

A Report on Monitoring and Evaluation of Educational Sector Reform Assistance Program (2003 – 2005) submitted to **The United States Agency for International Development.**



Submitted By:

Anjum Asim Shahid Rahman

Chartered Accountants

Member Firm of

Grant Thornton 

1st floor, 2 Ali Plaza, 1-E, Jinnah Avenue

Blue Area, Islamabad

Tel: 051- 2271906

Fax: 051- 2273874

Table of Contents

Abbreviations & Acronyms

1.0	Introduction	
1.1	Background	01
1.1.1	Education in Pakistan	01
1.1.2	Education Sector Reforms	01
1.1.3	Education Sector Reforms Assistance Program (2003-2006)	02
1.1.3.1	Partner Organizations	02
1.1.3.2	Goals and Objectives	03
1.2	Team and Scope of the Study	03
1.2.1	Team	03
1.2.2	Scope	03
1.3	Methods and Approaches used in the Study	04
2.0	District Education: Policy and Planning	05
2.1	Background	05
2.2	Objective	05
2.3	Areas Targeted for Study	05
2.4	Institutionalization	06
2.5	Constraints in monitoring and evaluation	06
2.6	Findings and Recommendations	07
2.6.1	Status of DEPs	07
2.6.2	Use of DEPs by the EDOs	08
2.6.3	Key issues addressed by the DEPs	09
2.6.4	Provision of funds by the Provincial Government	10
2.7	Impact and Outcomes	11
2.8	Conclusion	11
3.0	District Education: Public Community Partnership	12
3.1	Background	12
3.2	Limitations of the study	13
3.3	Objective	13
3.4	Areas Targeted for Study	13
3.5	Findings and Recommendations	15
3.5.1	The Role of Community Teachers and NGOs	15
3.5.2	Use of Plans by SMCs	15
3.5.3	Model used by the three partners: SCF, LEAD, and Paiman	17
3.6	Impact and Outcomes	22
3.7	Sustainability	22
3.8	Conclusion	23
4.0	Professional Development Infrastructure	24
4.1	Background	24
4.2	Objective	24
4.3	Areas Targeted for Study	25
4.4	Findings and Recommendations	26
4.4.1	Use of Skills and Provision of Support by the Mentors	26
4.4.2	Use of Acquired Skills by the Teachers and Related Issues	27

4.5 Case Studies	30
4.6 Impact and Outcomes	30
4.7 Sustainability	32
4.8 Conclusion	32
5. Youth and Literacy Program	33
5.1 Background	33
5.2 Objective	33
5.3 Areas Targeted for Study	34
5.4 Findings and Recommendations	35
5.4.1 Program Effectiveness and Achievement of Standards by Literacy Graduates	35
5.4.2 Comparison between Different Literacy Programs Offered by Different NGOs	40
5.4.3 Stake Holders Involvement, Ownership Building, and Sustainability of the Program	44
5.5 Impact and Outcomes	47
5.6 Sustainability	48
5.7 Limitation of the study	48
5.8 Conclusion	49
6. Public Private Partnership	50
6.1 Background	50
6.2 Objective	50
6.3 Areas Targeted for Study	50
6.4 Findings and Recommendations	52
6.4.1 Status and Cooperation between the Private Companies and Schools	52
6.4.2 Community Awareness about the Benefits of the Partnership for the Schools	55
6.4.3 Progress Made for Reviewing the Regulatory Framework that Governs Public Private Partnerships	56
6.5 Impact and Outcomes	57
6.6 Conclusion	57
7. Identification of Issues by Senior Management of ESRA	58
List of Appendices	60

Abbreviations & Acronyms

AASR	Anjum Asim Shahid Rahman
AfED	Alliance for Education
AIE	Ali Institute for Education
AKUCEL	Aga Khan University Centre of English Language
AKU-IED	Aga Khan University Institute for Education Development
ASTHAN	Aasthan Latif Welfare Society
BCPD	Balochistan Consortium for Professional Development
CBMP	Cluster Based Mentoring Program
CBO	Community Based Organization
CCB	Citizen Community Board
DCO	District Coordinating Officer
DDM	District Deputy Manager
DDO	Deputy District Officer
DEMT	District Education Management Teams
DEO	District Education Officers
DEP	District Education Plans
DG	District Government
DIG	District Improvement Grant
DIP	District Improvement Plan
DLO	District Literacy Officers
DSC	District Steering Committee
EDO	Executive District Officer
ESR	Education Sector Reforms
ESRA	Education Sector Reform Assistance
EU	European Union
FRP	Family Reading Program
GOP	Government of Pakistan
HHHPO	Helping Hands for Helpless People Organization
HT	Head Teachers
ILM	Integrated Literacy Model
LEAD	Leadership for Environment and Development
LRC	Learner Resource Center
MT	Master Trainer
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NRSP	National Rural Support Program
OTS	Office of Technical Support
P&P	Policy and Planning
PAIMAN	Participatory Approaches for Integrated Management and Needs
PCP	Pakistan Center for Philanthropy
PCP	Public-Community Partnership
PMP	Performance Management Plan
PD	Professional Development
PDI	Professional Development Infrastructure
PIDE	Pakistan Institute of Development Economics
PITE	Provincial Institutes of Technical Education
PNGO	Partner NGO
PPP	Public-Private Partnership
PST	Primary School Teacher

PSU	Project Support Unit
PTSMC	Parent Teacher School Management Committee (name used in Balochistan)
RCDC	Rural Community Development Council
RSPN	Rural Support Programs Network
RTI	Research Triangle Institute
SAHE	Society for Advancement of Higher Education
SCF	Save the Children Fund
SDS	Sindh Development Society
SEP	School Enhancement Program
SIDP	Supporting Innovations in District Programs
SIG	School Improvement Grant
SIP	School Improvement Plan
SMC	School Management Committee (name used in Sindh)
SOW	Scope of Work
SPDC	Social Policy Development Centre
SPELT	Society of Pakistan English Language Teachers
SPO	Strengthening Participatory Organizations
SST	Secondary School Teacher
TCF	The Citizen Foundation
TRC	Teacher Resource Centers
TTP	Teacher Training Partner
UC	Union Council
UEI	United Education Initiative (RTI's Sindh Consortium for PD)
UNDFP	United Nation Development Fund Program
UNDP	United Nation Development Program
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VA	Village Assembly
WDI	Whole District Initiative

ESRA EVALUATION REPORT

1. Introduction

1.1. Background

1.1.1. Education in Pakistan

Pakistan, like other developing countries, faces crucial challenges regarding quality of life and state of education. According to the UNDP, Pakistan ranks 135 on the Human Development Index (UNDP, 2000: 149)¹, and 68 on the Human Poverty Index (UNDP, 2000: 151). The overall literacy rate is estimated at 54%, while for females it is 41.75%. Independent sources, however, place the overall literacy rate at 26% and for females at 12%, contending that higher figures include people who can handle little more than a signature.

