAM ACTIVITIES	4
A. Key Activities Under IR 10.1	5
B. Key Activities Under IR 10.2	6
V. FINDINGS	6
A. Impact of Key Activities Upon Youth Beneficiaries	6
1. Under IR 10.1 – Marketable Skills Training	6
2. Under IR 10.2 – Access to Formal Market Employment	10
B. Efficacy of Methodologies for Sustainability and Replicability	16
C. Data Quality Assessment	19
1. Prominent Data Quality Issues	19
2. Indicator Data Quality Assessment	23
VI. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	25
A. Program Successes	25
B. Program Challenges	25
C. Recommendations	27
1. Youth Beneficiary Recommendations	27

2.	Summative Recommendations	28
D.	Conclusions	29

ANNEXES

ANNEX A: LIST OF DOCUMENTS REVIEWED	32
--	-----------

ANNEX B: KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEWS	34
--	-----------

ANNEX C: YOUTH VOLUNTEER TEAM EVALUATION REPORTS	36
---	-----------

1.	Salvador, BA	36
2.	Recife, PE	42
3.	Fortaleza, CE	47

ANNEX D: FOCUS GROUP PROTOCOL	52
--	-----------

1.	Youth	52
2.	Educators and Coordinators	53
3.	Implementing Agencies	54

ANNEX E: SURVEYS	55
-------------------------------	-----------

1.	Rapid Youth Survey	55
2.	Company Survey	56

ANNEX F: DATA SUMMARY	57
------------------------------------	-----------

1.	Youth Sample: Focus Group and Survey Information	57
2.	Company Sample: Interviews and Survey Information	58
3.	Random Sample of Required Products: Résumé and Life Plan	59
4.	ICT Inserted Youth by Position and Gender	60
5.	Success List Recommendations: Youth	61
6.	Success List Recommendations: Educators and Coordinators	62
7.	Success List Recommendations: Implementing Agencies	63

TABLES

Table 1	Characteristics of Primary Sample	4
Table 2	Enter Jovem Performance Framework	4
Table 3	Total Basic Training Graduates	7
Table 4	Accumulated Job Placement and Insertion	10
Table 5	Total Placement/Insertion By Labor Categories	12
Table 6	Total Placement/Insertion By State	12
Table 7	Leading Companies Employing Enter Jovem Youth	13
Table 8	ICT Companies Employing Enter Jovem Youth	14

Table 9	Small Grant Program Impact Upon Youth	15
Table 10	Enter Jovem Leveraged Resources	18

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The American Institutes of Research (AIR) in Brazil has requested a final evaluation and data quality assessment of the USAID/Brazil-funded Enter Jovem program. Currently, AIR and its local partners CDI and IBRAD are closing out this four-year workforce development program which aims to provide disadvantaged youth in Northeastern Brazil workforce training and access to formal market employment opportunities.

The evaluation was guided by two framing questions: (a) What is the depth and extent of impact of Enter Jovem on the intended beneficiary population of disadvantaged youth? and (b) What is the relative efficacy of project methodologies and activities for sustainability and replicability? The scope of the study centered upon the major program interventions as they correspond to USAID IR 10.1: Increased Marketable Skills Training for At-Risk Youth and 10.2: Increased Access of At-Risk Youth to Formal Market Employment.

The evaluation team consisted of a lead evaluator (US-based), supported by three locally based teams of youth volunteer evaluators. Fieldwork was conducted in Salvador, Recife and Fortaleza from April 9 - May 7, 2007. A purposeful non-random sampling approach was utilized to examine a population whose characteristics matched the program's targeted results: graduation in Basic Training and insertion into formal market employment. Evaluation findings were organized into three sections: (a) impact of key activities upon youth beneficiaries under each IR; (b) efficacy of methodologies for sustainability; and (c) data quality analysis.

Impact of Key Activities Upon Youth Beneficiaries

Under IR 10.1:

- Across its lifecycle, the Enter Jovem program has produced a positive impact upon the graduation rates of disadvantaged youth in the Basic Training course
- Basic Training has positively impacted the marketable skills of graduates in operating a computer, accessing Internet and using software to design job-search tools.
- A small number of Basic Training graduates were impacted by the complementary courses of Workplace Behavior and Portuguese/Math.
- Basic Training has produced a moderate impact upon graduates' critical awareness of the job market and workplace behavior/communication abilities.

Under IR 10.2:

- The Enter Jovem program has produced a positive impact in increasing Basic Training graduates' access to and retention in formal market jobs.
- The Employability Workshops have positively impacted the interview behaviors and job-searching strategies of a self-selecting population of graduating youth.

- The Labor Market Insertion Strategy has been most successful at bridging employment opportunities in the Formal Market labor category.
- The Enter Jovem program has positively impacted entry-level employment for youth across a wide range of companies in the retail trade, restaurant and service industries.
- The Enter Jovem program has had a minimal impact on employment outcomes in the ICT industry, particularly among graduating females.
- The Small Grants Program has multiplied Enter Jovem's positive impact upon youth's skills and employment opportunities.

Sustainability and Replicability

- The Enter Jovem program has produced a high-level of institutional sustainability and potential for replication among local executing agencies.
- Enter Jovem has successfully leveraged resources through strategic partnerships, which demonstrates potential toward financial sustainability.
- The Enter Jovem workforce model has generated solid potential for scale-oriented replication within public and private sectors.

Data Quality Analysis

- The overarching threat to Enter Jovem data is that there is no single data collection system that unifies efforts and information among executing agencies.
- The diligent validation of data produced by Salvador and Recife training activities is leaving information from other key areas of the program vulnerable to threats.
- Enter Jovem's established baseline does not allow for measurement of program performance as targeted by the three major program results.

Conclusion

Since inception, Enter Jovem has made a significant contribution to raising awareness around the importance of youth workforce development within communities, businesses, local NGOs and, most importantly, the youth themselves. Currently, Enter Jovem is on-track to meet and surpass the three major program targets reported to USAID under SO 10. This is particularly notable considering the program's modus operandi: bridging first employment opportunities for disadvantaged youth in cities possessing the highest unemployment rates in Brazil. Within this context, the program has blazed a trail for open access workforce insertion programs targeting these youth. With appropriate programmatic streamlining and the leveraging of further development partnerships, the evaluation sees the Enter Jovem program as poised to ramp-up its positive impact upon youth.

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AIR	American Institutes of Research
APABB	Associação de Pais e Amigos de Pessoas Portadoras de Deficiências
APAE	Associação de Pais e Amigos dos Excepcionais
BA	Brazilian State of Bahia
BMEG	Bridging the Market and Educational Gaps
CE	Brazilian State of Ceará
CEPRIMA	Centro de Comunidade Primeiro de Maio
CESEP	Centro Suburbano de Educação Profissional
CBO	Community Based Organizations
CDI	Comitê para Democratização da Informática
CD-ROM	Compact Disc Read-Only-Memory
CIEE	Centro de Integração Empresa-Escola
EIC	Escolas de Informática e Cidadania
FGI	Focus Group Interview
FIB	Centro Universitário
GOB	Government of Brazil
IBCM	Instituição Beneficente Conceição Macedo
IBRAD	Instituto Brasileiro de Administração para o Desenvolvimento
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IDER	Instituto de Desenvolvimento Sustentável e Energias Renováveis
IR	Intermediate Result
JUCEB	Junta Comercial de Estado da Bahia
LMIS	Labor Market Insertion Strategy
MFI	Microfinance Institution
MIS	Management Information System
MS	Microsoft
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PE	Brazilian State of Pernambuco
PRODEB	Processamento de Dados do Estado da Bahia
SEBRAE	Serviço Brasileiro de Apoio às Micro e Pequenas Empresas
SENAI	Serviço Nacional de Aprendizagem Industrial
SENAC	Serviço Nacional de Aprendizagem Comercial
SENAR	Serviço Nacional de Aprendizagem Rural
SENAT	Serviço Nacional de Aprendizagem do Transporte
SESCOOP	Serviço Nacional de Aprendizagem do Cooperativismo
SGP	Enter Jovem Small Grants Program
SIMM	Serviço Municipal de Intermediação de Mão-de-obra
SO	Strategic Objective
TIP	Trafficking In Persons
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
YABT	Young Americas Business Trust

I. PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION

The American Institutes of Research (AIR) in Brazil has requested a final evaluation and data quality assessment of the USAID/Brazil-funded youth workforce development program Enter Jovem. Specifically, a review was called for that measures the impact on intended beneficiaries and the relative efficacy of project activities for sustainability. Qualitative and quantitative tools were utilized to examine Enter Jovem as executed within capital cities of three Northeastern states: Salvador, Bahia; Recife, Pernambuco; and Fortaleza, Ceará.

Historically, USAID/Brazil has worked to complement government initiatives through programs and policies designed to increase the socio-economic status, dignity and protection of disadvantaged youth.¹ The Enter Jovem strategy links to these efforts at strategic objective (SO) 10: Access to Training and Employability Skills and Opportunities Increased for Disadvantaged Youth.² Here, program interventions are reported under IR 10.1: Increased Marketable Skills Training for At-Risk Youth and IR 10.2: Increased Access of At-Risk Youth to Formal Market Employment.

The scope of the evaluation centered upon major program interventions as they correspond to IR 10.1 and 10.2. Enter Jovem's multiple initiatives were also recognized; however, a detailed analysis of each was beyond the scope and resources of this evaluation. As the program will end in September-2007, current available data was utilized to support findings.

Overall, this effort seeks to guide future decision-making around the Enter Jovem program as well as fortify the design and implementation of future youth workforce insertion programs. This study has therefore prioritized information that enables learning and insight into the dynamic realities of the youth workforce development field in Brazil.

II. BACKGROUND: ENTER JOVEM PROGRAM

Currently, AIR and its local partners CDI and IBRAD are implementing Enter Jovem – a four-year workforce insertion program targeting disadvantaged youth in Northeast Brazil. This program was designed in response to USAID/Brazil's RFA 512-03-004, which called for an initiative to complement the GOB's First Job program. Launched in 2003, First Job sought to close the youth unemployment gap through technical training and workforce insertion – which included financially rewarding companies for providing first jobs to youth.

The Enter Jovem program was designed to impact the employability opportunities of disadvantaged youth through three interdependent efforts: (a) conducting a youth-driven market analysis to determine local demand; (b) integrating a workforce training into the CDI network of

¹ USAID/Brazil defines disadvantaged youth as, "young people, ages 14-21, that come from families at the lower end of the economic scale and have had inadequate access to quality education, healthcare and other social services thus reducing their potential to enter mainstream society or to become working, productive Brazilian citizens.

Throughout this report, youth and young people will be used interchangeably to refer to this population.

² In FY 2006 USAID/Brazil augmented SO 10 to include a focus upon trafficking in persons (TIP). Thus, the SO 10 that corresponded to Enter Jovem's design in FY 03 was moved from "Access to Training and Employability Skills and Opportunities Increased for Disadvantaged Youth" to the current "Economic Alternatives and TIP Services Expanded to Vulnerable Groups". This report will refer to the original SO in FY 03.

ICT and Citizenship Schools (EICs); and (c) working alongside the First Job program to leverage its strategy and bridge formal market employment opportunities for youth.

After the first year of execution, however, a re design process occurred due to a change in program leadership as well as a formal partnership with First Job that had not yet materialized.³ Key efforts included: (i) the reconfiguration of program performance indicators (detailed below in table 2); (ii) a targeted and proactive labor insertion strategy to be led by IBRAD; (iii) the strengthening of the Small Grants Program; and (iv) the formation of partnerships to complement and augment on-going ICT training.

Since initiation, the Enter Jovem program has focused its programmatic efforts in Salvador and Recife. However, in year three, the program was expanded to Fortaleza where it has worked through existing workforce programs carried out by local NGOs. The target population of Enter Jovem is youth, 14-21 years of age, that possess the following profile: registered and attending public school or graduated from secondary school; member of family with per capita income of half the minimum wage; and no previous formal market job experience. These characteristics also serve as a set of minimal enrollment requirements for the Enter Jovem training program.⁴

III. EVALUATION DESIGN

A. METHODOLOGY

The evaluation utilized a participatory methodology that integrated beneficiaries and stakeholders at all stages. The core team consisted of a lead evaluator supported by three locally based teams of youth volunteer evaluators. The lead was a US-based consultant with a regional background in youth livelihoods and organizational development. Youth participants were each engaged in the independent sector and enrolled in and/or finishing university programs. AIR/Brazil, USAID/Brazil, CDI and IBRAD provided support and technical guidance throughout the evaluation.

The evaluation was guided by two framing questions: (a) What is the depth and extent of impact of Enter Jovem on the intended beneficiary population of disadvantaged youth? and (b) What is the relative efficacy of project methodologies and activities for sustainability and replicability? A mixed method approach grounded data collection and a gender analysis was incorporated to identify potential crosscutting issues.

Data was gleaned from primary and secondary sources. Secondary collection included a review of Enter Jovem literature, quarterly reports, program performance data and course generated products. Primary data collection consisted of fieldwork in Salvador, Recife and Fortaleza from April 9 - May 7, 2007. Fieldwork activities were conducted through the following means:

³ Significant effort was made to become a qualified agency of the First Job program. While unsuccessful, this official partnership would have provided qualified status as an education program and enabled 14-16 year old (and after 2005, 14-21 year old) graduates to be hired as apprentices. As a parallel strategy, Enter Jovem partnered with qualified training programs and channelled youth as apprentices.

⁴ Each CBO also decides if a nominal enrollment fee is charged to incoming students. In cases where fee is charged and students cannot afford fee, the CBO typically makes alternative arrangements to ensure enrollment of students.

- **Volunteer Youth Evaluators:** In each capital city, a corresponding team of two youth evaluators were mobilized, trained and incorporated into the fieldwork. Each played a key role in attaining perceptions of their youth colleagues, providing insights into provincial realities and analyzing the program’s regional impact.
- **Focus Group Interviews (FGIs):** This method was utilized with youth beneficiaries, educators, coordinators and implementing agencies. A total of 34 FGIs were conducted: 29 with youth, two with implementing agencies and three with EIC educators and coordinators (see Annex D for focus group protocols).
- **Success Lists:** In each focus group, participants were asked to identify specific interventions to enhance Enter Jovem and/or workforce insertion projects like it. A participant-driven list of ideas was generated, prioritized and further discussed (see Annex F, 5-7 for results)
- **Company Interviews:** Businesses employing youth participants were visited in Salvador, Recife and Fortaleza. Interviews were semi-structured and reinforced with a survey. On-site interviews were also conducted with youth when available.
- **Surveys:** A youth survey was distributed and collected after each youth focus group and a private sector survey was emailed to companies and collected during company interviews (see Annex E for surveys).

Data analysis was iterative throughout the evaluation. Upon conclusion of fieldwork, the evaluation team shared preliminary findings with AIR, CDI and IBRAD staff at Enter Jovem headquarters. Afterward, a content and frequency analysis of focus groups and key informant interviews was performed. Finally, each youth evaluation team produced a report that discussed results corresponding to their province (see Annex C for reports).

B. RESEARCH SAMPLE

A purposeful non-random sampling approach was utilized to examine Basic Training graduates and companies employing them.⁵ In examining this sample, the evaluation sought to measure the impact upon a population whose characteristics matched the program’s major targeted results: graduation in Basic Training and insertion into the formal marketplace.

As seen in Table 1, a total sample of 157 youth and 14 businesses were interviewed in Salvador, Recife and Fortaleza. Selection criteria for youth included: sex, age⁶, graduation in at least Basic Training and placed in job market (see Annex F, 1 for summary of youth sample). Likewise, 14 businesses were identified: six in Salvador, five in Recife and three in Fortaleza. The companies were chosen based on regional location and volume of employment of program youth (see Annex F, 2 for summary of company sample).

⁵ Selection of informants within this sample was driven by the implementing agencies: AIR, CDI and IBRAD.

⁶ The evaluation initially sought to disaggregate youth by age (14-17 and 18-21); however, the sample became diluted during fieldwork.

Data from these two groups were systematically collected and compared constituting, in effect, a supply and demand analysis. In order to obtain a more robust understanding of Enter Jovem’s impact, analysis of program data as well as semi-structured interviews with program staff, CBOs and USAID/Brazil were conducted.

Table 1 Characteristics of Primary Sample

Sample Population	Evaluation Method	Sample Size	Characteristics
Youth Beneficiaries	Focus Groups & Surveys	157 total: - 75 females - 67 males	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Youth interviewed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 64 Salvador - 79 Recife - 14 Fortaleza Average age⁷: 18 Dominant formal schooling completed: 9th grade (primeiro ano) 94% completed Basic 30% completed Intermediate 13% completed Advanced 16% completed Port. & Math 12% completed Workplace Behavior 16% presently employed;
Businesses	Semi-structured Interviews & Surveys	14 companies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Bahiatursa (BA) Bolsa Moderna (BA) Busccar Consultaria (PE) Esmaltec (CE) Faculdade São Salvador (BA) Global do Brasil (PE) Hotel Pestana (BA) Instala Tecnologia (PE) Karsten Nordeste (CE) Lojas Insinuante (PE) McDonalds (BA) McDonalds (PE) SIMM (BA) Top Company RH (CE)

IV. SUMMARY OF KEY PROGRAM ACTIVITIES

The Enter Jovem program centers upon two key workforce development activities: work skills training and job placement and insertion.⁸ Table 2 below organizes the Enter Jovem performance framework and its relationship to SO 10: Access to Training and Employability Skills and Opportunities Increased for Disadvantaged Youth.

Table 2 Enter Jovem Performance Framework

Enter Jovem Major Program Targets	USAID SO 10 Intermediate Result (IR)
1. Job Market Qualification: Upon completion, the project will have trained 4,200 at risk youth trained in the Basic Training course.	<u>IR 10.1:</u> Increased Marketable Skills Training for At-Risk Youth.
2. Job Placement: Upon completion, 20 percent of youth (820 in total) graduating from Basic Training will have been placed into the job market.	<u>IR 10.2:</u> Increased Access of At-Risk Youth to Formal Market Employment.
3. Job Insertion: Upon completion, an increased percentage of youth will have remained in a current or better position for at least a three-moth period.	<u>IR 10.2:</u> Increased Access of At-Risk Youth to Formal Market Employment.

Source: Enter Jovem Logframe

⁷ This average excludes ages of special needs youth in APAE and APABB as there is no required age limit.

⁸ Enter Jovem distinguishes between job placement and job insertion. Placement is considered when youth first secure a job in the formal market. Insertion occurs when youth are retained in the position for over three months.

A. KEY ACTIVITIES UNDER IR 10.1

The major performance indicator under IR 10.1 is to train a total of 4,200 at-risk youth in the Basic Training course.⁹ Here, the training program seeks to transfer the knowledge and skills needed to qualify youth for employment through three areas: (a) social and ICT technical; (b) basic education and workplace abilities; and (c) entrepreneurship. While numerous partnerships are currently responsible for the design and delivery of Enter Jovem courses, the following makes up the heart of the training program:

- **Basic Training** (140 hours): Coordinated by CDI in Salvador and Recife and delivered in over 25 community-based EICs, this course addresses basic ICT skills and engages youth on the concept of citizenship.¹⁰ During year two, Enter Jovem established two complementary trainings:
 - Math & Portuguese (72 hours each): Through a partnership with CIEE in Recife and Santa Luzia in Salvador, the goal of this course is to reinforce basic education skills in writing and financial calculation as applicable to the job market.
 - Workplace Behavior Training (42 hours): Executed by CIEE in Recife and Instituição Beneficente Conceição Macedo (IBCM) in Salvador, the course reinforces job-seeking tools and promotes workplace communication skills.
- **Intermediate Training:** Coordinated by CDI in Salvador and Recife and delivered in EICs, this follow-on course offers two tracks: Basic Web Design (70 hours) and Basic ICT Networks (100 hours).
- **Advanced Training** (144 hours): Coordinated by AIR and carried out by Video Educarte in Salvador and Fundação Gilberto Freire in Recife, this audio/visual course offers three introductory tracks: camera assistant, video production and video editing.
- **Fortaleza Partnerships:** Enter Jovem's Small Grant Program provides support to the existing workforce training/insertion activities of two Fortaleza NGOs:
 - IDER - Renewable Energy Training (640 hours): Enter Jovem supported this workforce project that targeted the qualification and insertion of electricians.
 - Instituto Aliança – Com.Dominio Digital Training (560 hours): Originally part of Entra 21¹¹, Enter Jovem reinforces this NGO's ICT training and insertion activities within Fortaleza.

⁹ Enter Jovem entitles this course the Basic Module. However, to facilitate readability the report will refer to it as "Basic Training".

¹⁰ Citizenship has specific cultural dimensions in Brazil, expressing the nation's aspiration for economic and social justice. Citizenship in the context of youth implies first-person participation in transforming their own lives and that of their communities.

¹¹ Entra 21 was created in 2001 by an alliance between the International Youth Foundation, the Multilateral Investment Fund of the Inter-American Development Bank and USAID. The program goal was to improve the employability of disadvantaged youth (ages 16 to 29) through ICT and life-skills training and job placement.

B. KEY ACTIVITIES UNDER IR 10.2

Performance indicators under IR 10.2 are two-fold: (i) to support the placement of 20 percent of young people completing the Basic Module (approximately 820 at-risk youth); and (ii) to increase the number of youth retained in formal employment for at least a three month period. Enter Jovem's Labor Market Insertion Strategy (LMIS) seeks to facilitate placement and retention of youth within five Brazilian labor categories: Apprenticeship, Paid Internships, Formal Employment, Self-Employment and Entrepreneurship. IBRAD is responsible for the following major insertion activities in Salvador and Recife:

- **Employability Workshops** (4 hours): After completing the Basic Module, youth are invited to this workshop that kicks-off the insertion phase of the program. Here, youth meet with the Insertion Coordinator to create a professional profile and reinforce their resume, which is then entered into the 'Opportunity Databank'.
- **Three-pronged LMIS:** The insertion strategy revolves around three mechanisms that aim to support youth in securing formal employment:
 - **Guided Job-search:** Teams of youth visit small and medium-sized companies to market the Enter Jovem program. Youth typically seek out managers to discuss Enter Jovem program, current vacancies and potential to hire program youth.
 - **Institutional Job-search:** The Insertion Coordinator executes this component through three phases: (a) establishing employment partnerships with medium to large-sized business; (b) securing vacancy requests from partners; and (c) connecting youth in the databank to company interviews.
 - **Autonomous Job-search:** Throughout the trainings, youth are encouraged to be proactive in identifying and securing formal employment.
- **Placement follow-up:** Once youth gain employment, the insertion coordinator contacts a sample at their jobs. This support occurs once per month until they have been at their job for more than three-months.

V. FINDINGS

Evaluation findings will be organized into three sections: (a) impact of key activities upon beneficiaries under each IR; (b) efficacy of methodologies for sustainability; and (c) data quality analysis.

A. IMPACT OF KEY ACTIVITIES UPON YOUTH BENEFICIARIES

1. Under IR 10.1 - Increased Marketable Skills Training for At-Risk Youth

1.1 Across its lifecycle, the Enter Jovem program has produced a positive impact upon the graduation rates of disadvantaged youth in the Basic Training course.

Information technology is clearly an attractive area for youth. Accordingly, Enter Jovem was well received as it provided an accessible opportunity for youth to obtain computer literacy and Internet skills. However, beyond this, a significant segment of focus group youth also expressed that ICT for employment was important in their decision to enroll and participate in the program: *“I enrolled in Enter Jovem to acquire better knowledge of ICT as this is what the market is demanding”*; *“I enrolled in Enter Jovem because I was very interested in ICT as well as broadening my professional profile”*.

Between years one and three, close to 4,000 youth in Salvador and Recife enrolled in the Basic Training course with 67 percent graduating. This completion rate is seen as substantial based on four rationale: (i) the socio-economic backgrounds of participating youth promote dropout to secure work – many times at the insistence of family members; (ii) unlike many programs targeting disadvantaged youth, Enter Jovem did not provide financial assistance to students; (iii) a relatively barrier-free enrollment which results in participating students with varied levels of commitment; and (iv) a high opportunity cost in terms of time required to complete 140 hours of coursework. Table 3 disaggregates youth graduates over the four years of the program.

Table 3 Total Basic Training Graduates

Enter Jovem Cities	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4 4/4007	Current Total: 4/2007
Salvador	223	485	488	136	1,581
Recife	157	737	409	39	718
Fortaleza ¹²			380	----	380
Total	380	1,222	1,277	175	3,054

Source: Enter Jovem Quarterly Report April - 2007

Since year one, Enter Jovem has been consistently growing the number of graduating students in Basic Training. The gender profile of these graduates includes: 1399 males (46 percent of total) and 1655 females (54 percent of total). Equally important, a total of 133 youth with cognitive disabilities have graduated from the Basic Training. With a current total of 3,054 graduates, the training is on-track to reach the IR 10.1 target of graduating 4,200 youth over four years.

1.2 Basic Training has positively impacted the marketable skills of graduates in operating a computer, accessing Internet and using software to design job-search tools.

Largely, Basic Training has been successful at imparting basic ICT skills to its graduates – many of whom in the sample expressed no previous computer knowledge. In the youth sample, over 90 percent of respondents mentioned new computer and Internet abilities when questioned about results of their participation. A disabled youth states, *“The most important thing I learned was to type, print and to access the Internet”*. Another youth notes, *“I didn’t even know how to turn on a computer, I’ve learned so much.”* An Enter Jovem Coordinator confirms, *“Youth who have never seen a computer before have had great growth and we are able to facilitate this.”*

¹² The Enter Jovem Small Grants Project began supporting NGOs in Fortaleza in year three of the project.

In particular, the evaluation found that completion of course-based products demonstrates competency to utilize software as a workforce development tool. The evaluation examined a small random sample of 12 resumes and life plans produced by male and female students in the Basic Training course.¹³ As a performance-based requisite to graduation, students utilize MS Word and Power Point software to construct a ‘Personal Profile’ that consists of a life time-line, résumé and life plan.

In reviewing the sample, it was confirmed that completion of these products demonstrates a competency to utilize software as a workforce development tool. 100 percent of the resumes were constructed on Word, while life plans were presented on Power Point (67 percent) and Word (33 percent). The resumes and life-plans were relatively consistent in terms of format; however, there was some divergence in the sophistication of graphics within Power Point. Interestingly, life plans distinguished between short, medium and long-term goals, but typically did not correspond to professional objectives found on resumes.

Altogether, the evaluation considers the completion of these products to be representative of youth’s increased ICT capacity. The Basic Training course has demonstrated an effective method to link ICT learning to the construction of job search tools and personal development plans. Due to time and resource constraints, however, the evaluation was unable to ground-truth the practical application of these skills and tools in the job development activities of youth.

1.3 A small number of Basic Training graduates were impacted by the complementary courses of Workplace Behavior and Portuguese/Math.

Between years two and three, two complementary courses were integrated into Basic Training: Math & Portuguese and Work Place Behavior. Although these courses were not mandatory, Enter Jovem began to offer them in the middle of the second year as a means to improve basic education skills.

As of April 2007, a total of 267 youth completed Math & Portuguese, and 165 concluded Workplace Behavior. When compared to Basic Training graduates, completion levels for the complementary courses are modest: of the total graduates in Salvador and Recife since year three (1072), 25 percent completed Portuguese & Math and 15 percent finished the course in Work Place Behavior.¹⁴ Similar levels were recorded among the youth sample: 16 percent reported completing Portuguese & Math and 12 percent cited finishing the Workplace Behavior course.

This finding urges three further questions: (i) were courses in-line with the educational needs of youth? (ii) did youth perceive these courses as important and relevant to their employment goals and/or the job market? and (iii) were the courses readily accessible within the context of the Basic Training? The evaluation did not focus its lens upon the complementary trainings.

¹³ These products were examined across six EICs in Salvador and Recife in years three and four of the project (see Annex F, 3).

¹⁴ As of the drafting of the evaluation, a total of 333 youth are undergoing training in the complementary courses. A calculation can be made at project close to determine final completion ratio.

However, a number of factors were brought up during interviews in Recife as limiting enrollment and completion:

- Courses were optional, stand-alone trainings being delivered in EICs by outside agencies;
- Scheduling and administrative conflicts challenged the availability of courses;
- Course hours did not always coincide with young people's availability;
- Courses were not being well enough promoted or known within the EIC reality;
- The importance and relevance of courses to the job market was not sufficiently emphasized or integrated into the Basic Training;
- The branding of "Portuguese and Math Workshops" was seen to discourage youth to register and/or take the courses;
- Math and Portuguese curricula were standard and didn't meet diverse learning needs;
- Class duration (four consecutive hours) was seen as lengthy.

These issues are not meant to serve as a comprehensive list; yet, they can begin to address the questions above. The content covered by the complementary courses is seen as one of the most important within Enter Jovem's Basic Training course. This being the case, their reach and effectiveness merits further reflection.

1.4 Basic Training has produced a moderate impact upon graduates' critical awareness of the job market and workplace behavior/communication abilities.

Enter Jovem staff and youth participants alike expressed that the basic training has "*awakened youth to the world of work*". Indeed, the evaluation found that, as one male stated, "*Youth were able to have the vision of employability through Enter Jovem*". Across the sample, particularly females, linked completing training to the job market: "*There are no employment opportunities for those that don't know ICT*"; "*The job market is demanding schooling, experience and ICT*"; "*The opportunity to complete this course is the opportunity to enter the job market*".

Although training was seen as effective at bringing employability to the consciousness and discourse of youth participants, a deeper understanding of key workforce skills was found to be missing. Based on interviews with youth and businesses, the evaluation observed gaps in two important areas.

First, youth across focus groups were found to lack a critical awareness of the current job market. Over 94 percent of the youth in Recife and Salvador responded to questions regarding personal job goals in general terms: "I want a good job". When probed further, there was an absence of discussion of available jobs, corresponding job requirements, industry hiring trends or a profile of others competing for such jobs. While a segment of the youth articulated the importance of ICT to the job market, knowledge of where and how such skills could be leveraged to gain employment was not apparent. Across the sample, young people's understanding of and relationship to the current job market was seen as superficial.

Second, a significant segment of sampled businesses considered youth's workplace behavior and communication skills to be weak. Of the companies interviewed in Salvador and Recife, 45

percent specifically mentioned the need to increase the written and oral skills of youth. One company representative that hires cognitive disabled youth confirms, *“There needed to be more training on professional posture; the youth are trained to work in ICT, but not in attending the public”*. Another that hires Intermediate and Advanced graduates adds, *“Some students are more detached, particularly in relationships with private school students. For this Enter Jovem should better develop aspects of behavior and communication”*. Lastly, a recruiter cited a recent scenario where a full group of 31 Enter Jovem graduates did not pass an oral fluency exam utilized to qualify applicants for telemarketing jobs. Overall, the evaluation revealed that ICT served as the subject of the Enter Jovem workforce skills training program, rather than a complement.

2. Under 10.2 - Increased Access of At-Risk Youth to Formal Market Employment

2.1 The Enter Jovem program has produced a positive impact in increasing Basic Training graduates’ access to and retention in formal market jobs.

In February of 2005, the three-pronged labor market insertion strategy (LMIS) was first executed in the program. Within one quarter, Enter Jovem reported an increase of 308 percent in the number of youth placed into the market. In line with this early finding, the insertion strategy is seen as having an important complementary impact in bridging the employment intentions of Basic Training graduates to formal market employment.

As seen in Table 4, 828 program graduates (32 percent of total graduates) have secured employment in the formal job market as of April-2007. Within this total, a relatively balanced placement ratio exists among males (52 percent) and females (48 percent).¹⁵ The program has also begun to break down cultural barriers by enabling the job placement of cognitively disabled youth with four inserted in Salvador and eight in Recife.

Table 4 Accumulated Job Placement and Insertion

Enter Jovem - City	Job Placement 4/2007	Job Insertion 4/2007
	Total	Total
Salvador	401	266
Recife	177	138
Fortaleza	250	250
TOTAL	828	654

Source: Enter Jovem Quarterly Report April - 2007

As well, 654 of the contracted youth have been retained in their jobs for more than three months. This represents a current insertion ratio of 83 percent. With a placement rate of 32 percent and a retention ratio of 83 percent, the program is surpassing targets for the final two program indicators being tracked and reported under USAID/Brazil’s IR 10.2.

¹⁵ Interestingly, 54 percent of total graduates from the Basic Training are females. However, this sum does not translate across to the job placement ration where females compose 48 percent of total placements.

2.2 The Employability Workshops have positively impacted the interview behaviors and job-searching strategies of a self-selecting population of graduating youth.

Of the FGIs realized with inserted youth, 100 percent attended Employability Workshops. These youth specifically cited the benefit of the workshops: *“The Employability Workshop prepared me for the interview and informed me how to dress appropriately; I owe Enter Jovem for this opportunity”*; *“The Employability Workshops revealed things that I didn’t know and that other courses did not offer.* An identifiable segment of youth that had not yet found jobs also mentioned the job-seeking strategies as a result of the workshops: *“I haven’t gotten a job yet, but I’ve passed on my CV to many places.”*

From 2005 to April 2007, a total of 84 Employability Workshops have been realized. As well, 1,225 resumes have been entered into Enter Jovem’s ‘Opportunity Databanks’ in Recife and Salvador. This figure signifies that 53 percent of the Basic’s total graduates are opting insertion support. In November-2005, Enter Jovem conducted three different assessments with 41 participants to gain insights into workshop impact. It was indicated that before participating, 90 percent of the youth did not regularly submit resumes to businesses. After participating in the workshops, 56 percent reported submitting resumes to over five businesses a month.

Equal to these findings, the evaluation revealed that youth who sought out Employability Workshops after completing the Basic Module demonstrated an orientation to the job market not seen in youth who had not yet participated. This is considered an important impact, particularly in light of the employment challenge presented by the formal markets of these Northeast cities.

Noteworthy here, is that Employability Workshops were delivered as stand-alone trainings outside the context of Basic Training. In Recife, these workshops were delivered within EICs, while Salvador held the trainings at its headquarters in the city-center. Consequently, the evaluation was left with a remaining question around the ability of workshops to promote as well as meet the demand of Basic Training graduates.

2.3 The Labor Market Insertion Strategy has been most successful at bridging employment opportunities in the Formal Market labor category.

As mentioned, the LMIS is obligatorily linked to the labor categories of Apprenticeship, Paid Internships, Formal Employment, Self-Employment and Entrepreneurship. Each category corresponds to a set of legal obligations for hiring and maintaining employees. As Table 5 demonstrates, the three dominant categories under which Enter Jovem youth have been placed are Formal Employment, Paid Internships and Apprenticeships.