Additionally, the quality of education being imparted through the public sector schools which cater to 80% of the school going children leaves a lot to be desired. Factors attributed to this dismal state of affairs include lack of government funding, political and bureaucratic interferences, lack of internally comparable learning outcome standards, and lack of quality teacher training.

1.1.2. Education Sector Reforms

Keeping in view the dismal situation of education in Pakistan, President Musharaff and his team put forward a vision encompassing a set of reforms in all sectors of education in Pakistan. The Education Sector Reforms in Pakistan (2001-2005) target all basic education objectives for primary schooling, adult literacy, and gender equality within the framework of Dakar Declaration and the Millennium Development Goals.

The Education Sector Reforms (ESR) is an Action Plan to improve education performance in the areas of access and quality at all levels of the education system. The Action Plan was derived from a systematic consultative process which began in December 1999. The consultation engaged over 500 people comprising experts, civil society groups, private sector, NGOs, and provincial governments.

The vision of this Action Plan included the following major features:

- i. Sector wide approach that emphasized institutional reforms for sector strengthening across all sub-sectors, reinforcement of linkages between sub-sectors, and reduction of the gender gaps at all levels of the education spectrum.
- ii. Each sub-sector was to target the socially excluded groups who are entitled to education as a fundamental universal right, not just at the primary level through non-formal and formal systems, but also at the

¹ UNDP (2000). Human Development Report 2000. *United Nations Development me Report*. New York: Oxford University Press

secondary, technical and higher education levels. Under-privileged population was especially targeted. Reducing the gender gap was considered a priority area in this action plan.

- iii. Public-private partnerships were to be facilitated to achieve the quantitative and qualitative targets of the Action Plan.
- iv. Good governance was considered important to achieve quality education and was to be targeted through partnerships between government, the private sector and civil society.

The major areas that are being targeted by the Action Plan include the following:

- Comprehensive Literacy and Poverty Reduction
- Expansion of Primary /Elementary Education
- Introduction of Technical Stream at Secondary Level
- Improving the Quality of Education
- Teacher Education and Training
- Higher Education Sector Reforms
- Public – Private Partnership

The ESR Action Plan aims to raise the national literacy rate to 62.5% and primary enrollment to 82% by 2006.

1.1.3. Education Sector Reforms Assistance (ESRA) (2003-2006)

The ESRA program has been developed keeping in view the Pakistan government's Devolution Plan promulgated in 2001 and, thus, seeks to increase accountability and grant greater authority to local governments. Therefore, this program also seeks to facilitate the decentralization of the education sector involving transfer of much of the central government's educational functions and responsibilities to provincial and district-level authorities, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and private sector entities. An important function in this regard is the establishment of public-private and public-community partnerships for enabling the devolution process.

1.1.3.1. Partner Organizations

For implementation of the ESRA Program, a consortium of organizations led by the Research Triangle Institute (RTI), which has as partners the Education Development Center, American Institute for Research, Save the Children, World Education, International Reading Association, The Asia Foundation, Northern Colorado University, and Eastern Washington University, was selected to execute the project. RTI along with its partners put together a team for implementation and also selected Pakistani partner organizations such as the Aga Khan University Institute of Educational Development (AKU-IED), Alliance for Education (AfED), the Ali Institute of Education (AIE), Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), Society for Advancement of Higher Education (SAHE), Rural Support Programs Network (RSPN), and Supporting Innovations in District Programs (SIDP), as

well as community groups as part of its team, for effective implementation targeted for completion by 2006.

1.1.3.2. Goals and Objectives

The primary goal of the program was to institutionalize capacity in order to create sustainability, with stakeholders having the ownership and the authorship over the program, thus enabling the strengthening of the system so that the reforms become an integral part of the education system with sustainability that continues beyond the project life.

In order to achieve the goals of the ESRA program, the following 5 key objectives were identified:

- Strengthen education policies and planning
- Increase the capacity of teachers and education administrators
- Improve youth and adult literacy
- Expand public-private partnerships to improve access to and delivery of education services and
- Establish teaching methods that instill fundamentally democratic attitudes and behaviors among children and educators and draw families into the life of the school community

For achievement of the objectives, various initiatives have been identified by RTI (a) awarding of grants to local NGOs to help support the program at the grass-roots level; (b) carry out under the Whole District Initiative (WDI) a combination of reform functions focused within 9 districts of Sindh and Balochistan through engagement of all stakeholders; (c) training of primary school teachers, school principals, and education officials; (d) expansion of public-private partnerships to ensure that more schools and educational services are available; and (e) strengthening of Pakistan's National Literacy Commission.

1.2. Team and Scope of the Study

1.2.1. Team

The Anjum Asim Shahid Rahman (AASR), Chartered Accountants Ltd. was commissioned by USAID to conduct an evaluation study to review and analyze some of the education activities of the Education Sector Reform Assistance Program implemented by the Research Triangle Institute (RTI). The purpose of this evaluation was to assess the success and relevance of the on-going program activities and to provide recommendations and insights for future programming. In this regard, the contractor (AASR) set up an evaluation team comprising Dr Sabiha Mansoor as Team Leader with three team members Nasreen Hussain, Mohammad Zafar, and Tayyaba Tamim from the Aga Khan University Centre of English Language, and three team members Khurram Abbas, Syed Sadaat Ali, and Ashif Khurshid from AASR.

1.2.2. Scope

The evaluation team was to review and analyze ESRA activities that pertain to: i) strengthened education sector policy and planning, ii) improved capacity of teachers and administrators, iii) improved youth and adult literacy, and iv) expanded public-private partnerships.

1.3. Methods and Approaches used in the Study

The study was conducted for 40 days from early September to end October, 2005. A qualitative approach was used in order to obtain an in depth understanding (see [Appendix A](#)). The methods of data collection included: i) meetings with stakeholders, ii) interviews, iii) field visits, iv) assessments, v) sample surveys vi) self-evaluation questionnaires, and vii) documentary analysis (see [Appendix B](#)). The sample for the study was selected to ensure representation of all stake holders (see [Appendix C](#)).

2. DISTRICT EDUCATION: POLICY AND PLANNING

Introduction

2.1 Background

The policy component of the ESRA project was targeted to address three key problems in the sector. These included: a) lack of knowledge on the system effectiveness, b) lack of accountability, and c) managerial efficiency. It was proposed that the ESRA as a reform support program with a critical education training component should bring together reasonableness of design, clarity of intent, widespread ownership, implementation capacity, as well as incentives, supports, and sanctions to implement change.

The policy component would also work collaboratively with Pakistani counterparts at various levels, especially think-tanks such as SAHE and SDPI, by providing them with either grants or subcontracts to actually carry out some of the policy analysis or policy dialogue work. In addition, this component would work closely with the government counterparts such as the ministries and government offices so as to forge stronger contractual working relationships between the government and the civil society, private research, and implementation contractors. Finally, this component would demonstrate possible impact of policy improvement through pilot projects such as its link with the PPP/PCP component.

2.2 Objective

The objective of District Education Planning was to provide a three-year macro-framework for sector-wide development in the district education system that was to serve as a tool to help the district leadership set vision and targets, and develop action plans for the whole district. The process of District Education Planning initiated by RTI in 2003 can best be understood as a process beginning with the development of sector-wide District Education Plans (DEPs) followed by more focused project-based District Improvement Plans (DIPs) and then by needs-based budgeting and planning for district primary education, providing financial resources in the form of District Improvement Grants (DIGs)².

One of the prime activities of RTI is to strengthen the District Offices of the target districts and build capacity of these offices to efficiently plan and execute the activities keeping in view the emergent educational requirements of the district. The exercise of preparing DEPs by RTI was aimed to develop planning skills in the district governments at the grass root levels and to identify the untapped available resources. All the nine districts prepared yearly plans in the form of District Improvement Plans (DIPs) by 2004. The purpose of this evaluation was to assess the success and relevance of on-going as well as to provide recommendations or insights for future..

2.3 Areas Targeted for Study

In view of the scope of work, the following areas were identified for study in order to understand the progress, achievement and issues with respect to strengthened education sector policy and planning:

² ESRA Program Description Document (2005)

- a) Desk review and analysis to determine the status of the District Education Plans (DEPs)
- b) Desk review, analysis, and interviews to determine use of the DEPs by the EDOs or other relevant education officers: whether the district education plans addressed the key issues or whether funds were being disbursed to the districts by the provincial government, in a timely manner.

2.4 Institutionalization

Policy and planning component of ESRA program is one of the most critical areas as the first step of every activity and initiative is planning. Unless there is proper planning of activities and initiatives, optimal results cannot be achieved.

Results of the study revealed that as far as DIPs/DIGs are concerned, the progress is satisfactory. However, the preparation and implementation of DEPs through district governments which were the core activities behind the whole initiative leading to its institutionalization, are seen as inadequate. It is evident that once the DEPs were prepared, RTI concentrated its entire efforts towards the targets relating to DIPs/DIGs and the core purpose of DEPs which was the long term vision of the districts, was lost.

When the project is over, only the targeted DIPs/DIGs will be achieved and DEPs will be an obsolete document. For the purpose of sustainability, the importance of long term planning by the district governments and its implementation in all respects cannot be ignored.

2.5 Constraints in Monitoring and Evaluation

There were certain limitations which impeded in the performance of monitoring and evaluation of ESRA program. It is important to mention that USAID and any other partnering organization should facilitate such studies for better results.

The evaluation team was also constrained due to the following reasons:

1. The district officer of RTI was not available in district Gawadar to facilitate the team in monitoring and evaluation.
2. Unavailability of some government officials for interviews due to their non-serious attitude towards this study.
3. Some documents were not available for review specially those which were required from district governments.
4. Another important factor was the time constraints for this study.

2.6 Findings and Recommendations

2.6.1 Status of DEPs

S. No	Activity	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Development of DEPs by DGs.	Prepared by the respective district governments through consultants, except for Khairpur which made substantial efforts to develop DEP all by itself. ³	Since officials were trained for this purpose, RTI should have ensured that the DG officials were fully involved, in order to address ground realities.
2.	Preparation of a 5-year DEP.	4-year DEPs, coinciding with the 4-year ESRA Program were prepared. Moreover, DEPs are being used by District Governments only for DIPs/DIGs with reference to ESRA Program and not for any other purpose making it an obsolete document without any other use ⁴ .	RTI should pursue district governments to utilize DEPs in planning education activities in their respective district. They should be encouraged to amend / modify DEP as per their requirements.
3.	DIPs and DIGs were introduced to assist the district governments in initiating aspects of DEPs over a 3-year period.	District governments are only thinking up to 2006 and not thinking about exploring and exploiting various funding options available ⁵ .	In the final year the RTI could request for plans for the following two years with possible funding options.
4.	Submission of a monitoring and evaluation plan and monthly progress reports of DIPs by DGs to the RTI.	The evaluation team was not able to obtain these documents from district government officials nor could RTI management get this from district government indicating these documents are not being prepared at all.	For monitoring progress and timely addressing of issues, it is important that the DGs take preparations of these seriously. The RTI should ensure that these reports are provided.
5.	Identifying institutions for Public Private Partnership (PPP) by the DGs.	Limited efforts made so far by the DGs, although RTI has showed them the possible channels for tapping other resources ⁶ .	If sustainability is to be achieved, the DGs will have to become very proactive in identifying possible partners and nurturing and strengthening these partnerships.
6.	Role of RTI with respect to DIPs	In Naushki and Gwadar, the district office of the	RTI needs to develop a closer working relationship

³ Interviews with the members of DSC and review of DEPs.

⁴ Interviews with DSC members and government officials.

⁵ Interviews with district government officials.

⁶ Review of DEPs and discussions with district government officials.

	and DIGs.	RTI assured that the implementation of the DIPs and DIGs was the head office's responsibility.	amongst its offices in the field.
7.	Creation of DIPs and DIGs to ensure smooth translation of selected aspects of DEPs.	Training manuals for DIP-DIG have been developed and are being fine-tuned in light of the feedback from participants. 19 DIPs have been developed in eight districts, 11 in Phase I and 8 in Phase II. DIGs for Phase I and the first installments of Phase II have already been disbursed ⁷ .	The DIP/DIG approaches seem to be working quite well. However, it should be ensured that the DGs understand that they will have to translate the rest of DEPs in a similar manner through the government and other resources which they will have to tap.

2.6.2 Use of the DEPs by the EDOs and Other Relevant Officers

S. No	Activity	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	DSCs should oversee the transformation and implementation of the DEPs through DIPs at the school level.	Except for Hyderabad, the DCSs are not performing, primarily because the DGs are not ensuring their smooth functioning and active participation ⁸ .	DGs should ensure and strengthen the role of the DSCs in preparing and monitoring the DIPs and DIGs. RTI should also make DSC's contribution in DIPs and DIGs obligatory.
2.	Workshops for the DG officials to strengthen their capacities in view of the expected role of the DG.	In some districts there was low/no participation while in others it was good. In all, 67 officials have been trained. Moreover, no significant impact has been observed which could provide evidence that district officers have learned and developed skills as a result of this training in terms of implementation of DEPs. District governments are only concentrating on DIPs/DIGs and ignoring other activities necessary to be carried out as identified in their respective DEPs ⁹ .	RTI, with the help and participation of senior district officers, should ensure maximum participation in such training sessions. RTI should establish relationships at higher level in the district official framework. RTI should also develop a close working relationship with the district governments in the utilization of DEPs. Further, RTI should provide sufficient training to district government officials so as to plan for their own districts considering the ground realities. This can best be achieved by amending current DEPs according to

⁷ Review of DIPs and documents relating to workshops and interviews with district staff of RTI.

⁸ Interviews with DSC members.

⁹ Review of reports on training of district government officials.