Table 5 Total Placement/Insertion by Labor Categories

Labor Category	Job Placement 4/2007			Job Insertion 4/2007		
	Total	M	F	Total	M	F
Apprenticeship ¹⁶	113	50	63	106	47	59
Paid Internship ¹⁷	243	122	121	130	69	61
Formal Employment ¹⁸	426	204	222	396	191	205
Self Employment	44	15	29	21	4	17
Entrepreneurship	2	1	1	1	1	1

Source: Enter Jovem Quarterly Report April – 2007

Currently, 51 percent of total placements and 61 percent of total insertions are occurring under the Formal Employment category. Yet, if labor categories are further disaggregated by state, a slightly different picture appears:

Table 6 Total Placement/Insertion by State

Labor Category	Job Placement 4/2007			Job Insertion 4/2007		
	BA	PE	CE	BA	PE	CE
Apprenticeship	103	9	1	97	8	1
Paid Internship	173	49	21	71	38	21
Formal Employment	97	101	228	87	81	228
Self Employment	27	17	0	10	11	0
Entrepreneurship	1	1	0	1	0	0

Source: Enter Jovem Quarterly Report April – 2007

To varying degrees, Fortaleza (CE) and Recife (PE) are most often placing and inserting youth in the Formal Employment labor category. However, in Salvador (BA), Paid Internship is the dominant job placement category while Apprenticeship is the dominant insertion category. The evaluation sees this divergence as the result of the employment partnership with Bolsa Moderna. This retailer has hired the majority of its 106 program youth under the Paid Internship category and, at the same time, has seen a high turnover (see Table 7 below).

Noteworthy are the small numbers attached to Self-Employment and Entrepreneurship. On one hand, working within a Self Employment category requires individuals to offer highly specialized services, as the market is at once restricted and competitive. On the other, the highly regulated nature of registering new businesses in Brazil presents numerous barriers to achieving official Entrepreneurship. Consequently, these two categories yielded few placement or retention opportunities for Enter Jovem youth.

¹⁶ Apprenticeship (Adolescente Aprendiz) enables 14-24 year-olds enrolled in qualified technical-professional education programs to be hired for a determined period of time up to two years. The Apprenticeship category is attractive to companies, as they do not have to pay fees and benefits associated with formal employment.

¹⁷ Paid Internship (Estagio) is for the hiring of students currently attending high school and at least 16 years of age. Companies hiring interns also forego all fees and benefits associated with formal employment.

¹⁸ Formal Employment (Carteira Assinada) requires youth, typically 17 and older, to be hired and reported as official employees of the business and thus entitled to all rights under the labor law.

2.4 The Enter Jovem program has positively impacted entry-level employment for youth across a wide range of companies in the retail trade, restaurant and service industries.

Throughout the interviews, youth gave diverse examples of how the program impacted their ability to obtain jobs in the formal market: “Youth are working in Bolsa Moderna and Contax because of Enter Jovem”; “I went to work in a clothing store, Riachuelo Lojas, folding clothes”; “For the last eight months, I have been interning with the Secretary of Agriculture.”

As of the April-2007, a total of 249 companies, predominantly in the retail trade, restaurant and service¹⁹ industries, have contracted program youth. Table 7, demonstrates the companies hiring the highest number of Enter Jovem graduates.

Table 7 Leading Companies Employing Enter Jovem Youth

	Top Five Companies Employing EJ Youth	Industry	Youth Contracted			Inserted 3+ months	Dominant Position of Youth
			Total	M	F		
Salvador	1. Bolsa Moderna	Retail (Shoes)	106	44	62	44%	Salesperson
	2. Banco de Brasil	Service (Banking)	8	4	4	88%	Administrative assistant
	3. McDonalds	Restaurant	6	0	6	70%	Food Attendant
	4. Walmart	Retail	6	4	2	100%	Bag packagers
	5. Atento	Service (Client Service)	5	3	2	100%	Telemarketer
Recife	1. McDonalds	Restaurant	21	3	18	67%	Food attendant
	2. Lojas Insinuante	Retail (Furniture)	7	6	1	86%	Porter
	3. Walmart	Retail	6	5	1	100%	Bag packagers
	4. Regional Tribunal	Service (Government)	2	1	1	100%	Administrative assistant
	5. Fundação G. Freire	Service (NGO)	2	2	0	100%	Administrative assistant

Source: Enter Jovem Insertion Data - Salvador and Recife, April 2007.

The retail sales and restaurant industries have absorbed the highest number of graduates per company. Companies in these industries are most often hiring youth as entry-level sales representatives, fast food (lanchonete) attendants, cashiers and bag packagers. Noteworthy, is that the two leading employers, Bolsa Moderna in Salvador and McDonalds in Recife, are predominantly contracting females. Also, and as mentioned above, it is important to observe that Bolsa Moderna possesses a high-level of turnover with a 44 percent insertion rate.

After these two leading employers, the volume of employees per company significantly drops and levels out. This employment trend demonstrates that a wide range of companies in the service industry is employing a controlled number of program youth. Within this industry, Enter Jovem graduates are typically securing positions as administrative assistants, receptionists or ‘office boys’.

¹⁹ The service industry is made up of companies whose business activities provide services for the benefit of the population and/or other industries. Companies that have employed Enter Jovem youth exist within a diversity of sub-industries including banking and finance, hotel and tourism, provision of gas and electricity, transport, communications, and central and local government.

2.5 The Enter Jovem program has had a minimal impact on employment outcomes in the ICT industry, particularly among graduating females.

Enter Jovem was not seen as positioning itself as an ICT qualification program. Nonetheless, the ICT emphasis and packaging of trainings (Basic, Intermediate, Advanced) were considered as enabling corresponding technical employment expectations among youth – particularly as they advance in courses. A female youth that completed Intermediate states, “*I had the expectation I would work, but not as a cashier*”. A representative that recruits Basic Training graduates explains, “*The majority of students come here with a strong desire to enter the ICT market; I think the focus should be broader than ICT.*” A program staff member mentions, “*From the beginning to the end of the program, the youth believe it is an ICT course. Afterward they think they will work in this area and when they don’t achieve this, they become unmotivated.*”

Equal to Basic, Intermediate and Advanced courses provide students opportunities to expand technical knowledge. As of April-2007, 546 youth have completed Intermediate (348 in Network and 198 in Web design) and 198 finished the Advanced Training. This being the case, the majority of youth graduating from Intermediate Training continue to obtain non-technical jobs in the restaurant, retail and service industries. In the case of Advanced Training graduates, labor market prospects in the corresponding audio/visual sub-industry are bleak and freelancing appears to be the dominant employment option. Table 8 shows ICT-oriented companies employing the highest number of Enter Jovem youth.

Table 8 ICT-based Companies Employing Enter Jovem Youth

Top ICT Companies Employing EJ Youth		Youth Contracted			Inserted 3+ months	Dominant Position of Youth
		Total	M	F		
Salvador	1. Falcudade de São Salvador	6	6	0	67%	ICT Support
	2. Liceu de Artes de Bahia	1	1	0	100%	ICT Support
	3. FML Informatica	1	1	0	100%	Administrative Assistant
	4. EQS Technology	1	1	0	100%	ICT Support
	5. Logitech	1	0	1	100%	Administrative Assistant
Recife	1. TCI Informatica	3	1	2	100%	Administrative Assistant
	2. Instala Tecnologia ²⁰	2	1	1	100%	ICT Support / Administrative Assistant
	3. Consultech	1	1	0	100%	ICT Support
	4. Lanlink	1	0	1	100%	Administrative Assistant
	5. Global do Brasil	8	5	3	--	ICT event-specific support

Source: Enter Jovem insertion data & interviews with companies, April 2007.

According to Enter Jovem insertion data, four percent of youth graduating in at least Basic Training are working in ICT technical positions in Salvador and Recife. The evaluation found that although females are graduating from higher levels of training, their insertion numbers are not reflected in the few technical positions occupied by Enter Jovem youth (see Annex F, 4). Of those youth working within the ICT industry, males tend to occupy technical support jobs, while females occupy administrative positions.

As it stands, the evaluation sees the Enter Jovem training program as unable to qualify its youth for jobs in the highly competitive and dynamic ICT industry. More realistically, the program is

²⁰ These were numbers provided to the evaluation directly from the company and confirmed by an Enter Jovem youth on-site (see Data Quality Assessment, pp. 20 for further discussion).

providing a technical foundation and starting point for youth to seek further qualification. Accordingly, anecdotal evidence pointed to a significant number of Enter Jovem graduates that have advanced to university programs and technical courses as a result of the program.

2.6 The Small Grants Program has multiplied Enter Jovem’s positive impact upon youth’s skills and employment opportunities.

Over the past three years, the Small Grants Program (SGP) has allocated close to US\$ 280,000 in funds to multiply the impact of the Enter Jovem program. Altogether, the SGP has been able to expand the program’s: (a) geographical reach through partnering with workforce training and insertion programs in Fortaleza; (b) thematic training emphasis in the areas of entrepreneurship, video production and complementary workshops; and (c) support of local NGOs.

The evaluation found that the SGP has significantly bolstered the program’s impact upon youth. Table 9 quantifies the value-added impact of the SGP on youth beneficiaries:

Table 9 Small Grant Program Impact Upon Youth

SGP Area of Focus	Currently Trained	In Training	Total Potential	Highlights of Impact Upon Youth
Entrepreneurship	168	----	168	Bahia Inovação ²¹ awarded four entrepreneurship grants for US\$ 20,000 each. Two small business projects, involving 10 youth, have received funding. The other two, involving five youth, are awaiting funding.
Complementary Workshops	432	333	<u>765</u>	While completion of Portuguese and Math and Workplace Behavior courses is seen as low, opportunity for youth to strengthen basic education skills is considered a critical component of the Enter Jovem program.
Fortaleza:				
Instituto Aliança	380	288	<u>668</u>	Instituto Aliança and IDER: Enter Jovem has supported the training of over 700 youth. These NGOs have also reported an insertion rate of 53 percent among program youth that have been enrolled in their programs via a rigorous selection process. ²²
IDER	54	----	54	
ALPENDRE	30	----	30	
Advanced Video (Recife & Salvador)	198	53	<u>251</u>	198 youth have currently been trained. While job placement within the audio/visual job market is limited, youth have produced various films, including: (i) <i>Elen 12 Anos</i> that was produced in Salvador and selected as a finalist for

²¹ For more information on the Government of Bahia’s program, ‘Bahia Inovação’ see: <http://www.fapesb.ba.gov.br/apoio/bahia-inovacao/bi> Accessed June 24, 2007.

²² It is important to point out, that these workforce programs differ from Enter Jovem in that their youth participants undergo a rigorous selection process. As well, in the case of Instituto Aliança, apprenticeships are a required part of the trainings. Yet, once training ends, youth’s permanence in the job market is no longer tracked.

SGP Area of Focus	Currently Trained	In Training	Total Potential	Highlights of Impact Upon Youth
NGO Support Bagunçação	30	----	30	UNICEF's 'Voices of Youth'; and (ii) A Recife film, <i>Um Açude, Uma História e um Sonho</i> , that mobilized a local community through coverage by the local media. In addition to providing youth tools to secure employment in specific industries (service, tourism, restaurant), participating in these market-driven trainings on FIB University Center's campus had an important impact on the self-esteem of the participating youth.

Source: Enter Jovem Quarterly Report April-2007

Cumulatively, the SGP has augmented Enter Jovem's positive impact through enabling additional: (a) workforce trainings to 1,966 youth; (b) job market placement of 280 youth; and (c) industry-specific training of 30 NGO-based youth within FIB University Center.

B. EFFICACY OF METHODOLOGIES FOR SUSTAINABILITY AND REPLICABILITY

There was unanimity across the evaluation as beneficiaries and stakeholders alike expressed the need to continue the Enter Jovem program. Largely, the evaluation found that Enter Jovem activities have enabled a high likelihood of institutional sustainability and replicability among local executing agencies. It was further found that while financial sustainability is yet to be achieved, multiple partnership alliance strategies and actions demonstrate solid potential.

- ✓ **The Enter Jovem program has produced a high-level of institutional sustainability and potential for replication among local executing agencies.**

AIR, as the principal contracting agency, has designed and executed Enter Jovem in manner that has empowered its subcontracting partners and local executing agencies to sustain and replicate workforce development interventions. In particular, CDI and IBRAD have significantly expanded their organizational capacity and technical know-how. Consequently, there is high likelihood that interventions and matching benefits of the Enter Jovem program can be sustained through their institutional missions:

- **CDI:** Workforce development trainings, as supported by Enter Jovem, are highly likely to continue through CDI. Before this program, CDI was focusing uniquely on promoting digital inclusion among marginalized youth. Participation in the program bridged this programmatic emphasis to workforce development. Over the life span of Enter Jovem, CDI has created three ICT workforce training modules and corresponding course materials. In addition, a train the trainer program has been developed to enable educators to deliver the courses. Finally, the execution of Enter Jovem's training component utilized the community driven model of EICs.

Each of these factors heightens the institutional sustainability and potential replication of Enter Jovem interventions. Evidence of this can be seen in current CDI activities: (i) the integration of a workforce insertion component into CDI's pedagogical plan; (ii) the crafting of a specific workforce development model in partnership with the management consulting / ICT firm Accenture; and (iii) an active search for partnerships to support the Enter Jovem model within the EICs.

- **CBOs (EICs):** Within CDI's EIC-based model, the evaluation sees CBOs as possessing the appropriate level of knowledge and ability to continue promoting workforce development trainings. EICs, housed in over 25 CBOs and NGOs, were key agents in the Enter Jovem program. As a result, their organizational capacity was enhanced through: (i) administering Basic and Intermediate trainings; (ii) overseeing monitoring and evaluation procedures; (iii) drafting monthly performance reports; and (iv) managing program educators who were trained by CDI. Thus, over the four years, youth workforce development has become an important reality for these organizations and the communities that surround them.

During the evaluation, CBOs expressed a strong intention to continue promoting youth workforce development. Accordingly, and within CDI's community-based model, CBOs have the support and ability to do so. At the same time, the evaluation revealed a number of factors that could limit the effectiveness of replicating Enter Jovem's ICT workforce interventions: (a) employment partnerships – the majority of EICs do not possess experience or contacts to bridge youth employment opportunities to the private sector; (b) technical infrastructure – the majority of EICs are unable to perform maintenance on hardware and troubleshoot internet connectivity problems; and (c) finances – particularly the smaller CBOs cited both a lack of current resources and ability to mobilize funds.

- **IBRAD:** There is a high likelihood that workforce insertion interventions and associated benefits will be sustained by IBRAD. The Enter Jovem program has provided IBRAD the opportunity to expand its programmatic portfolio to youth workforce insertion. Specifically, capacity was built through the design and execution of the following interventions: coordinating and delivering Employability Workshops, mobilizing private sector employment partnerships, working directly with youth and policy advocacy.

Currently, IBRAD is moving to replicate workforce development interventions in partnership with two state governments: (a) Rio Grande do Norte - a contract has recently signed to deliver a youth workforce training to augment capacity and insertion for the retail sales industry; and, (b) Recife - IBRAD is participating as a committee member in the construction of the *Recife Youth Plan*.

- ✓ **Enter Jovem has successfully leveraged resources through strategic partnerships, which demonstrates potential toward financial sustainability.**

Although at-present the Enter Jovem program is not financially sustainable, it has leveraged significant resources through a range of partnerships that demonstrate potential. As seen below

in Table 10, over four years, Enter Jovem has mobilized 27 partnerships which have yielded close to US \$ 1.4 million. Of this total, 46 percent are exclusively in-kind, 18 percent are cash contributions and 36 percent are a combination of both.

Table 10 Enter Jovem Leveraged Resources

	Company / Organization	Resource	Amount	Type
Sub Agreement-Cost share*	Bagunção	Cash & In-kind	\$17,600	Sub-Agreement
	CDI	Cash & In-kind	\$660,400	Sub-Agreement
	CIEE	Cash & In-kind	\$7,300	Sub-Agreement
	Fund. Gilberto Freire	Cash & In-kind	\$6,100	Sub-Agreement
	IBCM	Cash & In-kind	\$3,600	Sub-Agreement
	IBRAD	Cash & In-kind	\$1,900	Sub-Agreement
	IDER	Cash & In-kind	\$87,500	Sub-Agreement
	Instituto Aliança	Cash & In-kind	\$141,400	Sub-Agreement (IDB – match to UNIBANCO below)
	Santa Luzia	Cash & In-kind	\$3,700	Sub-Agreement
	YABT	Cash & In-kind	\$3,100	Sub-Agreement
Leveraged Contribution of Partnerships	Anixter	In-kind	\$15,000	Technical training, promotion
	Bahia Inovação	Cash	\$72,700	Entrepreneurship awards - four projects
	CONDER Bahia State Government**	In-kind	\$71,500	25 years land/building contract awarded to Santa Luzia.
		In-kind	\$71,500	25 years land/building contract awarded to Bagunção.
	EQS Technology	In-kind	\$300	Technical training
	Faculdade 2 de Julho	In-kind	\$5,700	A/V training
	FIB - University	In-kind	\$2,600	Design and delivery of market driven trainings
	Fund. Gilberto Freire	In-kind	\$3,800	A/V Training
	Japan Embassy**	Cash	\$85,000	Infrastructure grant awarded to Bagunção
	Jornal A Tarde	In-kind	\$14,300	Newspapers, training, promotional space, internships
	Logic Engenharia	In-kind	\$6,000	Technical training
	Microsoft	In-kind	\$17,000	ICT – software licensing
	Phillips Electronics	Cash	\$14,100	ICT – connectivity for EICs
	PRODEB	In-kind	\$3,600	Copying, printing
	SEBRAE - PE	In-kind	\$300	Technical training
	UNIBANCO Institute	Cash	\$69,700	Funding of Instituto Alianza program in Fortaleza
	World Bank	In-kind	\$5,000	ICT- access to video conferencing
	Cash	\$3,000	Prize awarded to Santa Luzia	
TOTAL			1,393,700	

* Enter Jovem only reports the cost-share of sub-grantees to USAID as these funds are documented in contracts and supported by grantee reports.

**These resources have been leveraged as a result of institutional strengthening and benefit CBOs that are directly involved with Enter Jovem's workforce development program

Source: Enter Jovem, June-2007

Through alliance building, Enter Jovem has been able to deepen and broaden interventions. Noteworthy, are the recent partnerships with: (a) UNIBANCO Institute that has provided financing to extend programming in Fortaleza for an additional year; and (b) FIB – Central University that has delivered over 30 market-driven trainings to Enter Jovem youth over the last two years.

Finally, in 2006 Enter Jovem mobilized a viable development alliance and submitted a proposal, “Bridging the Market and Educational Gaps” (BMEG), to USAID’s Global Development Alliance program. Due to other donor priorities at that time, the proposal was not able to secure funding. Nonetheless, the proposed alliance successfully mobilized 13 private and public sector

organizations seeking to build on the program experience and bridge disadvantaged youth to specific job market needs. In sum, the evaluation sees Enter Jovem's leveraging activities as a major program strength. Thus, important groundwork has been laid to guide future efforts toward financial sustainability.

✓ **The Enter Jovem workforce model has generated solid potential for scale-oriented replication within public and private sectors.**

Unlike previous workforce models in Brazil, Enter Jovem is an open-access program that is able to impact a large number of disadvantaged youth. The program has been able to achieve such an impact by leveraging a network of CBOs to reach and train youth. Decentralized in nature, the model has empowered key stakeholders in the community to themselves execute the program.

The evaluation sees this model as adaptable and scalable within the public and private sectors. In fact, the program has been able to establish partnerships in each of these sectors that both demonstrates potential and lays foundations for scale-oriented program replication:

- **Public Sector:** Two ongoing efforts demonstrate Enter Jovem's potential to be replicated and expanded within the public sector. First, the program was able to integrate its efforts and innovation into a public secondary school (2,000 enrolled students) in Recife. As of June 2006, this EIC, entitled, 'Cidadania.com', has been training students in Basic and Intermediate Trainings. The school director is behind the initiative and is currently in dialogue with the Secretary of Education to secure continuation of the program. Second, during the execution of this evaluation, Enter Jovem was negotiating the continuation and expansion of the program with the state Governments of Pernambuco (Recife) and Ceará (Maracanaú).
- **Private Sector Organizations:** Over the four years of execution, Enter Jovem has attracted the interest and investment of private sector organizations such as UNIBANCO Institute, FIB University Center and the 13 organizations in the BMEG proposal for USAID's Global Development Alliance. Clearly, the private sector sees the value of this ICT-based workforce model as it can be easily replicated and scaled-up to meet the specific industry needs. As companies within the market place a high value upon ICT skills, the program is seen as possessing significant potential to be further integrated into the private sector.

C. DATA QUALITY ASSESSMENT

The evaluation was charged with a data quality analysis for the three Enter Jovem indicators under IR 10.1 and 10.2. The following section will be broken down into two parts. The first section will highlight prominent data quality issues while the second will specifically assess the three Enter Jovem performance indicators linked to USAID/Brazil SO 10 IRs.

1. Prominent Data Quality Issues

- ✓ **The overarching threat to Enter Jovem data is that there is no single data collection system that unifies efforts and information among executing agencies.**

From the outset, a data collection plan and system were not figured into Enter Jovem's design. As a result, a process has evolved whereby each stakeholder is collecting data in a manner that coincides with their resources and technical capacity. The current data collection process is multi-tiered with iterative reporting requirements and M&E procedures. The following provides an overview of the roles and capacities of key stakeholders from the ground up:

- **EICs:** At the foundation, EICs are responsible for collecting student registration data and sending to AIR. As well, they coordinate delivery of Basic and Intermediate courses and monitor attendance, products and conclusion – all of which is reported to CDI monthly. These responsibilities fall upon EIC coordinators and volunteer educators. Data collection capacity and infrastructure varied across the 12 EICs visited. Here, various methods are being employed to capture and store data that range from physical files to Word or Excel. The majority of EICs that store data electronically are not backing it up, although some are using email or CDs.
- **Local Executing Agencies:** At the mid level, CDI and IBRAD are tasked with collecting, verifying and transmitting all training and insertion data to AIR. CDI pays bi-monthly visits to EICs to collect and verify training data. IBRAD is responsible for capturing the resumes of youth attending Employability Workshops and tracking job placements and insertions. Both submit data to AIR on a monthly basis. Data is primarily collected and stored in Excel and Word. Database uniformity and collection procedures vary between satellite offices as do back-up procedures and infrastructure.
- **AIR:** At the top tier, the responsibility for reporting corresponding SO 10 data to USAID/Brazil rests with AIR. AIR has a dedicated staff member for validation, input and analysis of data received from local executing agencies. A recently hired M&E program assistant also conducts verification of training data and proctors pre/post tests. While the majority of data are stored in Excel spreadsheets, as of January-2007, AIR developed a web-based system through Survey Monkey that allows EICs to input registration information of incoming students.²³ The database manager backs up specific data every 15 days on CD-ROMs.

Based on this current system, the assessment pointed to four key data weaknesses: (i) EICs, at the origin of the process, do not have adequately remunerated personnel, sufficient training or appropriate ICT infrastructure to produce reliable data; (ii) Excel, as the primary data storage program at the mid and top tiers, is unable to effectively capture, manage and share the volume of information produced by training and insertion activities; (iii) databases established by each pair of local executing agencies in Salvador and Recife are not uniform; and (iv) data is flowing one-way from the ground up. Essentially, the present system is unable to fluidly and effectively capture, validate, analyze and share data. While Enter Jovem is diligently working to ensure data reliability, it is taking considerable effort to do so.

²³ At present this system is being field-tested in Salvador and as of April-2007, five of the 14 EICs are utilizing the Survey Monkey system.

✓ **The diligent validation of data produced by Salvador and Recife training activities is leaving information from other key areas of the program vulnerable to threats.**

Across the life of the program, there has been a number of internally identified reliability and accuracy issues corresponding to CDI's training data. Accordingly, Enter Jovem has put a system in place to more rigorously verify Basic Training enrollment, attendance and conclusion. As a result, the assessment considers current training data to possess a higher level of reliability as dedicated staff are crosschecking information at each tier. Nevertheless, this is taking an effort that is leaving data from other areas open to potential threats – particularly: (a) insertion data as reported by Fortaleza partnering agencies; and (b) insertion data as reported by IBRAD.

In regards to this last point, a rapid assessment was conducted on IBRAD's insertion databases in Salvador and Recife. The review of Salvador's database produced one issue around the critical field 'Form', which groups placed/inserted youth into one of the five labor categories. Under this field, there exist three additional titles outside the labor categories: 'Informal', 'Volunteer' and 'Temporary'. Enter Jovem cited that these categories are utilized to track youth that become involved in such work. However, these data have been tracked over a limited range of time within 2006 and have yielded 21 entries. Consequently, the assessment sees the consistency of this effort as incomplete and its utility as limited.

The assessment of Recife's database generated two issues. First, inconsistencies were found in the accuracy of information as it corresponds to placed and/or inserted youth. Five youth that are listed as contracted with Instala Tecnologia were contacted to verify positions within the firm.²⁴ Of the five, three are listed as "Consultant Trainers", one as an "IT Technician" and one as a "Telemarketing Operator". The following was found: one confirmed employment as an ICT technician with Instala Tecnologia, two confirmed employment as operators in telemarketing companies affiliated with the firm, one attended a week-long telemarketing training but was never employed, and the final youth was not able to be reached. Thus, in this small sample, the data possessed a lack of accuracy in terms of contracting companies, placement status and job functions.

The second issue found in Recife's database was recurring entries. Here, six names of contracted youth were recorded more than one time as they secured different jobs (Name box: 57, 58; 69,70; 94,95; 108,109; 133,134,135; and, 170,171). Beyond these six names, no other youth were tracked as they changed jobs. While the assessment did not find that these youth were counted more than once in final placement/insertion numbers, it does see the consistency of this practice as incomplete and its utility as limited.

A final issue, evident in both IBRAD databases, concerns the matching accuracy of the total number of placed youth. Here, the total number of youth found on each insertion database did not match corresponding aggregate numbers as reported in the last quarterly report: (a) Salvador's insertion database possesses 355 names compared to a reported total of 401 placed youth; (b) Recife's database contains 173 names versus a reported total of 177 placed youth.

²⁴ During fieldwork, number of contracted youth articulated by Instala Tecnologia did not match numbers in Recife database (name box: 55,57,87,116,171). Thus, youth were contacted by phone and one was interviewed on-site.

Each of the listed issues does not demonstrate quantitatively extensive divergences. However, they do point to weaknesses in the design of databases and accuracy of data. Although the program has worked hard to promote organizational accountability in terms of reliable and valid data, the assessment demonstrates the need for more uniformity in design and a balanced validation approach.

✓ **Enter Jovem’s established baseline does not allow for measurement of program performance as targeted by the three major program results.**

Between years one and two, Enter Jovem established a baseline that was gleaned from its ‘Student Individual Form’. The program requires each enrolling student to fill out this form consisting of 42 questions that seek to capture: demographic characteristics, schooling level, family income and work history. CDI is responsible for collecting forms from EICs and inputting and storing information. Once entered into CDI’s databases, AIR consolidates, validates and analyzes the information.²⁵

In 2005, a partial analysis of the Student Individual Forms was performed. As there were differences in data collection systems between CDI’s satellite offices, the baseline analysis yielded a limited set of demographic information of 531 enrolled students in Salvador and 1,201 students in Recife. While the established information was used for early management and strategy purposes, it does not serve as appropriate reference points against which program progress can be compared. That is, the baseline does not allow for performance measurement as targeted in major program results: increase in marketable skills and access to formal market.

A number of challenges were also seen within the Student Individual Form tool and corresponding baseline analysis: (i) differences in data collection systems between CDI Recife and Bahia limited a full analysis of original baseline; (ii) current student form does not elicit baseline information that can be used to measure changes according to major program outputs or outcomes²⁶; (iii) EICs typically do not require a minimal form of evidence that confirms age, contact information or education status of enrolling youth; and (iv) until 2007, data input for student forms was performed manually and to a large extent continues as such.

²⁵ In year two, internal data reliability checks on CDI-Bahia & Recife turned up various issues. In Bahia, problems were identified around accuracy of student enrollment forms as well as duplication of enrolled youth. In Recife, a number of enrolled youth were found to be above the age limit. Adjustments were made to all USAID reported data.

²⁶ The Student Individual Form was originally designed by CDI for its ‘Digital Inclusion’ training. Principally, it seeks to gather key demographic information and verify that enrolling students meet program requirements. While this is seen as important, further consideration should be given to eliciting information that can be used to measure change as targeted by major program results. For example, the form can also be designed to seek: (a) previous experience with ICT hardware and software; (b) self-evaluation of current marketable skills (hard and soft); (c) previous formal job-searching knowledge and experience (including current possession of resume); and/or (d) knowledge of current formal market opportunities, trends or requirements and corresponding student interests.

2. Indicator Data Quality Assessment

Strategic Objective 10: Access to Training and Employability Skills and Opportunities for Disadvantaged Youth

IR 10.1: Increased Marketable Skills Training for At-Risk Youth

Indicator 1: Number of youth that successfully complete marketable skills training program.

Description: Number of youth who can operate systems/programs taught based on assessment by EIC/CDI staff and with demonstrated proficiency in subject area over total of youth participating in Program.

Data Collection Method: Established in 2005, pre/post-tests are conducted with a random sample of students to measure change in learning. 10 percent of course participants are tested in 10 EICs: five in Salvador; five in Recife

Data Quality Issues

Date of Initial Data Quality Assessment: April-May 2007

Known Data Limitations and Significance if any: A comprehensive test evaluation was not performed; however, the face validity of tests call into question their ability to provide reliable measures of student achievement based on the following issues:

- **Testing to Objectives:** The absence of training course objectives poses a threat to the reliability of tests in evaluating youth. Within lesson plans of a number of Enter Jovem trainings, there was a lack of measurable course objectives.²⁷ While Enter Jovem undertook a process to draw out key themes across courses and build them into tests, a test design specifically driven by learning objectives did not occur. This has produced tests that range in length and items. Consequently, the evaluation was left with questions regarding the ability of these instruments to adequately measure student's change in learning.
- **Subjective Items:** The subjective items on various pre/post tests leave the process vulnerable to biases.²⁸ On one hand, these items introduce a number of biases that can affect a student's ability to communicate the correct information, including level of writing skills and experience translating thoughts to written words. On the other, there is a threat of scoring biases whereby an evaluator can rate the same answer differently over time. While AIR has a SPSS-based scoring system that codifies and groups key words in essays, the evaluation was nonetheless left with questions regarding the compatibility of subjective test items to measure successful learning for this cadre of youth.
- **Measurement Reliability:** There is a threat that pre/post tests are not in-synch with the following courses: (i) Math & Portuguese delivered by CIEE in Recife and Santa Luzia in Salvador; (ii) Behavioral delivered by CIEE in Recife and IBCM in Salvador; and (iii) Advanced training delivered by Video Educarte in Salvador and Fundação Gilberto Freire in Recife. Under each course, two NGOs have designed non-uniform trainings that correspond to the subject. However, the diversity of content and training pedagogy as realized by the different NGOs, threatens the ability of one test to accurately measure learning outcomes. Consequently, the pre/post test related to these three trainings is seen to possess low levels of reliability.

Suggested Actions Taken or Planned to Address Data Limitations

If Enter Jovem continues utilizing tests to measure learning, it is recommended that a reconfiguration of instruments take place in a manner that avoids the pitfalls listed above. This will also require a redesign of training courses with specific focus upon articulating a series of measurable course objectives. Finally, consideration may be given to integrating the performance-based products into the testing process.²⁹

²⁷ These courses include Basic, Intermediate, Advanced and Portuguese and Math.

²⁸ Enter Jovem tests are composed of objective and subjective items. The objective items include multiple-choice, true/false and matching, while subjective items include short-answer essay, written definitions and problem solving.

²⁹ In order for successful performance testing to occur, two key components must exist: (a) clear and measurable standards that guide evaluation; and (b) training for educators/evaluators to ensure fairness in scoring.

Strategic Objective 10: Access to Training and Employability Skills and Opportunities for Disadvantaged Youth

IR 10.2: Increased Access of At-Risk Youth to Formal Market Employment

Indicator 2: Increase percentage of youth placed into the job market.

Description: Youth placed into the job market, according to federal government categories of insertion, within any economic sector. The program goal is to place 20 percent of youth trained in Basic Training into the job market.

Data Collection Method: Monitoring, through sampling, of Enter Jovem training graduates.

Data Quality Issues

Date of Initial Data Quality Assessment: April-May 2007

Known Data Limitations and Significance if any: Based on the dynamic nature of tracking a high number of graduating youth in the job market, Enter Jovem is utilizing a sampling approach to capture youth securing jobs through the Autonomous Job-search mechanism. However, the assessment sees this collection method as sub-optimal to producing data that possess the level of quantitative accuracy necessary for this indicator. Specifically, the assessment sees this method as limiting the identification of higher numbers of placements and insertions that most likely exist among Enter Jovem youth who search and secure jobs via the Autonomous strategy.

Suggested Actions Taken or Planned to Address Data Limitations

For those graduates opting to find jobs through the Autonomous mechanism, there is the need for a system that fluidly tracks them across the program (enrollment to insertion). Once graduated, this instrument would allow for precise follow-up to verify employment status for youth that do not opt to utilize the Guided and Institutional job-search mechanisms. As well, it is recommended that one staff position be created to specifically perform M&E to verify job placement and insertion data. This person could also serve to more consistently reinforce relationship between the program and private sector. If hiring staff is not an option, then it is recommended that AIR's M&E assistant allocate a percentage of time to this area. A complementary option would be to further decentralize the monitoring process and empower training institutions to more accurately track the employment of their graduated youth.

Strategic Objective 10: Access to Training and Employability Skills and Opportunities for Disadvantaged Youth

IR 10.2: Increased Access of At-Risk Youth to Formal Market Employment

Indicator 3: Increased percentage of youth inserted into the job market retained in the job after a three-month period.

Description: Youth placed into the job market, according to federal government categories of insertion, who after a three-month period or more are still at the same working place or in a better job compared to the total of youth inserted into the job market by the Program.

Data Collection Method: Monitoring, through sampling, by the insertion coordinator contacting companies hiring the youth and, in self-employment situations, contacting a sample of youth that have started their own businesses.

Data Quality Issues

Date of Initial Data Quality Assessment: April-May 2007

Known Data Limitations and Significance if any: The assessment identified two issues for this indicator. First, there is no quantitative target for Indicator 3. Second, there is an identical weakness in the sampling measurement approach that exists in IR 10.2, Indicator 2.

Suggested Actions Taken or Planned to Address Data Limitations

In regards to issue:

(1) Revise indicator to include a numerical percentage of youth inserted in market. Thus, the indicator could read: "50 percent of youth placed in the job market will retain their jobs for more than a three month period".

(2) Above recommended actions for 10.2, Indicator 2 equally apply to this indicator.

VI. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. PROGRAM SUCCESSES

Over the past four years, Enter Jovem has achieved a number of favorable quantitative and qualitative impacts upon its youth beneficiary population as well as numerous other partners and stakeholders involved. Key successes and achievements include:

- Positively impacting a diversity of disadvantaged young people (males, females and youth with cognitive disabilities) through workforce training and insertion interventions.
- Delivering a successful workforce development capacity building program that transferred basic ICT work-related skills to over 4,000 youth graduates.
- Designing and initiating an insertion mechanism that, at once, promotes job search skills and successfully connects youth to formal sector employment opportunities.
- Establishing the Youth Committees in Recife and Salvador that accompany program decision-making, provide evaluative input and serve as a promotional voice for program interventions and achievements.
- Bridging formal market employment opportunities to over 800 graduating youth in the Basic Training course.
- Producing a significant by-product in the training and professional development of volunteer educators – many of whom are youth that have secured formal employment as a result.
- Mobilizing diverse development alliances and utilizing a small grants mechanism to magnify the scope and breadth of training and insertion activities for youth.
- Transferring a high level of sustainability among local implementing agencies that are currently integrating workforce development frameworks into their institutional policies and programs.
- Practicing diligence in monitoring and evaluation, which has improved the rigor and quality of training courses and heightened the reliability of corresponding data.
- Overcoming early organizational and programmatic challenges by initiating a redesign process that substantiated program methodology and reinforced a grant mechanism to overcome programmatic gaps.
- Re-designing program indicators along output and outcome-oriented lines and conducting pre/post testing to measure changes in learning.