			<p>their district needs and more importantly implementing the same.</p> <p>USAID can also play an important role at this stage by pressurizing federal as well as provincial governments to elicit the education department's cooperation in this regard.</p>
3.	Trained DG officials will be the driving force for the implementation of the DEPs.	Unplanned transfers of officials trained to take DEP responsibility were affecting the quality of implementation ¹⁰ .	The DGs should undertake responsibility for not allowing such transfers. However, where transfers are imperative new officers should be trained through crash programs to ensure understanding of the key principles of the program.

2.6.3 Key issues addressed by the DEPs

S. No	Activity	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Creation of Public Private Partnership to ensure sustainability.	This aspect has been exploited to a very limited extent ¹¹ .	The DGs should be made to realize the importance of these partnerships for long term sustainability.
2.	Creation of linkages with the NGOs to provide ground support to the DGs.	The RTI has effectively utilized the NGOs in the districts for carrying out the implementation and monitoring part ¹² .	The DGs need to work closely with the NGOs and take advantages of their experience in the field.
3.	Regular meetings of members of DSCs amongst themselves and with the DSCs in their own and other provinces.	DSC's role, which should have been very powerful, has not been optimally used. In fact, in many districts they were barely functioning ¹³ .	RTI should have ensured adherence to the initial plan of optimal utilization of the DSC as the concept is still new for the DGs.

¹⁰ Interviews with RTI management and district government officials.

¹¹ Review of DEPs and discussions with district government officials.

¹² Interviews with the partnering NGOs and RTI management.

¹³ Discussion with the members of DSC.

4	The DEPs would be developed by the DGs keeping the ground realities of their contexts in view.	This strategy did not materialize and no appropriate indigenous model seems to have emerged ¹⁴ .	In the year remaining, RTI could focus on helping DGs develop their own model rather than implementing the consultant's models.
5	Detailed planning and budgeting had to be done for DIPs and DIGs	Inaccurate and flawed data often lead to problems in planning and budgeting. However, within constraints, 19 DIPs have been created and DIGs awarded, in two phases ¹⁵ .	Before launching into major programs, data anticipated should be collected and verified.
6	Empowering the DGs and the communities to take charge of education, so that it responds to and meets local needs.	While devolution has resulted in major transfer of authority and functions to district level education officials, their job descriptions have not been revised accordingly, leading to ambiguities in terms of roles and responsibilities ¹⁶ .	For strengthening this system a detailed exercise will have to be carried out by provincial governments to develop clear ToRs for all those who are directly involved.

2.6.4 Provision of funds by the Provisional Government to the District Government

S. No	Activity	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Provision of funds from provincial governments.	Neither the DGs nor the RTI was willing to share the details regarding these funds. There also seems to be lack of coordination between the Education and the Planning and Budget Departments at the Provincial level ¹⁷ .	The provincial governments should honor their commitments and provide funds in a transparent and timely manner to enable effective accountability.
2.	Utilization of funds by the DSCs.	In one instance, Sukkar, funds were transferred by the RTI to the DG, but remained unutilized because the DSCs were not informed by either the RTI or the DG, each assuming that the other would do it ¹⁸ .	Reporting relationships between different entities need to be clear, particularly, the role of the EDO needs to be clearly defined with respect to the DEP, DIP and DIG.

¹⁴ Review of DEPs and interviews with district government officials.

¹⁵ Review of documents related to DIPs / DIGs along with reports.

¹⁶ Interview with district government officials and with the management of RTI.

¹⁷ Discussions with RTI management and interviews with district government officials.

¹⁸ Discussion with DSC members and RTI representative for district Sukkur at that time).

2.7 Impact & Outcomes

Districts have now adopted the concept of ‘minimum standards’ as a guiding principle for planning and budgeting. Thus the process of needs-based planning has begun to take roots. This is evident from the fact that target districts have signed off on adopting needs-based planning and budgeting in the education sector. Minimum standards for five priority areas have already been adopted with budgetary projections until 2010-11 under DIP 2.

Other donors and the government of Sindh Province have adopted ESRA district planning model for other districts. The Sindh Education Plan (SEP) developed by Sindh government in collaboration with the European Union (EU) specifically mentions ESRA Education Planning as a guide for developing sectoral plans in all districts of the province.

Instead of purchasing the material itself, the district government transferred the amount to various SMCs, thus enabling communities to participate directly in managing schools as envisaged by the mandate given to SMCs. This again is a significant step towards a sustainable partnership between the government and communities, without the involvement of any intermediary agency.

Districts have been encouraged to adopt the notion of ‘minimum standards’ for planning and budgeting purposes. DIP/DIG phase 2 has been designed along these lines. Districts have signed off on the five priority areas for the next five years. Adoption of minimum standards would ensure sustainable utilization of resources in priority areas until 2010-11. It would also institutionalize the practice of planning around priorities and focusing on minimum standards that would keep evolving with time.

Capacity building of civil society for advocacy and public representatives for monitoring and oversight of the education system being carried out by RTI is also a significant step towards sustainability of reforms initiatives. Effective demand articulation by civil society and public representatives would ensure that changes brought about through DIPs/DIGs and other system-level interventions remain sustainable over a longer period.

2.8 Conclusion

Strengthening and empowering the district government can resolve many sustainability and equity problems, with respect to education. To meet this end, the role and functioning of DSC should be re-activated and this forum should be used to engage all relevant stakeholders. Through concerted efforts, and by engaging district government machinery for monitoring, retaining enhanced human resource capacities, and pursuing district education departments for the implementation of DEPs/DIPs/DIG, positive results of these reforms can be ensured.

3. DISTRICT EDUCATION: PUBLIC COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIP (PCP)

Introduction

3.1 Background

PCP's work is aimed at putting in place and making functional, systems and mechanisms for public participation and support in school improvement, primarily through the government-notified School Management committees (SMCs).

ESRA Program for public community partnership conceives devolution of governance of education at the district, *tehsil*, and the union council level. Devolution plans put special emphasis on community empowerment to improve social services. In education, SMCs have been made responsible for ensuring access to and quality of education at the school level. These committees were made functional under the Local Government Ordinances. Under this component, participating communities are required to visualize an improved school, develop plans to realize those visions, and set up priorities based on their perception of the most immediate needs. Finally, ESRA funds School Improvement Plans (SIPs) based on the prioritized needs of the community, while in some cases helps them look for other sources of funding to fund the other parts of the SIPs¹⁹

The composition of SMCs in most of the cases includes parents, teachers, and local councilors. They are formed via notifications issued by the Provincial Education Departments and registered with the District Education Departments. SMCs are allowed to open joint bank accounts to receive part of the education sector funds (usually on the basis of the number of students enrolled in that school) and utilize them for school improvement activities according to their prioritized needs. They can also access funds from other donors, including the NGOs and individual/corporate philanthropists. They are governed by notifications issued by the provincial governments from time to time and are accountable to the government for proper and effective utilization of the funds that they receive.