B. PROGRAM CHALLENGES

Various issues presented challenges to the Enter Jovem program including the program design, organizational fragmentation and the technical capacity of partners as summarized below:

- Initial program design was broad and missing elements that could have allowed for more rapid success. Gaps were seen in the following areas: (a) unrealistic target population of 83,619; (b) unbalanced budget allocation via each IR (10.1: 65% and 10.2: 35%); (c) numerous and non-prioritized performance indicators; (d) absence of specific monitoring and evaluation plan and matching MIS; and (e) absence of a specific plan to establish a baseline.
- At the outset, local partners lacked organizational capacity and experience in workforce development programming. This prolonged start-up and, in the case of training, necessitated numerous add-on courses to reinforce the core module.
- Fragmentation among implementing agencies existed across the life of the program. Consequently, it has been executed in a compartmentalized manner that limited information and opportunities. The evaluation saw this as the key limiter to achieving a superior positive impact -- which the program's potential clearly allowed.
- Fragmentation also prevented a deeper understanding of Enter Jovem among youth beneficiaries, as a significant number were unclear about program goals, strategy and/or organizational makeup.
- ICT technical elements were overemphasized and the Basic Training was unable to adequately transfer other key workforce related competencies such as communication and relative basic education skills.
- A variety of training courses (from Complementary to Employability Workshops) were delivered in a stand-alone manner that limited participation and impact.
- The insertion component was seen as requiring further staffing resources and strategic innovation to reach its true potential.
- Partnerships with businesses were underdeveloped and based on a supply and demand model. As a result, companies' understanding of the Enter Jovem program was underdeveloped.
- Data system has operated in a fragmented manner and validation processes are unbalanced.
- High turnover of volunteer educators, vested with delivering Basic and Intermediate Training courses, was prevalent throughout the program.

C. RECOMENDATIONS

1. Youth Beneficiary Recommendations

Across 29 focus groups, youth placed a high value on the workforce training and insertion opportunities that Enter Jovem has provided. All strongly expressed the need for its continuation, particularly in this region of Brazil. At the same time, youth identified a number of areas to further improve and expand the program's positive impact (see Annex F, 5). Those recommendations occurring most frequently were:

- Deepen the ICT technical emphasis of training courses;
- Increase insertion opportunities through more vacancies;
- Improve ICT technical infrastructure (hardware and software);
- Improve the training focus on employability skills;
- Improve physical infrastructure of EICs;
- Improve Training and qualification of educators;
- Increase the hours of course training;
- Offer more courses (market specific and languages);
- Better promote the Enter Jovem program.

Unsurprisingly, youth recommendations parallel those put forward by program coordinators (Annex F, 6) and implementing agencies (Annex F, 7).

2. Summative Recommendations

As expected from this effort, the evaluation developed a series of recommendations to provide guidance for the implementation of potential follow-on activities. In addition to building on the successes and challenges of the program, these recommendations complement a number of Enter Jovem actions, already in motion, that aim to enhance current interventions:

- **Follow-on Strategy:** Develop a follow-on strategy for a period of at-least two years, which articulates any new programmatic emphasis, partnerships, workforce strategy or objectives.
- **Exit Strategy:** Craft an exit strategy that is based on the follow-on. Of importance here is the dissemination of key program lessons and innovations to partners. Equally, a mechanism should be considered to strategically address expectations for future assistance among key beneficiaries and stakeholders: youth, CBOs (EICs), communities and business partners.
- **Training and Insertion:** Create a synergistic relationship between all training and insertion activities. This includes empowering training delivery actors to develop private sector networks, mobilize partnerships and conduct and monitor insertion activities. It also entails the design and management of a student tracking system and corresponding database (ideally web-based) that fluidly monitors youth from registration to insertion.

- **Measuring Outcomes:** Look to reinforce the current measuring system around the three major program indicators. As mentioned, both the pre/post tests and the Student Individual Form are seen as solid tools and practices. Yet, there is a need to strengthen both. In the case of the Student Individual Form, questions should be oriented to elicit information that can serve to provide a point of reference to measure against major program indicators. In regards to pre/post tests, a redesign process should occur that avoids pitfalls discussed in the data quality analysis (see IR 10.1). Finally, consideration may be given to participative evaluation methods such as pre/post self-evaluations (skills inventories) to enable students to participate in measuring change in their own knowledge or skills as a result of training or securing employment.
- **Workforce Training (Basic):** Streamline the various workforce development courses into one comprehensive training program. The basic training curriculum should strive to balance important ICT aspects with other key employability competencies and fundamental education skills. This includes providing a space for youth to become critically aware of current realities and requirements of the market. Prioritization of content will be key as the training program should adequately respond to the significant and diverse gaps in basic education and communication skills that many youth bring to the program. In this sense, the recommendation of youth above is echoed, as more training hours (with more experiential-based learning opportunities) should be seriously considered.
- **Intermediate and Advanced Training:** At present, these courses do not appear to be enabling youth to better compete for formal market opportunities in matching technical fields. Here, two options are seen as viable: (i) discontinue the courses; or (ii) redesign courses in partnership with specific companies in corresponding industries that respond to specific needs.
- **Partnerships with Public Schools:** Build on the program's successful partnership and strategically expand to additional public high schools. Here it is crucial that Enter Jovem obtain buy-in at the school, community and local government levels. Once achieved, consider developing age-appropriate workforce development curricula and corresponding insertion strategies.
- **Partnerships with Universities (community college model):** Expand and open the model established with FIB-Central University. In the workforce development field, community colleges are becoming effective partners in enabling youth to receive technical training and reinforce (or continue) their academic skills. Market driven curricula and flexible hours make this model attractive. Enter Jovem has laid important groundwork with FIB Central University that has designed and delivered over 30 job-specific courses since 2006. The challenge in scaling-up will be to ensure that the program is accessible to the academic, socio-economic and geographic needs and realities of targeted youth.
- **Partnerships with Businesses:** Consider a strategic approach to leveraging partnerships with businesses. An industry cluster strategy is an example where employment linkages can be mobilized around: complementary businesses, geography or the supply-chain. At the same time, look to a mutual gains paradigm to replace Enter Jovem's supply and demand

model. Ideally, this will enable direct links between training's subject discipline and the specific workplace or industry. The objectives of such efforts should be to: (a) promote more volume of insertion per company; and (b) heighten the sustainability and replicability of workforce interventions impacting disadvantaged youth within the business. The evaluation revealed that significant opportunities exist to deepen existing partnerships with the private sector to a point where businesses become program stakeholders in addition to employers of Enter Jovem youth.

- **Partnerships with the Public Sector:** It is key that Enter Jovem program become qualified as a “Professional Technical Training” agency, which enables direct insertion of graduating youth as ‘Apprentices’. Currently Enter Jovem is seeking qualification from the Municipal Council for the Rights of Children and Adolescents. Yet, beyond this, it is recommended that appropriate and creative partnerships be established within the ‘S’ system of technical professional institutes.³⁰ As these institutes offer a multiplicity of certifications and content areas, there are numerous strategic options as to what such a partnership could look like within a youth workforce development paradigm.
- **Entrepreneurship:** Deepen the entrepreneurship-training model as a specific track for disadvantaged youth. Enter Jovem has taken positive steps with YABT and SEBRAE in shaping such a training. However, if the program aims to increase the number of youth as Entrepreneurs in the official labor category, the training model should address numerous areas, including: (a) multi-disciplinary content (strategic risk taking behavior, communication skills, financial, accounting and planning skills and business management); (b) use and sources of credit; (c) micro-business incubation; (d) technical assessment and follow-up; and (e) professional mentorship linkages. Cooperative-oriented entrepreneurship models should be promoted to enable groups of youth to establish viable micro-businesses versus the sole-proprietor model. Also, youth entrepreneurs need support to navigate the highly regulated nature of registering businesses. Lastly, policy advocacy must accompany this model and promote youth-friendly policies toward establishing and maintaining a small business.
- **Female Youth:** Enter Jovem must now move beyond ensuring equal training and placement opportunities for females. Gender gaps in technical employment opportunities can also be addressed within workforce programs that emphasize ICT, renewable energy or other technical areas. Here, female youth who are technically trained should be able to secure technical positions in the formal workplace. Education, social marketing and policy advocacy are examples of efforts that can lay the necessary groundwork to better ensure the qualitative employment of females.
- **Youth Participation:** Continue to creatively facilitate the direct participation of youth into all decision-making aspects of the program. The Youth Committee is seen as an excellent model; however, there is room for deeper participation, innovation and integration within Enter Jovem's work.

³⁰ There are five public sector technical professional entities that make up this system: SENAI; SENAR; SENAT; and SESCOOP.

D. CONCLUSION

Since inception, Enter Jovem has made a significant contribution to raising awareness around the importance of youth workforce development within communities, businesses, local NGOs and, most importantly, the youth themselves. Similarly, the program has produced successful and innovative training and insertion methods. As a result, youth have significantly enhanced their ability to search for, obtain and retain jobs in the formal job market.

Currently, Enter Jovem is on-track to meet and surpass the three major program targets reported to USAID under SO 10. This is particularly notable considering the program's modus operandi: bridging first employment opportunities for disadvantaged youth in cities possessing the highest unemployment rates in Brazil. Within this context, the program has blazed a trail for open access workforce insertion programs targeting these youth.

Finally, while the program has responded to challenges by shifting strategy and mobilizing new partnerships, its resulting positive impact upon youth has been undeniable. With appropriate programmatic streamlining and the leveraging of further development partnerships, the evaluation sees the Enter Jovem program as poised to ramp-up its positive impact upon youth.

ANNEXES

ANNEX A

LIST OF DOCUMENTS REVIEWED

USAID/Brazil Selected Documents

“C.A. No. 512-A-00-03-00032-00 Access to Training and Employability Skills and Opportunities Increased for Disadvantaged Youth”, Award Letter, Schedule, Program Description and Standard Provisions, USAID/Bolivia, September 30, 2003.

“Data Sheet, Planned FY 2006 Obligation and Proposed FY 2007 Obligation”, USAID/Brazil.

“Performance Management Plan SO 10: Economic Alternatives and TIP Services Expanded to Vulnerable Groups”, USAID/Brazil, January 2006.

“Performance Management Plan SO 05: Improved ability of at-risk and working children and youth to become productive, healthy citizens”, USAID/Brazil, 2003.

“RFA 512-03-004, Access to Training and Employability Skills and Opportunities Increased for Disadvantaged Youth”, USAID/Brazil, March 10, 2003.

“USAID/Brazil Annual Report FY 03”, USAID/Brazil, March 13, 2003.

“USAID/Brazil Annual Report FY 04”, USAID/Brazil, June 15, 2004.

“USAID/Brazil Annual Report FY 05”, USAID/Brazil, June 16, 2005.

Enter Jovem Selected Documents

“CDI Subaward (GRT 02025) Cooperative Agreement”, AIR, September 30, 2003.

“CDI Modification of Subaward (GRT 02025) Cooperative Agreement”, AIR, January 6, 2006.

“Enter Jovem Project Plan – Resubmission to USAID/Brazil”, November 2004.

“Enter Jovem Orientation Guide for the Application of the Small Grants Program, Attachment #1”, November 2004.

“Enter Jovem Performance Plan to USAID/Brazil, Attachment #2”, November 2004.

“Enter Jovem Clarification – Request for Clarification to USAID/Brazil”, December 2004.

“Enter Jovem Quarterly Progress Report,” Quarters 1-14, Oct.2003 – March 2007.

“Enter Jovem News Bulletins” No.: 4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11, 13,19, Aug 2005- March 2007.

“Enter Jovem Logical Framework”, Updated April 30, 2007.

“Enter Jovem Modulo Basico Lesson Plan”, 2007.

“Enter Jovem Modulo Avançado” 2007.

“Enter Jovem Training Data - CDI” Salvador and Recife, Final March-2007.

“Enter Jovem Insertion Data - IBRAD” Salvador and Recife, Received March-2007.

“Enter Jovem Trimestral Technical Report CDI”, March 2007.

“Enter Jovem Kit: Informações Essenciais sobre o Programa”.

“Enter Jovem Pre/Post Tests”, Basic, Behavioral, Complementary, Network, Entrepreneurship, Video, Web.

“Folha De Performance 2007 CDI – Bahia” January 3, 2007.

“Folha De Performance 2007 CDI – Recife”, March 31, 2007.

“Folha De Performance 2007 IBRAD”, April-2007.

Brazil Selected Documents -

Presidência da República, “Lei da Aprendizagem, LEI Nº 10.097, DE 19 DE DEZEMBRO DE 2000.”

Presidência da República Casa Civil Subchefia para Assuntos Jurídicos, “DECRETO Nº 5.598, DE 1º DE DEZEMBRO DE 2005, (Regulamenta a contratação de aprendizes e dá outras providências)”.

Presidência da República Subchefia para Assuntos Jurídicos, “Lei do Estágio DECRETO No 87.497, DE 18 DE AGOSTO DE 1982 (Regulamenta a Lei nº 6.494, de 07 de dezembro de 1977, que dispõe sobre o estágio de estudantes de estabelecimentos de ensino superior e de 2º grau regular e supletivo, nos limites que especifica e dá outras providências)”

Pochmann, Marcio, “Situação do jovem no mercado de trabalho no Brasil: um balanço dos últimos 10 anos” Centro de Estudos Sindicais e de Economia do Trabalho da Universidade Estadual de Campinas, São Paulo, fevereiro 2007.

ANNEX B

KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEWS

Salvador

Jennifer Adams, Diretora de USAID/Brasil
Idelson Moura de Almeida, Diretor Financeiro, Primeiro de Maio
Tanya Andrade, Directora, Programa Enter Jovem
Eriko Fernando Cobe de Andrade, Chefe Divisão Setor de Informatica, Faculdade São Salvador
Alejandro Arber, Chefe Financeiro, Programa Enter Jovem
Kleber Bernardes, Diretor, CDI-BA
Luciano Cason, Presidente, CESEP
Nelson Cerqueira, Reitor, FIB – Centro Universitários
Daniel Cruz, Trainee Recrutamento & Seleção, Esmaltec
Paulo Cezar de Costa Cerqueira, Director, Ilê Ayê
Ana Carolina Dalcum, Assistente, Programa Enter Jovem
Lorena Dávalos, Program Associate, Enter Jovem
Alfredo Dorea, Coordenador Projetos, Adolescente Aprendiz
Agneya Ferraz, Coordenadora de Curso de Captacão de Video, Instituto Video Educarte
Elon Garrido, Coordenador, Adolescente Aprendiz
Gabriela Goulart, Assessora do Programa de Jovens em Situação de Risco, USAID
Rita Lelis, Gerente, SIMM
Sheila Fabiane Lena, Coordenadora, APAE
Thianne Sa Leony, Coordenadora de Atendimento, Hotel Pastana
Nena Letini, USAID/Mozambique, Prévio CTO USAID/Brasil
Edméa Dourado Nunes Lopes, Insertion Coordinator, Programa Enter Jovem
Gorgivaldo Santa Lopes, Diretor Financeiro, CESEP
Jerri Vilson de O. Magalhães, Presidente, Primeiro de Maio
Silvane Greese Maia, Chefe de Setor Recursos Humanos, Bahiaturisa
Ana Cláudia Moreno, Coordenadora, FIB – Centro Universitários
Tiago Leonardo Alves Muniz, Instrutor de Informatica, Santa Luzia – Palmares
Felix Muniz, Gerente Executivo, YABT
Licia Penna, Assistente Desenvolvimento Organizacional, Hotel Pastana
Sandro Pinto, Socio, Bolsa Moderna
Maria de Lourdes da Conceicao Nascimento, Coordenadora Geral, Santa Luzia – Palmares
Gilson do Nascimento Rocha, Tecnico de Informatica, Faculdade São Salvador
Jusciney Santana, Coordenadora Pedagógica, CDI
Maria Alzira Coelho Santos, Coordenadora de Oficinas, Primeiro de Maio
Margarida Oliveira dos Santos, Secretaria, Primeiro de Maio
Joanice Nascimento Santos, Auxilario de Administrativo, Bahiaturisa
Mariza Soares, Coordenadora de Inserção, Program Enter Jovem
Rogerio Nascimento Sousa Santos, Coordenadora, Ilê Ayê
Jeferson Santos Souza, Coordenador Administrativo, McDonalds – Salvador
Moises Nascimento Trindade, Instrutor de Informatica, Santa Luzia – Palmares

Recife

Maria da Conceição Pinto de Araújo, Diretora, Escola Cidadania
Ana Lucia Barbosa, Gerente Comercial, Instala Tecnologia
Rogério Brito Batista, Coordenador do Projecto, Esperança
Maria Paula Jacome de Brito, Dona, Busccar Consultoria
Josélia Caldas, Coordenadora, Programa Enter Jovem
Marcia Costa, Gerente Geral., Global do Brasil
Luiz Renato Isensee Costa, Gerente Recursos Humanos, Bahiatursa
Edmilson Fernandes, Presidente, Pheonix
Marcos Antonio Falcso Pereiro Filho, Assistente Administrativo III, Grupo In – Lojas Insinuante
Ana Cláudia Ferreira - Project Coordinator, Programa Enter Jovem
Vivian Edyane Souza de Franca, Coordenadora, Cultura Digital
Ana Patrícia Gomes, Gerente Departamento Treinamento e Acompanhamento, CIEE
Marcos Antonio Honorato, Comissão Eleitoral, Esperança
Karla Lavrador, Coordenadora Pedagógica, Program Enter Jovem
Fernanda Lopes, Pedagógica, CIEE
Amanda Macêdo, Coordenadora, Pheonix
Cleide Moraes, Coordenadora de Inserção, IBRAD
Adalgiza Francisca Sales, Presidente, Esperança
Evandro Fernandes de Santana, Coordenador Administrativo, Grupo In – Lojas Insinuante
Thiago Silva de Santana, Educador, Escola Cidadania
Abel Francisco dos Santos, Comissão Eleitoral, Esperança
Rodrigo Pereira dos Santos, Assistente Administrativo III, Grupo In – Lojas Insinuante
Marcos Anderson da Silva, Coordenador, Escola Cidadania
Amadeu Ferreira da Silva, Membro, Esperança
Jonas Soares - Insertion Assistant, Programa Enter Jovem
Maria Suyamny Gonveia da Silva, Coordenadora, APABB
Paulo Izídio da Silva, Membro, Esperança
Alexandra Spineli, Assistente Social, CIEE
Estefânia Vasconcelos, Manager, Human Resources, McDonalds – Recife

Fortaleza

Jorgdieter Anhalt, Director, IDER
Milton Aragão, Diretor, Top Company RH
Natasha Bastos, Psicólogo, Top Company RH
Deyla Ellery, Coordenadora Pedagógica, Com.Dominio Digital
Terezinha de Fatima da S. Berns, Coordenadora de Confeção, Karsten Nordeste
Regina Brandão, Coordenadora Pedagógica, Com.Dominio Digital
Luis Massilon Filho, Coordenador, IDER
Claudio Joventino, Assessor de Articulação Institucional, Prefeitura de Maracanaú
Maria Jose de Anrade Lima, Coordenadora Inserção, Com.Dominio Digital
Cristina Monte Luz, Coordenadora de Inovação e Projetos, Prefeitura de Maracanaú

ANNEX C

YOUTH VOLUNTEER TEAM EVALUATION REPORTS

1. Salvador, BA

Ms. Rute Borges: ruteborgesdj@hotmail.com

Ms. Gabriella Maia: gabriella-maia@hotmail.com

I. CONTEXTO PARA JOVENS NA BAHIA

A. Perspectiva de educação sócio-econômica

Os jovens na Bahia, assim como em todo Brasil, não tem acesso a uma educação de qualidade e que vivem em situação de pobreza e miséria, na qual muitos não podem estudar ou abandonam os estudos para contribuir com a renda da família. Faltam políticas públicas que garantam o direito dos jovens à educação, saúde, segurança, moradia e trabalho, ou seja, aos direitos básicos de qualquer cidadão brasileiro.