Schools Improvement Plans (SIPs) were developed in consultation with local communities in the first phase. Communities first prepared their own vision of improved schools. The needs for these schools as reflected in the visions, were then prioritized by the SMCs, schoolteachers, students and local communities. SIPs have resulted from this process. The SIPs are now being translated into actions through School Improvement Grants (SIGs). The grant is conceptualized at two levels, the start up grant (SIG 1), the Cash Grant (SIG 2), and (SIG 3). SIG 01 (START) comprised learning material kit for the SMC school students and teaching material for teachers. SIG 02 and SIG 03 were 'fixed obligation grants'. These are meant to address the needs of designated schools around a menu of interventions, mainly physical improvements,

¹⁹ ESRA Program Description Document: 2005

through SMCs and an active involvement of local communities. Only the successful implementation of SIG 02 would lead to subsequent support, zgrants, and inputs²⁰

3.2 Limitations of the Study

The results were derived from a sample of at least two cases of SMCs from each of the district visited, however a total of about 35 SMCs were visited in all, the results could have been different had all the SMCs been evaluated.

In the case of Balochistan only, there was incomplete representation of all SMC members at the time of our visit, so we had to restrict our questions to only the two or three active members present. In some cases, no SMC members were present despite earlier notice by RTI staff e.g. U C Killi Hazoor Baksh in District Chaghi.

3.3 Objectives

The objective of PCP is to ‘establish functioning demand-driven school support mechanisms, systems and approaches at the school, sub-district, and district level. It also seeks to put in place and make functional the support mechanisms needed to ensure community participation. This includes strengthening the capacity of DGs and local NGOs to perform their role within the context of devolved governance.

RTI sought a strategy that would strengthen both the SMCs as well as the DGs at the same time; SMC’s would be prepared to receive and implement the grants; the DG would be strengthened to process grants in a timely manner and monitor implementation at the school level. This was done i) by having the SMCs actually visualize, develop, and implement the SIPs, and ii) by involving key DG officials in the processing, granting, and monitoring mechanisms.

Given that the DG system is not adequately equipped yet, an alternative mechanism of grant making and management through district level Project Support Units (PSUs) has been proposed. This involves active contribution from the district government, the RTI representatives and the partner NGOs. It is expected that once the system has demonstrated to operate effectively, the role of RTI and PNGO would taper off with functions of PSU eventually be performed by the government after due policy and capacity building²¹

3.4 Areas Targeted for Study

As per the scope of the work, areas of focus included the assessment of the development process of school improvement plan (SIP) in selected districts and its utilization by the key stakeholders to determine:

- i. the role of the community, teachers and NGOs in the development of SIP

²⁰ ESRA Program Description Document: 2005

²¹ESRA Program Description Document.

- ii. the use of plans by the school management committee to address school improvement needs, and
- iii. among the three partners – Save the Children Fund, LEAD and Paiman, offered the most effective model of working with the community to develop the SIPs.

3.5 Findings and Recommendations

3.5.1 The Role of Community, Teachers and NGOs in the Development and Implementation of SIPs

3.5.2 Use of plans by SMCs to address school improvement needs

S. No	Activity	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Communities to ensure access to and quality of education.	The communities are actively involved in most cases. They are implementing and mobilizing school improvement activities such as construction of classrooms, toilets, boundary walls, verandas, water tanks; access to groundwater/water supply; and procurement of desks/benches, fans, water coolers, etc. They are mobilizing available resources, including contributing lands so as to have an enabling environment. Many communities have made serious efforts to provide all possible means to establish girls schools, or have started co-education in existing schools. Some SMCs in Balochistan have started monitoring the attendance of teachers to ensure effectiveness and access to education ²²	Plans need to be in place for sustaining the enthusiasm of the communities for about 10 years until the system takes first roots. RTI could assist and strengthen the NGOs, who are directly mobilizing the communities, to play the key role. The assistance and strengthening of NGO responsible for community mobilization and direct interaction with the community at large, would lead to more effective community mobilization.
2.	Start to visualize an improved school; develop plans to realize this vision and set up priorities based on their perception of the most immediate needs.	The local communities first prepared their own vision of improved schools. The needs reflected in the vision were then prioritized by the SMCs, school teachers, students, and local communities. These then got translated into SIPs which were converted into action through SIGs ²³	The approach seems appropriate, as it is context based and the communities have the power to decide what they want and how they want it. However, the DGs will have to play an active role in mobilizing resources to maintain the momentum once the ESRA grant period is over.
3.	SMCs would be allowed to open joint accounts to receive part of the education sector funds and utilize them for school	The funds allocated to the SMCs (non-ESRA Intervention SMCs) were not disbursed according to any plan or on needs assessment basis. In some cases, SMCs were not able to utilize their funds even after	The district governments should play an enhanced role as regulators of SMCs, and they should create more awareness in the SMCs about the availability of funds and the ways and means whereby these can be

²² SMCs interviews

²³ SMCs interviews.

	improvement activities according to their prioritized needs.	transfer of funds to the SMC accounts. This problem was not present in ESRA serviced SMCs and utilization of funds was maximum ²⁴ .	accessed.
4.	Contracted partner NGOs would assist the SMCs to develop and implement the SIPs.	More than 1800 SMCs, with which PCP's PNGOs have been working, have received their first tranche of cash grants and are implementing the SIPs which they developed ²⁵	SMCs have a lot of potential and need to be further strengthened for sustainability, as suggested above.
5.	SMCs ultimately transforming into association or CCBs.	At the present level of operation, the transformation seems highly unlikely, although efforts are underway to try out various models of CCBs before actually developing on operational CCBs. The progress of current SMCs towards CCBs or other institutionalized structure is an indicator of sustainability for the current SMC arrangement. Though this is not a direct goal, but evaluating SMC's progress towards any institutionalized structure was interesting to observe and was reported. The reason why the current SMCs will not be able to institutionalize themselves to the more structured and sustainable framework is the fact that there is lack of proper direction, guidance, awareness and infrastructure for such conversion ²⁶	In order to enable SMCs to transform into CCBs or other institutionalized structure the former will have to be made more representative and their capacity will have to be enhanced considerably. Provision of training manuals by the PNGOs could be one option.
6.	SMCs would be representative institution with participation from different sections and strata of the community warranting wider representation of SMCs	Though not highly prevalent, there are areas, particularly in Sindh, where the huge amount of money of a tribe or caste seems to be creating rifts amongst the members (e.g. Nasirabad, Tamachini, Sukkur) ²⁷	The process of selection of SMCs needs to be gradually replaced by the process of election of both the members and the chairpersons. This is very essential for the transformation of SMCs into CCBs. Such an arrangement warrants community participation at grass root levels. This factor is lacking in the current SMC structure. All efforts need to be

²⁴ SMCs interviews.

²⁵ ESRA Program Description, 2005.

²⁶ SMCs interviews.

²⁷ SMCs interviews.

			made to ensure that this deficiency is not likely to be carried forward to the more institutionalized structure as perceived.
7.	Involving teachers in the process of school management	Most the teachers have supported the new interventions through capacity building measures and are also actively participating in SMC matters. There seems to be a high level of absorption among teachers to adopt new teaching techniques. They have also approached parents of students in improving enrolments and ensuring regular attendance in schools ²⁸	Involvement of teachers in school management is very important and this should be continued.
8.	Involving parents in the SMCs.	Parents are a key to ensure success not only in translating effectiveness of SMCs, but also in improving the school environment. PCP component has contributed to bring together all community members around the school as a focal institution in the members, by activating the SMCs. However, more efforts are needed in bringing parents to school and engaging them in child education ²⁹	Involvement of parents can become more visible if illiterate parents in villages get the opportunity of the adult literacy. This step in the long term will contribute to further strengthening of SMCs and also create awareness amongst people about education and promote literacy to a larger audience.

3.5.3 Models used by the three partners: SCF, LEAD, and Paiman

S. No	Activity	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Community mobilization	<u>LEAD</u> : Community mobilization has been achieved through the VA. This VA has not only ensured community participation through involving them in matters related to school, but also enabled them to make decisions regarding their school. It has created	The LEAD model, needs some more strengthening in areas related to addressing delinquent SMCs and training the SMCs to enable them to transform into CCBs. This can be a model worth considering for replication.

²⁸ SMCs interviews.

²⁹ SMCs interviews.

		<p>not only social capital among the community, but has given them awareness that they can plan a leading role in matters related to their education.</p> <p><u>Paiman</u>: There seems to be an implementation gap in executing the process designed in the model. Though in Hyderabad district, communities are mobilized, there is a need to develop capacities in SMCs and also to engage the community at large in SMCs and in schools.</p> <p><u>SCF</u>: In the case of Balochistan province, there is one NGO working in PCP component, i.e. Save the Children Fund (SCF). They have sublet the component to three NGOs, i.e. SPO in Naushki & Chaghi, Taraqee in Qilla Saifullah and NRSP in Gawadar and Turbat. These NGOs are getting technical support in the form of community mobilization strategy devised by SCF, and ensuring community's involvement in SMC and schools through monitoring and evaluation of these NGOs.</p> <p>SCF faced numerous challenges in Baluchstan due to insufficient time devoted to planning this component. Issues related to poverty, high unemployment, and geographical terrains as well as backwardness are more severe as compared to conditions in other provinces. Females are also not involved in public affairs in Balochistan. As a result, parents do not see the advantage of education.</p>	<p>Paiman, with the assistance of RTI, should re-address the implementing strategy both for Hyderabad in the post division situation.</p> <p>A more realistic time-frame needs to be developed so as to elicit more involvement of the community members, especially female participation, in the community projects.</p>
--	--	--	---

³⁰SMCs, individual and PNGO's interviews as well as document analysis.

		<p>RTI has laid too much emphasis on implementing and delivering its targets. In Balochistan alone the target was to develop 1500 SMCs. As a result, the feedback from the ground could not be incorporated into the implementation of plan. By targeting all the schools, quantity became the priority and the factors of quality and indigenization were affected and the fact that the program was target driven as evidenced by group interviews³⁰</p>	<p>Issues of quality also need to be addressed particularly student enrolment, drop outs, and teacher retention, which could be resolved with the maturity of SMCs, provided there is sustainable growth and institutionalization.</p>
2.	Involvement of the SMC in planning and implementation	<p><u>LEAD</u>: The VA approach followed by capacity building measures offered to SMC members and involving them in planning and implementation has provided strong grounds for successful execution of this model.</p> <p><u>SCF</u>: NRSP, hired by SCF, works towards the Local Support Organization concept for the sustainability of these newly formed/reactivated SMCs. The Local Support Organization entails formation of an entity created and funded by NRSP (through provision of revolving credit by PPAF) to work on top of the SMCs to support them in their activities and sustain their operations³¹</p>	<p>LEAD's example seems worth studying and emulating.</p>

³¹ SMCs and PNGO's interviews as well as document analysis.

3.	Provision of support material to the SMCs	<p><u>LEAD</u>: Limited work done in this respect.</p> <p><u>Paiman</u>: The support material provided by Paiman to SMCs is quite effective and comprehensive. Booklets provided as part of the kit to SMCs elaborated on the role and responsibilities of SMC and its members. It provides a brief but well explained school assessment cycle. Similarly, the booklets provided on the functioning of SIP and SIG were also quite comprehensive. However, there is a need to see the actual utilization of these documents and trainings in terms of their impact on the functioning and maturity of SMCs.</p> <p><u>SCF</u>: Limited work done in this respect³².</p>	<p>The Paiman material could be considered for distribution in other districts after assessing its suitability for other districts and its adaptation, if needed.</p>
4.	Providing training to the SMCs for effective performance of their role.	<p><u>LEAD & Paiman</u>: Have conducted training for the SMC members, but not in an effective manner.</p> <p><u>SCF</u>: The model of SCF depicts provision of training in 6 areas at different intervals during the course of activity of formation, operation and strengthening of SMCs. It was learned during our review and visit of SMCs that this training was provided in two workshops; the first being a one-day workshop (record keeping module) and second being a two-day workshop (rest of modules). The whole concept of division of contents in modules is overshadowed and the motivation and learning by</p>	<p>It would be appropriate to make the training contents more relevant to and understandable by the SMC members by employing interactive training techniques and simulation models.</p> <p>These training initiatives need to increase participant involvement and made user friendly in order to train these innovative concepts and ideas considering their life styles.</p>

³² SMCs, individual and PNGO's interviews as well as document analysis.

³³ Interviews with SMCs and PNGOs.

		<p>the participants cannot be maximized in most of the cases as rightly pointed out by the SMC members in all the 5 districts.</p> <p>Different PNGOS and sublet NGOs hired by PNGOs were adopting different techniques and modules for SMC training. These training programs have not delivered desired results for ESRA³³</p>	
--	--	--	--

3.6 Impact and Outcomes

By September 2005, in Sindh, 6142 schools had already developed the SIPs. Out of these schools, approximately 1430 schools have already been awarded the cash grants. RTI's target for the financial year 2005 was to provide cash grants to 1768 schools under the ESRA Program (see Appendix D).

In the province of Balochistan, RTI reported 493 SIPs being developed out of which 391 SIGs have already been awarded (see Appendix E).

In addition, 15,637 teacher kits and 328,736 student kits have been distributed in the two provinces.

It is quite encouraging to note that tremendous progress has been made in activating the PCP component of ESRA in the last one year. Indeed, PCP had given in real terms an identity to the program and its visibility is quite evident from their performance. Given the ground realities, the model adopted for PCP seems not only effective but also relevant to the context.

During the field visits to the program district, it was found that in the PCP component, there was evidence of a strong role that RTI district offices were playing in coordinating PCP initiatives and ownership as well as providing support to PNGOs in effective program implementation. This has also placed RTI district office in a better position to monitor the PCP activities in Balochistan.