B. Contexto / realidade de emprego dos jovens

Atualmente, as vagas de trabalho exigem experiência. Por não ter experiência, o jovem não consegue o primeiro emprego. Se não conquista o emprego, não pode adquirir experiência. Esse círculo vicioso dificulta o acesso da população jovem ao mercado de trabalho. Na região Metropolitana de Salvador, 42,8% da população com idade entre 16 e 24 anos está desempregada. Entre os mais pobres, este índice alcança 67,1%. “A Bahia é o estado brasileiro com a maior defasagem na inserção do jovem no mercado de trabalho. As mulheres são menos inseridas no mercado de trabalho baiano”.

C. Lei do primeiro emprego

No Brasil às oportunidades de trabalho para jovens dá-se através do estágio, do programa menor aprendiz ou até mesmo contratação com carteira assinada. A Lei do primeiro emprego estabelece diretrizes para as atividades laborais de jovens na faixa de 14 a 21 anos. Nela estão definidos os requisitos para o trabalho de jovens nessa faixa-etária, como os trabalhos proibidos, os limites de carga horária de trabalho, dentre outros.

II. METODOLOGIA DO ESTUDO – AVALIAÇÃO

A. Organização de Base Comunitária (OBC)

O Programa Enter Jovem atua nas comunidades por intermédio dos OBCs. Além de oferecer cursos e serviços à comunidade eles abrigam as EIC's (Escola de Informática e Cidadania), nas quais o programa é desenvolvido. As ONG's alcançadas pelo programa estão localizadas em

bairros periféricos e atendem às pessoas de baixa renda e baixo nível de escolaridade e conseqüentemente, baixo grau de empregabilidade.

B. Ferramentas

Os dados foram coletados nos principais atores dos projetos, os quais são as EIC's, as agências implementadoras, o setor público e o setor privado. Para isto foram utilizadas ferramentas, como Entrevistas Pessoais, Grupos focais e preenchimento de formulários.

C. Participação das assessoras técnicas

As assessoras técnicas tiveram papel fundamental na captação de dados dos grupos focais e das entrevistas realizadas. Além de realizar o controle dos documentos gerados durante a avaliação. Após um determinado período de observação, o consultor delegou às assessoras técnicas a responsabilidade de conduzir os grupos focais.

D. Resumo geral

A avaliação do programa deu-se nas EIC's através de entrevistas com a direção, dois grupos focais (um masculino e outro feminino) e preenchimento de formulários pelos participantes dos grupos focais. Nos setores público e privado foram utilizados entrevistas e preenchimento de formulários. Nas agências implementadoras houve entrevistas em cada uma e apenas um grupo focal envolvendo representantes de todas.

III. ANÁLISES

A. Programa Enter Jovem

Este programa desenvolve ações em duas áreas: capacitação e treinamento para a juventude e busca de parcerias que favoreçam seu ingresso no mercado produtivo.

B. Treinamento

No processo de avaliação foram identificados algumas fortalezas e desafios do processo de treinamento, os quais são:

Fortalezas

- Igual oportunidade para ambos os sexos;
- Foco no público carente;
- Nível de capacitação dos educadores;
- Conteúdo holístico (cidadania, comportamental, holístico);
- Permite desenvolvimento pessoal dos educandos (ex.: alunos perdem timidez através das oficinas);

Desafios

- Alta rotatividade dos educadores;

- Manutenção dos cursos e máquinas com a escassez de recursos financeiros;
- Atender a demanda existente com poucas EIC's e poucas vagas disponíveis;
- Captar alunos com foco de serem inseridos;

Os educandos, dentro do processo de capacitação também encontram desafios para entrar e concluir o curso, são eles:

- Falta de recursos financeiros para transporte;
- Conhecimento da existência do curso;
- Captação do conteúdo, devido à defasagem do ensino público;
- Falta de local onde possam treinar os conhecimentos adquiridos no curso;
- Necessidade de obtenção imediata de um emprego.

C. Inserção

No processo de avaliação foram identificados algumas fortalezas e desafios do processo de inserção, os quais são:

Fortalezas

- O propósito da inserção;
- O acompanhamento dentro das organizações (quando há);
- Despertar no jovem o interesse de alcançar o seu lugar no mercado de trabalho;
- Existência de mais de um método de busca de vagas.

Desafios

- Mercado restrito para jovens;
- Comodismo dos jovens em relação ao mercado de trabalho;
- Acompanhamento dos contratados e inseridos;
- Conhecimento do programa por parte do setor privado.

D. Coleta de dados

O programa foi avaliado através de dados qualitativos e quantitativos. Os mesmos foram obtidos junto aos jovens e agências implementadoras, respectivamente.

E. Processo de coleta

Os dados coletados quanto à evolução do programa, foram obtidos junto às agências implementadoras (CDI, IBRAD, AIR) e verificado com as EIC's. Os dados coletados são através da ficha Marco Zero, os relatórios mensais, a Folha de Performance, os produtos e os pré e pós-testes. As fichas Marco Zero são enviadas das EIC's para o Enter jovem. Já os produtos e relatórios mensais são enviados para o CDI que revisam e consolidam, respectivamente, e encaminham para o Enter Jovem.

F. Resultados

Pôde ser verificado que os procedimentos que possibilitam a integração dos dados entre EIC's CDI e Enter Jovem funcionam de forma débil. Algumas etapas do atual processo vem sendo duplicadas, como a verificação de dados. Isto ocorre devido à complexidade e dispersão do fluxo de informações entre CDI, EJ e EIC's. A manipulação dos dados é dificultada pelos seguintes motivos:

- Pouco treinamento para as pessoas responsáveis pela elaboração dos relatórios nas EIC's;
- Baixa frequência na verificação da validade dos dados enviados das EIC's para o CDI;
- Muitos dados encontram-se em meio físico, o que dificulta um backup, tornando o sistema mais suscetível à perda de dados. Isto também causa uma defasagem temporal, devido ao tempo necessário para processar as informações do meio físico para o digital.

V. PERGUNTAS CHAVES

A. Impacto de Enter Jovem na população beneficiária

Dentro das comunidades que o programa atinge houve impactos pontuais. Nestes quatro anos, o programa trouxe algumas mudanças nas comunidades e na cultura dos CBO's onde atua. Mais importante, o programa alcançou muitos jovens, os quais representam um número significativo dentro das comunidades onde o programa atua. Para estes jovens além do conhecimento adquirido os mesmos obtiveram desenvolvimento pessoal, uma consciência cidadã, noções de postura profissional e conseqüentemente, aumento do seu grau de empregabilidade. O curso atinge a personalidade do jovem no que diz respeito a relacionamentos. O convívio com os colegas e a atenção dos professores foi levantado como fator importante para os alunos que possuem carência afetiva. As Oficinas de Empregabilidade tiveram um papel crucial no desenvolvimento dos alunos com timidez excessiva.

Apesar de alguns jovens concluírem o curso e não serem inseridos, eles passam a ter perspectivas em relação ao futuro. Muitos descobrem afinidades com a área, alguns passam a buscar um emprego, outros pensam em abrir seu próprio negócio e outros almejam entrar em uma universidade.

B. Eficácia relativa para a expansão e sustentabilidade do projeto

As principais evidências da sustentabilidade do projeto são os 3000 jovens que passaram pelo programa, adquirindo conhecimentos que vão levar por toda a sua vida. Entretanto, identificou-se que o projeto poderia ter ampliado o foco na sua sustentabilidade. A limitação deste foco pode ser identificada através dos seguintes aspectos:

- As parcerias existentes para a inserção com o setor privado não foram consolidadas;
- Caso o projeto seja encerrado o programa não teria condições (físicas, humanas, financeiras e tecnológicas) de ter continuidade, apesar de muitas EIC's desejarem fazê-lo.
- As Oficinas de Empregabilidade ficaram concentradas no Enter Jovem, impossibilitando as EIC's de reproduzi-las;

- As EIC's não possuíam contato direto com as empresas, somente por intermédio do EJ, o que dificulta o acompanhamento do jovem por parte da EIC e futuras inserções caso o programa não tenha continuidade;
- Os processos ainda não estavam totalmente absorvidos pelos vários integrantes do programa.
- Apesar destes fatores, hoje a sistemática do programa já faz parte da cultura das organizações envolvidas no EJ, o que permitiria que o programa fosse reproduzido, ou continuado, de forma prática e descomplicada.

VI. RECOMENDAÇÕES

As recomendações propostas concentram-se em grandes grupos, os quais são: Estrutura Organizacional, Estrutura dos cursos e Marketing. A seguir, as recomendações por ordem de prioridade:

- Expandir conhecimento do programa no setor privado;
- Estabelecer parcerias sólidas com o setor privado e consolidar as existentes;
- Aumentar a frequência das visitas às empresas, de modo que o jovem tenha contato com o mercado e o auxilie na escolha de determinada profissão;
- Estabelecer parcerias com os órgãos que emitem contratos de estágio;
- Criar cursos para o módulo II e III contextualizados com a demanda do mercado, possibilitando o ingresso dos jovens no mercado de trabalho (formal) na área do curso;
- Maior integração do EJ com a comunidade onde estão situadas as EIC's;
- Seleção na matrícula a fim de captar os jovens com desejo de trabalhar, respeitando a igualdade dos sexos;
- Incluir nas oficinas comportamentais diversas estratégias para a busca espontânea;
- Incluir nas oficinas o tema Profissionalismo, uma vez que, foi identificado que jovens não se mantêm no emprego devido ao “mal-costume”;
- Oferecer oficinas com temas que aprofundem o conhecimento dos cursos oferecidos, aumentando a empregabilidade dos jovens. Ex.: Oficinas de Design para os cursos de Webdesign;
- Expandir as vagas para as oficinas de empregabilidade;
- Maior acompanhamento do processo de inserção;
- Remuneração do educador, a fim de eliminar a rotatividade dos mesmos nas EIC's;
- Eliminar cursos que não permitam empregos formais. Ex.: Áudio e Vídeo;
- Conceitos como o da conclusão obrigatória, para a inserção devem ser revistos;

PERCEPÇÕES

Durante o processo de avaliação foram observados alguns aspectos importantes, como:

Processo de Capacitação

- O programa não alcança só jovens que não sabem utilizar determinados softwares, mas principalmente àqueles que nunca tiveram contato algum com o computador;
- Os jovens especiais deram maior valor aos programas que permitem a comunicação com as demais pessoas, como Internet, MSN, Chat;
- Alguns alunos desconhecem que o programa tem o foco de inserção.

Processo de Inserção

- Muitos alunos estão motivados a alcançar seu emprego pela busca espontânea;
- O acompanhamento do jovem na empresa, dá a mesma uma sensação de segurança, por saber que o jovem tem o suporte de uma organização e ao jovem, que sente que possui um apoio;
- Muitos jovens empregados pelo programa trabalham no setor administrativo;
- Os jovens de diversas EIC's desconhecem a figura do coordenador de inserção;
- Varias empresas parceiras desconhecem o programa e o seu propósito;
- Os dados referentes a inseridos e contratados são inconsistentes

2. Recife, PE

Ms. Ana Luiza Gonçalves Ferreira: analuzaferreira@hotmail.com

Ms. Ana Célia Arcanjo dos Santos: anaceliarcanjo@hotmail.com

I. CONTEXTO DOS JOVENS NO ESTADO DE PERNAMBUCO

Recife é uma das capitais de estados mais desiguais, situada em um dos países mais desiguais do mundo. Mais da metade da população (50,95%) sobrevivem abaixo da linha da pobreza, com menos de US\$ 2,00 (R\$ 4,00) por dia. Os índices são do Mapa da Fome, elaborado pela Fundação Getulio Vargas (FGV).

20% da população privilegiada do Recife concentra 72,58% da renda, quase três quartos de toda a riqueza do Recife estão nas mãos de menos de 300 mil pessoas. O restante da população, mais de 1,1 milhão de pessoas, devem apenas um quarto da renda.

O **Programa Primeiro Emprego** do Governo Federal é para os jovens entre 16 e 24 anos, já que se torna muito difícil conseguir um emprego quando não se tem nenhuma vivência anterior. Esse programa visa a estimular as empresas a contratarem esses jovens, para que possam adquirir a tão cobiçada experiência. Para cada vaga criada, a empresa recebe um incentivo financeiro do Estado no valor mínimo de um salário mínimo ou do piso da categoria limitado ao teto de dois salários mínimos durante seis meses ou podendo optar em receber de três a seis parcelas em caso de atividade relacionadas a festas comemorativas ou fatores climáticos, ou seja, atividades sazonais.

O **Contrato de Trabalho do Menor Aprendiz** é um contrato especial, ajustado por escrito e por prazo determinado, em que o empregador se compromete a assegurar ao maior de quatorze e menor de dezoito anos, inscrito em programa de aprendizagem, formação técnico-profissional metódica, as tarefas necessárias que contribuam com a sua formação. O contrato deve especificar a atividade em que o adolescente está se capacitando, o curso a que pertence, a jornada diária, a jornada semanal, a remuneração mensal, a data de início e a data de término do contrato. Atenção: O prazo máximo permitido para este tipo de contrato é de dois anos. Além disso, a empresa também se compromete a:

- Registrar na Carteira de Trabalho e Previdência Social (CTPS) do aprendiz, anotando na parte de "anotações gerais" o contrato especial de trabalho de aprendiz;
- Garantir todos os direitos trabalhistas e previdenciários do trabalhador aprendiz, incluindo a cobertura contra acidentes de trabalho;
- Garantir que as férias do trabalhador aprendiz coincidam com um dos períodos das férias escolares do ensino regular, sendo vedado o parcelamento das mesmas.

Somente estudantes podem ser contratados como estagiários. O estagiário deve ser maior de 16 anos, e deve estar regularmente matriculado em uma instituição de ensino. Caso ocorra o abandono ou o trancamento do curso, o aluno deixa de ter direito ao estágio. O estágio não tem nenhum vínculo empregatício com a empresa, portanto não implica em encargos trabalhistas, não dá direito a 13º salário, nem a férias, abono ou qualquer outro tipo de benefício trabalhista.

II. METODOLOGIA DA AVALIAÇÃO

A. ONGs ENVOLVIDAS

As ONGs responsáveis em Recife por implementar o projeto Enter Jovem e, portanto, objeto de avaliação são: CDI, IBRAD e AIR. Não há filial da AIR em Recife.

O CDI é encarregado do treinamento dos jovens – formulação do conteúdo programático, treinamento de educadores, resultados quantitativos e qualitativos dos cursos.

O IBRAD tem a finalidade de inserir os jovens treinados no mercado de trabalho, através do treinamento de postura profissional para os jovens, além de contato efetivo com empresas, a fim de que essas contratem jovens graduados Enter Jovem.

B. FERRAMENTAS

As ferramentas utilizadas na avaliação foram:

- Grupos focais: perguntas eram feitas a grupos de forma dinâmica, onde todos tiveram liberdade de expressão. Os grupos focais aconteceram com alunos, ex-alunos, educadores, coordenadores, agências implementadoras.
- Entrevistas: perguntas foram feitas a coordenadores, colaboradores das agências que executaram o programa, representantes de empresas que contratam jovens Enter Jovem.
- Formulários: as pessoas que participavam de grupos focais eram convidadas a responder o formulário com perguntas, anonimamente. Os representantes de empresas privadas também foram convidados a responder um formulário específico.