Addressing the level of effectiveness with which PNGOs have conceptualized the process and adoption of methodology by the various PNGOs working on PCP component, it will be pertinent to mention the fact that an overall comparison of the three cannot be made due to differences in working environment, legislation, base-line and number of factors in the field that differentiates the two sets of PNGOs i.e. working in Sindh as compared to working in Balochistan.

In Sindh, among two PNGOs and their respective model, LEAD model seems to be more effective as compared to Paiman, mainly because it addresses to and has engaged communities in the planning and management and implementation of SIP and SIG. Apart from other design aspects of LEAD model, there seems to be more visibility of the model at the grass root level because of the quality of human resources, its effective monitoring mechanism and enabling organizational set up at the district level. Though Paiman has its own strengths of the model, there is a need to re-design its model on the above mentioned attributes.

3.7 Sustainability

The future of the SMCs, however, needs to be carefully looked into and efforts should be made to assess the level of maturity of these institutions before transforming them into CCBs or SMC associations. Through this SMC creation and strengthening process under RTI PCP component might be considered as a pilot phase which is a learning curve experience for these NGO towards a more complex and bigger forum i.e. CCBs. Every effort needs to be made to give a better understanding of this concept to the SMC members

in order to materialize the efforts made so far towards the institutionalization of this SMC concept for future sustainability.

3.8 Conclusion

The development process in all the 9 selected districts of RTI is adequately planned in terms of its conception, documentation, execution and overall outcome of SIP. It will be appropriate to say that PCP component of ESRA program has given visibility to the overall program and its success is evident from the last one year's performance. However, the impact of PCP component could be further enhanced, if integrated with other ESRA components, i.e. Adult Literacy and PDI. The inherent bottom up approach of PCP component is well reflected in the PNGOs model in the given context and institutional arrangements. There is a need to review these models in order to track future growth of SMCs. Similarly, capacities of SMCs should be further developed in the field of education planning and management, so that these institutions can initiate their own development agendas.

4. PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT INFRASTRUCTURE

4.1 Background

ESRA's PDI component has attempted to offer a variety of opportunities for professional development to teachers through programs offered in partnership with major organizations in the province of Sindh. In Sindh, PDI has partnered with AKU-IED and United Education Initiative (UEI). UEI is a consortium comprising PITE Sindh (Public Sector Teacher Training Institute), Sindh University (public sector), Notre Dame Institute of Education (private sector), Indus Resource Center (NGO), and Jamia Millia (nationalized teacher training college).

Both AKU-IED and UEI offer program for professional development of teachers in the districts of Sukkur, Khairpur, Thatta, and Hyderabad in the province of Sindh. AKU-IED and UEI offer teacher training programs based on two different modules to different teachers responsible for teaching learning of children at primary level. The 300-hour long program to primary school teachers encourages them to adopt learner-centered and activity-based teaching and learning approaches. However, each of these programs has different schedules— 300 hours are spread over 12 months by AKU-IED and over 18 weeks by UEI. Furthermore, AKU-IED programs are conducted by Mentors, UEI uses Master Trainers (MTs) and School Support Teachers (SSTs). UEI both have also taken on itself to train primary school head teachers (see Appendix F).

Balochistan enjoys a unique position, as area wise it is the largest province but has the lowest population. Poverty, unemployment, difficult geographical terrains, traditional customs and values, lack of family support to females in education, and the absence of big cities (other than Quetta) are additional factors that need to be considered while evaluating the planning, implementation, and outcomes of this ESRA component. The PDI component is responsible for providing training to both school teachers and administrators to enhance the quality of public and private education. This training development is conducted by AKU-IED and Balochistan Consortium for Professional Development (BCPD) in five districts. Moreover, targets that were set in terms of numbers have not been achieved in Balochistan, though probably the enrolled participants will successfully complete their training in due course (see Appendix G).

The results of the study display that a target driven strategy has been followed so far and not much effort has been made to understand the local factors that constrain teacher training in Balochistan, especially for females, so as to devise strategies to enhance enrollment for training programs and to make teachers' classroom performance more effective and to improve learning outputs.

4.2 Objective

The PDI component of the ESRA Program is responsible for improving the capacity of teachers and education administrators through in-service training of teachers, teacher trainers and educational administrators with the help of school clustering and other relevant techniques. (ESRA Program Document)

The target was to improve the performance of 52,700 teachers and administrators (43000 primary school teachers, 5200 principals, and 4500 local educational officers) of the education sector (RTI-US Coperative Agreement Document). According to the latest figures provided by RTI in the Final PMP document the target number for both the provinces was revised to 34000. This training component focused four fronts: training, assessment, sustainability and institutionalization, and support and incentive programs. A fifth area - distance education had also been dedicated as sub-section. Together, the areas would offer a comprehensive package for institutionalizing skills that will have a lasting and positive impact on access and quality within the classroom. This component would work closely with its counterparts in all related areas, particularly those working on student assessment system, accreditation, and credentialing.

This component is required to work with the host country counterparts from key government intuitions and NGO to develop context-specific training models by incorporating the tailored versions of Active Learning models, to ensure widespread ownership of both process and product in the education sector. Teachers trained in Active Learning would be able to carry out a series of flexible teaching strategies, including techniques for instructing in basic skills, teaching skills of enquiry, arranging and managing group work, teaching for comprehension, encouraging debate, teaching for high-order thinking, planning lessons for active learning and carrying out classroom assessments and using the results. Active Learning would also directly help to enhance practitioners' knowledge and skills by encouraging attitude changes and goals for performance and outcomes by altering their behaviors through professional development.

4.3 Areas Targeted for Study

The following areas were targeted for the study:

Mentors

- a) Use of skills acquired by the mentors through the RTI supported training
- b) Support provided by the mentors to the primary school teachers trained by the RTI and in their clusters

Teachers

- a) Use of skills by the teachers trained through the RTI training program
- b) Issues or problems faced by teachers who are not using these skills
- c) Teachers' feelings about gains through the RTI training

4.4 Findings and Recommendations

4.4.1 Use of Skills and Provision of Support by the Mentors

S. No	Activity	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Provision of support to teachers in allocated cluster schools.	Teachers not available in many of the cluster schools. Also the distance between schools did not allow for efficient and timely coverage of all schools. Moreover, lack of coordination among training partners on cluster mapping led to a lot of confusion ³⁴ .	Availability of teachers is essential for the success of any professional development initiative. Hence, the DGs should take appropriate steps to ensure the enrolment of teachers.
2.	Provision of 9 hours of support to 30 teachers each month by AKU-IED	The number of mentors / MTs / SSTs was not sufficient to deliver at this rate, due to vast distances between schools and unavailability of transport, at times. ³⁵	The physical realities should have been taken into consideration while assigning workloads to mentors.
3.	Attainment of certain targets in terms of number of teachers to be trained.	In view of the fact that teachers in two districts of Balochistan were on strike, and in view of the vast distances and limited number of mentors, the targets set were considered difficult to achieve. Shortage of transport was seen as a problem in both the provinces. Also, administrative and financial problems were reported in the survey. Source: Interviews with teachers and district govt. officials.	The number of MTS / SSTs / mentors and the physical difficulties particularly in Balochistan should have been taken into consideration before setting targets. Also, pilot testing to gauge the expected out puts should have been done to determine realistic targets.
4.	Absence of teachers from their workplace for extended periods during training period	Administrators, teachers, parents and students were beginning to voice their concern about the absence of teachers when on training, as they felt that	Training programs should ideally be planned so as not to disturb the daily routines, preferably during vacations. Also, where possible, replacements should

³⁴ Interviews with teachers.