C. RESUMO GERAL

A metodologia utilizada na avaliação foi satisfatória já que todos os envolvidos nas diversas etapas do Enter Jovem foram escutados e analisados: ONGs responsáveis por implementar, alunos, ex-alunos, coordenadores, empregadores dos jovens.

Não ficaram dúvidas ou perguntas não respondidas. A metodologia possibilitou que a avaliação fosse clara, abrangente e contivesse uma visão real e que contempla todos os aspectos relevantes do programa.

D. PARTICIPAÇÃO DA EQUIPE DE VOLUNTÁRIOS

Durante todas as atividades, duas voluntárias, estudantes de administração residentes no local de aplicação do programa Enter Jovem, acompanharam o avaliador. A responsabilidade dessas voluntárias engloba: entenderem o programa – estrutura, objetivos - auxiliar o avaliador no desenvolvimento das atividades, registrarem as percepções, desenvolverem uma análise própria do programa Enter Jovem.

Além de o envolvimento de voluntários ser de grande valia pelos registros em português, percepções iniciais, desenvolvimento de análises, é importante destacar que contribuiu para que

os participantes de dinâmicas de grupo e de entrevistas se sentissem mais à vontade para se expressar, sem intimidação, já que além do avaliador norte-americano, a equipe era composta por jovens, residentes no local, ou seja, com a clara percepção inicial do contexto.

III. ANÁLISES

A. PROGRAMA ENTER JOVEM

1. TREINAMENTO CDI

Fortalezas

- O treinamento consegue despertar nos jovens o interesse pela informática.
- Há um conteúdo programático e a metodologia é seguida de forma que todos os jovens desenvolvem os produtos requeridos até o final do curso.
- O treinamento de educadores é constante.

Desafios

- A informática está em constante mutação. As novidades fazem com que o que seria considerado suficiente em termos de conhecimento rapidamente se torne inferior ao nível desejado. É um desafio garantir que o treinamento esteja sempre repassando aos jovens o conhecimento suficiente para a entrada no mercado de trabalho, principalmente em relação ao nível básico.
- O mercado de trabalho em Recife possui áreas com mais oportunidades e outras em que é mais difícil a inserção. Possivelmente os módulos intermediário e avançado poderiam ser direcionados para áreas em que as oportunidades não são raras.
- É um desafio fazer com que os jovens, nos momentos de aula, foquem no desenvolvimento do aprendizado com vistas ao mercado de trabalho. É comum que jovens utilizem computadores para fins diferentes do aprendizado profissional, o que pode diminuir o conhecimento adquirido.

2. INSERÇÃO IBRAD

Fortalezas

- A oficina de empregabilidade chama a atenção dos jovens para a importância do emprego, além dos meios para ser empregado.
- A ONG está em busca constante de contato com empresas com potencial para empregar jovens.

Desafios

- É um desafio perceber os objetivos profissionais dos jovens e buscar o máximo que eles podem obter. Possivelmente os jovens graduados do programa Enter Jovem são capazes de exercer com êxito atividades que exigem mais envolvimento intelectual do que os cargos atualmente oferecidos, como exemplos dos cargos atualmente oferecidos: atendente de redes de varejo de alimentos ou eletrodomésticos, ou caixa de supermercados, ou carregador de caixas.

- Possivelmente há maneiras para estabelecer contatos estratégicos com potenciais empregadores para os jovens graduados. Ter acesso a mão-de-obra qualificada é de interesse do setor privado, que pode enxergar como grande oportunidade a parceria com o programa Enter Jovem.

B. ANÁLISE DOS DADOS

1. Processos que o CDI e o IBRAD utilizam para coletar dados:

O CDI utiliza ficha de papel para coletar dados dos alunos. O armazenamento dos dados de acompanhamento dos alunos varia entre as diversas EICs. O IBRAD utiliza várias fontes de informação acerca da situação de emprego dos ex-alunos, como contato com as residências desses alunos, relacionamento com alguns ex-alunos que informam sobre outros ex-alunos.

2. Resultados: perspectiva da confiabilidade, validade e acessibilidade dos dados:

Cada agência implementadora tem a própria metodologia de coleta e armazenamento de dados. A necessidade de reportar os dados fez com que cada agência por si própria desenvolvesse um método que considerasse mais conveniente, para tornar os dados confiáveis e acessíveis.

IV. IMPACTO

A. Profundidade e o grau de impacto na população beneficiária?

O Enter Jovem, em números absolutos, conseguiu atender a vários jovens. Houve impacto, já que a maioria desses jovens não sabia absolutamente nada acerca da informática, nem como se ligaria um computador. Os jovens empregados estão em posições como: caixa de supermercados, atendentes de redes varejistas, carregador de caixas, etc.

B. Eficácia relativa das metodologias para sustentabilidade do projeto?

O projeto poderia conter métodos que visassem à sustentabilidade financeira, como metas relacionadas à busca de novas parcerias para tornar o projeto auto-sustentável.

A concretização de sustentabilidade é visto na formação de ex-alunos que são capacitados como educadores de novos alunos, criando um ciclo virtuoso. É importante alertar para o fato de que é positivo alunos se tornarem educadores, mas o trabalho como educador não conta para as metas de empregabilidade do programa, já que o trabalho de educador é voluntário.

V. RECOMENDAÇÕES

É recomendado que o programa Enter Jovem tenha todos os processos necessários para alcançar os seus objetivos formalizados e disponíveis, além de claramente entendidos por todos os agentes responsáveis pela implementação do programa.

A avaliação do desenvolvimento do programa e da evolução em direção aos objetivos deve ser constante, além de que devem ser disponíveis momentos para discussão de idéias entre os diversos agentes.

O conteúdo do módulo básico deve ser construído junto a uma empresa do setor privada com potencial para empregar os jovens, de modo que o treinamento estará de acordo com as necessidades do mercado.

Possivelmente a eficácia na inserção dos jovens aumentaria se fossem contratados profissionais com conhecimento mais profundo do setor privado, além de rede de contatos ampla. Além de que esses atributos deveriam ser utilizados também para alcançar novas parcerias com vistas à sustentabilidade própria do projeto.

3. Fortaleza, Ceará

Ms. Ivna Bessa Siqueira Campos: ivmabessa@gmail.com
Ms. Lucíola Limaverde Ribeiro: lualimaverde@gmail.com

I. CONTEXTO DOS JOVENES NO ESTADO DE CEARÁ

A. PERSEPECTIVA SÓCIO-ECÔNOMICA DE EDUCAÇÃO

A educação no Estado do Ceará ainda é muito deficiente e escola pública ainda é sinônimo de professores pouco qualificados e mal remunerados, baixa aprovação nos vestibulares, baixo índice de aprendizado e alta evasão (abandono escolar).

Alguns números, entretanto, mostram uma possível melhora na educação dos jovens cearenses, mesmo estando longe de alcançar o padrão internacional recomendado pela Unesco. Segundo o Instituto de Pesquisa e Estratégia Econômica do Ceará (IPECE), autarquia vinculada à Secretaria do Planejamento e Coordenação do Estado, em 1997, apenas 65,50% da população cearense com idade acima de cinco anos eram alfabetizados. Já em 2003, este percentual chegou a 75,43%, e, em 2004, a 76,88%.

Alguns índices, entretanto, pioraram. Em 1998, a taxa de reprovação de alunos no Ensino Médio (que antecede à faculdade) era de 5,1%. Em 2004, chegou a 7,9%. A evasão também aumentou, no mesmo período, de 13,6% para 18%.

Para entendermos a situação dos jovens que participam dos programas financiados pelo Enter Jovem no Ceará, é necessário também sabermos que, em 2004, as taxas de escolarização do Ensino Médio em Fortaleza e em Maracanaú ficaram entre as melhores do Estado, colocando-se entre 31,68% e 65,20%. Isso não significa, porém, que as taxas eram satisfatórias.

Ao contrário do que acontece em alguns países desenvolvidos, no Brasil o ensino superior considerado de maior qualidade é o público (invertendo a realidade do Ensino Fundamental e Médio). Analisando o Ensino Superior, podemos ver que a quantidade de Instituições de Ensino Superior (IES) não é um problema. A grande questão é se essas IES podem oferecer um ensino de qualidade.

No Ceará, em 2003, havia 32 IES, sendo apenas 5 públicas. A grande quantidade de IES, lembrando novamente, não significa nem efetividade nem qualidade de ensino. Um dado que comprova isso é a diferença, em 2003, do número de alunos matriculados nas faculdades particulares e o número de concludentes. No ano citado, entraram 15.993 alunos nas IES privadas, mas apenas 408 concluíram a graduação pelas faculdades particulares.

B. CONTEXTO / REALIDADE DE EMPREGO PARA OS JOVENS

Com difícil acesso à educação de qualidade, os jovens cearenses se vêem pouco instruídos e aptos a conseguir boas oportunidades de trabalho e são obrigados a buscar cursos complementares de profissionalização. Há algumas instituições que oferecem cursos

profissionalizantes (apenas técnicos, sem aprofundamento teórico) e outras que montam quadros de vagas disponíveis para esses jovens. São instituições governamentais como o Sine (Sistema Nacional de Emprego) e o Senai (Serviço Nacional de Aprendizagem Industrial), que, infelizmente, ainda não conseguem atingir a grande quantidade de pessoas que buscam trabalho. Uma instituição responsável por boa parte do encaminhamento de jovens para vagas de aprendizado nas empresas, como estágios, é o CIEE, Centro de Integração Empresa-Escola. As três empresas citadas não existem apenas no Ceará, mas em vários locais do país. Há ainda programas que buscam inserir o jovem no mercado de trabalho através de incentivos fiscais e incentivo na qualificação profissional, como o programa Primeiro Emprego, do Governo Federal. Na maioria das vezes, no entanto, projetos como esses servem apenas como paliativos.

Segundo reportagem publicada no Diário do Nordeste, maior jornal cearense, no dia 14 de setembro de 2006, (usando dados do Instituto de Desenvolvimento do Trabalho), no Ceará, dos 300.099 desempregados, 52,3% (o equivalente a 157 mil pessoas) é formado por jovens com idade entre 16 e 24 anos. Dos jovens sem ocupação em Fortaleza, 38.724 são homens e 42.441 são mulheres.

Uma pesquisa realizada pelo Dieese (Departamento Intersindical de Estatística e Estudos Socioeconômicos) mostrou que a taxa de desocupação juvenil é de 50,27%, maior, por exemplo, que a taxa de Salvador, que, segundo a pesquisa, é de 41,4%. O desemprego do jovem reflete um ciclo, ele não consegue emprego porque não tem experiência e tem pouca escolaridade, mas, sem emprego, não pode buscar a experiência desejada nem investir em formação.

Dados do Ipece demonstram que o desemprego é proporcional ao baixo grau de instrução e mostram que o mercado de trabalho informal (sem carteira assinada e sem garantia dos direitos trabalhistas) ainda é muito grande.

II. METODOLOGIA DO ESTUDO - AVALIAÇÃO

A. ONG's AVALIADAS

Para esta análise foram visitadas duas ONGs. O Ider (Instituto de Desenvolvimento Sustentável e Energias Renováveis) está localizado em Fortaleza e desenvolve um trabalho ligado às energias renováveis. A visita a essa instituição aconteceu no dia 30 de abril de 2007. O Com.Domínio Digital fica no município de Maracanaú (localidade notadamente industrial) e segue uma linha voltada para a informática. A visita a essa instituição aconteceu no dia 1º de maio de 2007.

B. FERRAMENTAS

Utilizamos ao total 3 grupos focais no processo de avaliação do Enter Jovem. Em uma das ONGs formamos duas equipes, uma masculina e outra feminina, com 4 participantes em cada. Na outra, foi formado um único grupo misto, com 6 participantes. Fizemos entrevistas com as direções das ONGs e com o setor privado. Entretanto, os formulários destinados a este último público acabaram não sendo aplicados, já que eles não tinham conhecimento do que fosse o programa Enter Jovem. Outro aspecto a ser observado é que a própria instituição escolhia os jovens

participantes do grupo focal. Devemos considerar também o pouco tempo disponível para a avaliação, que realizamos em apenas dois dias.

C. RESUMO GERAL

Um dos motivos que levou ao citado desconhecimento sobre o que fosse Enter Jovem era o de que o programa não tinha um grande desenvolvimento na cidade de Fortaleza. O programa foi inserido como complemento – ou mesmo como financiador – em cursos que já existiam antes e já tinham sua própria metodologia.

D. PARTICIPAÇÃO DA EQUIPE DE VOLUNTÁRIAS

Nós, Ivna Bessa e Lucíola Limaverde, participamos de todo o processo de avaliação do Enter Jovem no Ceará. Ajudamos na realização de entrevistas com os coordenadores dos projetos e com o setor privado, além de ajudar na mediação dos grupos focais. As anotações detalhadas de todas as atividades realizadas foram encaminhadas para que servissem de embasamento para a avaliação. Este relatório segue o mesmo propósito. Nossa participação como voluntárias aconteceu porque somos pessoas do próprio local em que o programa a ser analisada aconteceu. O fato de sermos jovens também nos leva a ter uma melhor noção da realidade em que o público do Enter Jovem está inserido.

III. ANÁLISE

A. IDER E INSTITUTO ALIANZA (ENTER JOVEM)

1. TREINAMENTO

- **Fortalezas** – É notável o desenvolvimento da auto-estima dos jovens. Segundo os entrevistados do setor privado, é impressionante o modo como os jovens se apresentam, como sabem se portar em entrevistas de emprego e na apresentação pessoal. Apesar de não ser o foco do Enter Jovem, os cursos realizados em Fortaleza tiveram como maior resultado positivo exatamente o desenvolvimento humano, segundo relato dos próprios jovens atendidos pelo programa. Os jovens foram capacitados como pessoas e cidadãos, recebendo informações que iam desde construção de um currículo a noções de empreendedorismo.
- **Desafios** – Muitas vezes o que acontece é que as matérias desenvolvidas nos cursos não condizem com a realidade do mercado de trabalho. Nos grupos focais eles se mostraram um tanto decepcionados com essa realidade, já que estudavam no curso informática ou energias renováveis, e nem sempre conseguiam trabalhar nessas áreas. Os jovens acabam indo trabalhar em áreas como telemarketing ou atendimento em lojas de varejo. Outros problemas, apontados pelos próprios jovens, diz respeito à carga horária deficiente em alguns módulos e a pouca possibilidade de praticar o que foi ensinado/aprendido. Podemos citar também como problemas a o fato de os cursos atenderem um público pequeno em relação à demanda de jovens que precisam de programas como esses. Outro aspecto seria a restrição de infraestrutura, como salas de aulas, computadores e bibliotecas.

2. INSERÇÃO

- **Fortalezas** – O próprio fato de a maioria dos jovens conseguir emprego é um ponto positivo, mesmo que não seja nas áreas previstas. Sem o curso, provavelmente eles não conseguiriam espaço algum no mercado de trabalho, que cada vez exige mais capacitação. O curso, se não foca diretamente nas necessidades e demandas do mercado de trabalho, ao menos serve como um adicional ao currículo dos jovens, que conseguem, mesmo que de forma tímida, uma oportunidade de se mostrarem capazes. Além disso, o curso fomenta nos alunos a vontade de seguir com sua carreira profissional, fazendo outros cursos e se preparando cada vez melhor.
- **Desafios** – Embora tenha sido dito que há um acompanhamento aos jovens inseridos no mercado, esse processo nos pareceu pouco sistemático. A informação vai de encontro aos dados coletados no setor privado. Não parece haver um controle fiel do que de fato ocorre a estes jovens. Além disso, conforme já foi dito anteriormente, as áreas para as quais os jovens acabam indo não são as que eles mesmos considerariam ideais. Há também um problema em relação às mulheres, que não costumam conseguir os mesmos empregos que os homens. Na área de energias renováveis, por exemplo, elas quase não conseguem espaço, o que causa visível frustração. Na maioria das vezes o que lhes sobra é a área de telemarketing. Foi nesse ponto que os jovens mais se mostraram frustrados. Eles se preparam teoricamente, mas, quando terminam o curso, se vêem sem oportunidades efetivas de emprego nas áreas em que foram treinados.

IV. RECOMENDAÇÕES

Primeiramente é necessário pontuar que, apesar dos aspectos negativos encontrados, houve resultados positivos. Podemos enumerar como efeitos do curso a elevação da auto-estima dos jovens, o fato de eles aprenderem a se portar em situações do mercado de trabalho e a conquista de uma visão mais crítica do mundo. Muitos deles adquirem estímulo para continuar os estudos, fazem outros cursos ou mesmo estudam para o vestibular (concurso para ingresso na universidade). De um modo geral e tendo por base os dados fornecidos, pode-se afirmar também que os jovens conseguem emprego, o que lhes serve de experiência profissional.

Para que o curso atinja seu objetivo primordial – inserir jovens no mercado de trabalho – são necessárias algumas ações que nos ficaram bastante claras. Uma delas seria um maior acompanhamento por parte do programa Enter Jovem aos cursos dos quais ele é parceiro. No caso do Ceará, especificamente, os cursos não seguiam uma metodologia proveniente do Enter Jovem, mas sim uma própria já estabelecida anteriormente. As ONG's, por sua vez, poderiam articular uma melhor estruturação do vínculo com o setor privado, visando a facilitar a inserção do jovem ao mercado de trabalho.

Outro ponto a ser aprimorado seria a feitura de uma avaliação mais minuciosa da demanda do mercado de trabalho e da adequação do curso para as vagas oferecidas por ele. Muitas vezes não existe uma correspondência entre as matérias estudadas nos cursos do Enter Jovem e a real cobrança que o mercado tem sobre as pessoas. Embora seja inegável o crescimento pessoal dos jovens, falta um direcionamento que tenha um enfoque mais voltado para o aspecto empregatício.

Essas ações seriam fundamentais para o melhoramento do projeto, já que facilitaria o alcance dos jovens ao mercado e diminuiria a frustração tão visível nele, já que, na maioria das vezes, eles anseiam trabalhar num tipo de mercado específico para o qual ainda não estão completamente preparados.

ANNEX D

FOCUS GROUP PROTOCOL

1. YOUTH

Welcome & Introduction

- Explain who we are and why are we here: evaluation of Enter Jovem program.
- Explain how our focus group will work: we only plan to use your thoughts and voices.
- Explain what we will do with this information.

Introduction: Youth introduce themselves - name and how long they have been involved with EJ.	
Key Question	Probing Questions
(1) Does Brazil need a program like EJ? Why/why not?	- How do youth view this program? - What is current context facing marginalized youth (socio-economic, educational and employment)?
(2) Why did you enroll in the EJ program?	- What needs were you looking to have met? - Why did you feel a program like EJ could help you meet these needs?
(3) Did you complete the EJ program? Why or why not?	- Did you and your colleagues complete the trainings? - Did training meet the needs of youth? - What are your job aspirations / goals? - Where do you want to work? Why? - Can Enter Jovem help you attain them why/why not?
(4) What are the results of your participation in the EJ program?	- How did EJ impact you and those around you? - Are you employed in a stable job? - Do you possess new skill-sets, assets and self-perceptions?
(5) What are the most valuable aspects about the EJ program? Explain	- Most useful aspect of EJ: training (modules, complementary, behavioral, entrepreneurship), insertions, follow-up, activities, and small grants. - Provide evidence as to why
(6) What are your ideas to make this project or projects like it more accessible to and effective for young people in Brazil?	- How could we make a project like Enter Jovem become even more successful? - What are is necessary for a project like Enter Jovem to reach and positively impact more youth?
Method: Success Lists	List and rank ideas

2. EDUCATORS/COORDINATORS

Introduction: Participants introduce themselves - name and which CBO they are working with.	
Key Question	Probing Questions
(1) Does Brazil need a program like EJ? Why/why not?	- How do educators/CBO's perceive this program. - What is current context facing marginalized youth (socio-economic, educational and employment)?
(2) Were the EICs successful in delivering the EJ program to youth? Why/why not?	- Were the EICS effective? Explain. - What was your role in this process?
(3) In this process, did the Enter Jovem program impact the CBO? Explain.	- How did it impact the CBO? - How did this program impact you as educators? (Skills?) - Where any specific strategies used to impact the CBO?
(4) Will CBOs continue offering Enter Jovem services when program finishes? Explain.	- What will allow or limit EJ services from being offered beyond life of project?
(5) Did Enter Jovem reach its ultimate goal of inserting youth into the formal job market in a sustainable way? Explain.	- How do you know? - What allowed or prevented this?
(6) What are your ideas to make this program even more accessible and effective?	- Would a project like this have a positive impact in other places in Brazil? - How could we do this? - Who should we work with?
Method: Success Lists	List and rank ideas

3. IMPLEMENTING AGENCIES

Introduction: Participants introduce themselves – name, title and organization.	
Key Question	Probing Questions
(1) Does Brazil need a program like Enter Jovem? Why/why not?	- How do implementing agencies perceive this program - What is current context facing marginalized youth (socio-economic, educational and employment)?
(2) Were you as implementing agencies successful in facilitating the delivery of the program? Why/why not?	- Were the implementing agencies effective? - What steps were taken or not to facilitate effectiveness? - What were your specific roles in this process?
(3) In this process, did the program impact the implementing agencies? Explain.	- Why and how?
(4) Has Enter Jovem been delivered in a sustainable way? Explain.	- What evidence enables your answer? - Discuss specific inputs, activities and outcomes that lead you to this answer.
(5) Did Enter Jovem reach its ultimate goal of inserting youth into the formal job market in a sustainable way? Explain.	- How do you know? - What allowed or prevented this?
(6) What were the most important lessons learned in executing the program?	- What has being involved in the EJ program taught you? - Would you do anything differently? Why/why not? - What would you like to share with others about this EJ project?
(7) What are your ideas to make this program even more accessible and sustainable?	- Would a project like this have a positive impact in other places in Brazil? - How could we do this? - Who should we work with?
Method: Success Lists	List and rank ideas

ANNEX E

SURVEYS

1. Rapid Youth Surveys

Side 1

Organization where Focus Group is Taking Place: _____

Age: _____

Sex: _____

Highest level of formal education completed: _____

Level (s) completed in EJ Program:

Basic Module Complementary (Math & Portuguese)

Intermediate Module Behavioral

Advanced Module Entrepreneurship

Side 2

Are you currently employed as a result of the EJ program (yes/no): _____

If yes, what company: _____

If yes, how long: _____

Do you have any recommendations for the EJ program:

1.

2.

3.

2. Company Surveys

Please fully answer all questions about the Enter Jovem (EJ) project:

(1) Organization name and city: _____

(2) How long have you been partnering with the EJ project: _____

(3) Youth completing the EJ project are prepared to succeed in this organization.

Yes Don't know No

Explain:

(4) The Enter Jovem project provides adequate support to youth to enable a successful and lasting insertion.

Yes Don't know No

Explain:

(5) The Enter Jovem program has impacted our organization.

Yes Don't know No

Explain:

(6) To further enhance the partnership between EJ and the private sector, I have the following recommendations:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

ANNEX F

DATA SUMMARY

1. Youth Sample: Focus Group and Survey Information

No.	Location	EIC	Gender	No. of youth	Age Range / Median	Dominant EJ Level Completed	Dominant Employ. Status	Other
1	Salvador	APAE	Female	5	22-28 / 24	Module I	Unemployed	Special Needs
2	Salvador	APAE	Male	6	18-30 / 23	Module I	Unemployed	Special Needs
3	Salvador	Dona Cano	Female	3	16-18 / 17	Module I	Employed	
4	Salvador	Dona Cano	Male	5	16-17 / 17	Module I	Employed	
5	Salvador	CESEP	Female	6	18-21 / 19	Module I	Unemployed	
6	Salvador	CESEP	Male	6	15-21 / 18	Module I	Unemployed	
7	Salvador	CEPRIMA	Female	6	18-21 / 20	Module II	Unemployed	
8	Salvador	CEPRIMA	Male	6	16-19 / 18	Module II	Unemployed	
9	Salvador	Santa Luzia	Female	3	17-20 / 19	Module I	Unemployed	
10	Salvador	Santa Luzia	Male	4	17-21 / 20	Module II	Unemployed	
11	Salvador	Ile Aye	Female	6	19-21 / 21	Module I & III	Unemployed	
12	Salvador	Ile Aye	Male	3	19-22 / 21	Module II	Unemployed	
13	Salvador	-----	Mixed	5	17-22 / 18	Module II	Employed	Inserted Youth
14	Recife	Cult. Digital	Female	7	17-20 / 18	Module I	Unemployed	
15	Recife	Cult. Digital	Male	6	17-21 / 19	Module III	Unemployed	
16	Recife	APABB	Female	8	17-30 / 25	Module I	Unemployed	Special Needs
17	Recife	APABB	Male	4	19-30 / 24	Module I	Unemployed	Special Needs
18	Recife	Esperança	Female	7	14-21 / 17	Module I	Unemployed	
19	Recife	Esperança	Male	6	15-19 / 17	Module I	Unemployed	
20	Recife	Felicidade	Female	6	15-17 / 16	Module I	Unemployed	
21	Recife	Felicidade	Male	7	14-17 / 16	Module I	Unemployed	
22	Recife	Cidadania.com	Female	6	16-17 / 16	Module I	Unemployed	Public School
23	Recife	Cidadania.com	Male	6	15-21 / 19	Module I	Unemployed	Public School
24	Recife	Phoenix	Female	8	15-20 / 17	Module I	Unemployed	
25	Recife	Phoenix	Male	4	17-18 / 18	Module I	Unemployed	
26	Recife	-----	Mixed	4	18-22 / 21	Module II	Employed	Inserted Youth
27	Fortaleza	-----	Female	4	17-20 / 19	Ren. Energy	Employed	IDER
28	Fortaleza	-----	Male	4	18-21 / 20	Ren. Energy	Employed	IDER
29	Fortaleza	-----	Mixed	6	19-23 / 21	ICT Training	Unemployed	Com. Digital

Source: Youth Focus Groups, Evaluation Fieldwork, April-2007

2. Company Sample: Interviews and Survey Information

Company *		Partnership with EJ	Total EJ inserted youth (as articulated by company)	Are EJ youth prepared?	Are EJ youth supported?	Impact of EJ on Private Sector?
Salvador, BA	Bahia Tursa	1 year	6	Yes	Yes	Improved human relations working with special needs youth.
	Bolsa Moderna	2 years	100+ trainees (estagios)	Yes	Not sure	New recruitment channel.
	Faculdade de São Salvador	3 years	10	Yes	Yes	Mutual learning through teaching EJ youth.
	Hotel Pestana	1 year	3	Not sure	Not sure	Commitment & contribution of youth.
	McDonalds	6 months	6	Yes	Yes	Commitment & contribution of youth.
	SIMM	1 year	5	Not sure	Not sure	No impact. Youth profile needs to better fit with market demand.
Recife, PE	Buscar Consultoria	8 months	-----	Yes	Yes	Working with youth.
	Global do Brasil	1 year	20: paid trainees in Salvador & Recife	Yes	Yes	Commitment & contribution of youth.
	Grupo-In Insinuante	2 years	8	Not sure	No	Don't have enough knowledge to evaluate.
	Instala Tecnologia	1 year	2	Yes	Yes	Enriched the culture of our business
	McDonalds	1 year	8: McDonalds 1: Applebee's	Yes	Yes	Commitment & contribution of youth.
Fortaleza, CE	Esmaltec Karsten Nordeste Top Company RH	-----	-----	-----	-----	-----

* Companies visited in Fortaleza have a direct relationship with NGOs and were not included in survey. The Enter Jovem program is supporting the training and insertion efforts of these NGOs through the Small Grants Program.

Source: Company Surveys, Evaluation Fieldwork, April-2007

3. Random Sample of Basic Module Required Products: Résumé and Life Plan

	Youth Sample*			Résumé: Objective (Created in MS Word)	Life Plan: Goals (Created in MS Word & Power Point)
	Gender	Age	EJ Year		
Salvador, BA	Female	16	Y3	“To work in customer service.”	Finish studies; become a lawyer; construct house.
	Male	16	Y3	“Work with competence, responsibility and dedication for the growth of the company.”	Have a house, car and dog; study and work in a furniture store.
	Female	14	Y3	“Work in the telemarketing field and to grow with the company.”	Finish my formal studies; take IT classes; finish university; be employed and earn a good salary.
	Male	18	Y4	“Do everything possible to work; be a good employee and follow the rules.”	Become employed to help my family; have a family and house; be a businessman or a landlord.
	Female	19	Y4	“To obtain the goals of the job market to carry out my position as best as possible”	Work a lot; have a house; get a good job.
	Male	20	Y4	“Always learn and do the most and best for the business”	Continue studying IT; get a good job, a house; teach theatre; finish studies and be financially stability.
Recife, PE	Female	18	Y3	“To get a job”	To be working; married; and have a house.
	Male	17	Y3	“To work in the accounting field.”	Enrol in a university; study accounting; to become employed; help my family.
	Female	20	Y3	“To fill a vacancy in the job market.”	Begin and finish high school; study medicine at a university; have my house, husband and child; work in a big company.
	Male	16	Y4	“To be competent in the field in which I want to work.”	Become employed as paid intern in a good company; have a car, house; family and good job.
	Female	17	Y4	“To work in customer service”	Have a husband, a house; become a paediatrician; have two children.
	Male	19	Y4	“To obtain experience to begin my professional qualification.”	Have a house and wife; work as a professor.

* The sample consists of randomly selected students (six males and six females) in Salvador and Recife. Samples were drawn from six different EICs: three in Year 3 and three in Year 4.

Source: Enter Jovem Personal Profile Files, April-2007.

4. ICT Inserted Youth by Position & Gender

	Company	Position	Sex
Salvador, BA	1. Asa Telecom	Technical Installer	M
	2. Faculdade de Salvador	ICT Help Desk (Monitor)	M
	3. Faculdade de Salvador	ICT Help Desk (Monitor)	M
	4. Faculdade de Salvador	ICT Help Desk (Monitor)	M
	5. Faculdade de Salvador	ICT Help Desk (Monitor)	M
	6. Faculdade de Salvador	ICT Help Desk (Monitor)	M
	7. Faculdade de Salvador	ICT Help Desk (Monitor)	M
	8. Faculdade FAD	ICT Operator	M
	9. Hotel Bahia Tropical	ICT Help Desk (Monitor)	M
	10. JUCEB	ICT Area	M
	11. Liceu de Artes da Bahia	ICT Help Desk (Monitor)	M
	12. Liz Construções	ICT Help Desk (Monitor)	M
	13. 3 I Banking	Hardware Installation	M
	14. Tv E Video	Technical Assistant	M
	15. Tv E Video	Technical Assistant	M
Recife, PE	1. ABF Engenharia Ltda	Engineering Assistant	M
	2. Consultech	ICT Support	M
	3. Global do Brazil	ICT Event Support	M
	4. Global do Brazil	ICT Event Support	M
	5. Global do Brazil	ICT Event Support	M
	6. Global do Brazil	ICT Event Support	F
	7. Global do Brazil	ICT Event Support	F
	8. Global do Brazil	ICT Event Support	M
	9. Global do Brazil	ICT Event Support	M
	10. Kibom Servane	Production Assistant	M
	11. Instala Tecnologia	ICT Help Desk	M

Source: Enter Jovem Insertion Data, Recife and Bahia, April-2007.

5. Success List Recommendations: Youth

Youth FGIs (Males)		Youth FGIs (Females)	
Interventions to improve or expand Enter Jovem	Frequency Appearing in <i>Success Lists</i> constructed by 13 FGs	Interventions to improve or expand Enter Jovem	Frequency Appearing in <i>Success Lists</i> constructed by 13 FGs
Expand and/or deepen the ICT emphasis of courses.	18%	Increase insertion opportunities.	14%
Increase insertion opportunities.	13%	Improve ICT infrastructure (hard/software).	12%
Improve training focus on employability.	10%	Improve / expand physical infrastructure.	10%
Improve ICT infrastructure (hard/software).	10%	Improve training and qualification of educators.	10%
Increase hours of course training.	10%	Offer more courses (languages, market specific).	9%
Offer more courses (languages, market specific).	10%	Better promote program.	9%
Increase access to program / course.	8%	Improve training focus on employability.	7%
Better promote program.	8%	Expand and/or deepen the ICT emphasis of courses.	7%
Improve training and qualification of educators.	6%	Increase hours of course training.	7%
Improve / expand physical infrastructure.	3%	Higher level of respect / discipline in classroom.	7%
Contract more educators.	3%	Support of students (transportation/food).	7%
		Improve course materials.	7%

Source: Youth Focus Groups, Evaluation Fieldwork, April-2007

6. Success List Recommendations: Coordinators & Educators

Enter Jovem Coordinator and Educator FGIs	
Interventions to improve or expand Enter Jovem Salvador	Interventions to improve or expand Enter Jovem Recife
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Improve ICT Infrastructure. 2. Better promote Enter Jovem and the EICs. 3. Expand EICs. 4. Increase the age requirement to 14-24 with emphasis on 18-24. 5. Develop a course in hardware maintenance. 6. Remuneration of Educators. 7. Have accessible funds to accompany entrepreneurship. 8. Establish fundraising strategies. 9. Improve insertions. 10. Provide incentives for insertion of educators into universities. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Remuneration of Educators. 2. Improve ICT infrastructure. 3. Improve focus on obtaining employment vacancies. 4. Improve physical infrastructure. 5. Offer more options of professional courses (market driven). 6. Increase the age requirement to 14-24. 7. Improved time coordination with complementary courses and workshops ('Oficinas').

Source: Coordinator/Educator Focus Groups, Evaluation Fieldwork, April-2007

7. Success List Recommendations: Implementing Agencies

Implementing Agency FGIs	
Interventions to improve or expand Enter Jovem Salvador – Group 1	Interventions to improve or expand Enter Jovem Salvador – Group 2
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Find new ways to attend to market demands. 2. Planning/Realignment of CDI, IBRAD and AIR. 3. Integrated databank. 4. Improve communication between EIC & Enter Jovem Agencies. 5. Better adjust to the USG fiscal year. 6. Up grade EICs Laboratories. 7. Create the position of “Ouvidoria” (Mediator). 8. Training in income generation & fundraising (for EICs). 9. Remuneration for EIC team members. 10. Better maintenance of ICT infrastructure. 11. Contracting of a press/marketing consultant. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Improve insertion. 2. Improved infrastructure. 3. Remuneration for EIC team members. 4. Obtain apprenticeship credentials to insert youth under the Apprenticeship category. 5. Improve the promotion of the project and its community goals. 6. Broaden the political consciousness of the community through the Youth committee. 7. Integrate the complementary qualifications into the Basic Training Module. 8. Create possibility to transfer funds to organizations in addition to technological resources or institutional strengthening. 9. A singular web-based database. 10. Demonstrate accountability to families and communities. 11. Cancel the Intermediate and Advanced Trainings
Interventions to improve or expand Enter Jovem Recife	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. From initiation, ensure that the goals are clear for all involved. 2. Inter-regional exchanges. 3. Listen to the youth and EIC teams. 4. Integrated training for implementing partners around communication. 5. Work with institutions with capacity in community mobilization. 6. Improve the idea of the volunteer teams – they do not work. 7. Develop specific capabilities for youth. 8. Provide initial orientation and constant follow-up training for educators. 	

Source: Implementing Agency Focus Groups, Evaluation Fieldwork, April-2007