³⁵ Survey results and interview with teachers.

		training was being done at the cost of the students' and the school time. Source: Interview with Head Teachers and Teachers.	be pre-arranged.
--	--	---	------------------

4.4.2 Use of Acquired Skills by the Teachers and Related Issues

S. No	Activity	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Development and use of materials	In Sindh particularly, it was reported that the materials developed by the mentees during the training period could not be used in the classroom for teaching, as they were housed in the Learning Centers that were far away from the schools. ³⁶	The DG should aim at developing mini Resource Centers at the school level.
2.	Provision of material kits by RTI	Material kits were promised by RTI but had not been distributed to the mentees, which caused problems in developing low cost materials	RTI should be careful in making such commitments and when such commitments are made, they should be honored. Non-fulfillment of commitments leads to bad repute of RTI in target districts.
3.	Parents displeasure at development of low cost / no cost material	Parents got disturbed when children asked for a petty amount to develop low cost material for the class. The parents also complained that the female students could not attend to household chores, as they were busy preparing materials for the next day's class. ³⁷	This is predictable initial resistance which will subside with the passage of time.
4.	Safe custody of low cost / no cost material	It was also pointed out that the teachers did not have space to store material. The material got stolen or was misused if they left it open in their classes. ³⁸	Handling and storage of material can be taught while training teachers. However, teachers and students should be encouraged to resolve such matters.
5.	Implementation of strategies like	The teachers categorically stated that the training was	The DGs should emphasize and support the

³⁶Interviews with teachers and SMC members.

³⁷Interviews with parents, teachers and SMC members.

³⁸Interviews with teachers and SMC members.

	group / pair work, using handouts and other teaching materials	relevant for schools where the student-teacher ratio was 1:20 or 30 per class and where funds were available on continuing basis to prepare materials for teaching purposes. Since almost all schools had more than 45 students per class, implementation of active learning approach became cumbersome. The methodology and approaches were not welcomed by the heads of schools, many of whom had not received training as yet. Since the education department did not have PD on its priority list, the government officials/supervisors who came to visit the schools saw the whole exercise futile and caused problems for the teachers. They also reported this to the higher ups and the HT and teachers were reprimanded. ³⁹	implementation of PD at all levels.
6.	Preparing and implementing lesson plans	The teachers stated that there was no doubt about the importance of preparing a lesson plan, but physical conditions were not supportive to implement these techniques. It was not possible to prepare and implement lesson plans if one was teaching multi-grade classes. Moreover, content knowledge of teachers was not strong and this hindered effective teaching. ⁴⁰	Since multi-grade teaching is a reality, the training programs should ensure that teachers are given ample hands-on practice to deal with such situations.
7.	Awareness about modern teaching techniques.	The level of improvement in terms of rhetoric was excellent. Teachers talked about lesson plans, audio visual aids, and other such modern concepts. They took pride in sharing that the districts were now rich in human resources in terms of teaching. The results of the implementation were, however, mixed as in some places the trained teachers were not displaying the	Effective monitoring & evaluation serves as a measure for accountability of the various aspects and offers close interaction with the implementing partners and resolution of issues. Monitoring & evaluation framework should be properly implemented in a better way and enforced to get the desired results. The training program should

³⁹ Interviews with school teachers and SMC members.

⁴⁰ Interviews with school teachers and training partner representatives.

		desired results. It was possible that in the same district or town, some teachers were more resistant to change because this required more work and additional responsibilities without giving them any monetary or promotion benefits. ⁴¹	effectively evaluate the knowledge of teachers and children prior to the training and after its completion to assess its effectiveness. Incentives should be provided by District Education Departments so as to motivate teachers to undertake training.
8.	Taking advantage of mentor support.	The mentors were trying to provide the required support but they faced some resistance as co-education was still a problem with many mentors and mentees in Balochistan. The females preferred to meet the evaluators without the male mentees. For another, in Sindh, the teachers had some reservations about the credibility of the students who observed their classes. (Source: Group Interviews with mentees/mentors and teachers)	The DG, particularly in Balochistan, needs to resolve the issue of co-training of teachers in the light of their local context. Moreover, mentors / MTs / SSTs need to be developed up to a level that they command the respect of teachers otherwise the whole exercise will be wasted.

⁴¹Interviews with school teachers

4.5 Case Studies

Field visits to primary schools in the ESRA districts in both provinces recorded that there are some schools that had benefited more from the ESRA support than others. Factors contributing to success included teacher motivation, teacher training opportunities, community involvement, and district government support (see Appendix-N).

4.6 Impacts and Outcomes

In Sindh 7520 teachers out of the targeted 23573 have been trained, and 5556 are being trained. Also, 116 mentors have been trained in Sindh. In Balochistan, of a total target of 4217 mentors and teachers to be trained, 562 mentors and teacher trainers have already been trained and another 2852 teachers are undergoing training by BCPD (1992) and by IED (860).

The mentors and teachers who were trained from IED and UEI stated that they saw major changes and improvement in themselves and stated that their attitude towards the teaching profession had changed considerably. Perceptions of teachers had also changed; they had started sharing information and knowledge with peers and also with students. There is a more enabling environment of trust and responsibility amongst all teachers of schools. The mentors stated that they had gained in terms of knowledge, skills and positive attitude towards education. They had also learnt how to manage time and work with patience and tolerance. Their capacity to reflect had increased after knowing about new techniques of teaching. Similarly, the society was also giving them more respect. The teachers/ mentees stated that learning took place within a professional community that was nurtured and developed from both inside (HT) and outside the school (mentors), thus resulting in significant and lasting school changes in their behaviour.

The new learning methodologies had made classes interesting and interactive and they could see positive learning outcomes in their students. The Secondary School Teachers (SSTs) stated that the course had enabled them to become trainers who were interested in their trainees' learning. Since they had now realized the importance of applying theory to pedagogy, they were more interested in finding out 'why' rather than only 'how' in teaching practice. They were well trained to make the needed changes in teaching and school-wide practice and view professional growth as central to school change. Teachers had started identifying more and more professional development opportunities within the school, and proudly stated that if this trend continued, they might resort less often to one-shot workshops and other traditional forms of professional development. They further stated that the course had helped them to understand their students better and their teaching styles now matched with their students' learning styles. They could now deal with heterogeneous classes and slow learners were given extra time and support and they were not ignored or punished as was the case previously. The teachers informed that for the first time they had been given the opportunity to develop low cost and no cost teaching materials.

The teachers stated that now there was a lot of interaction between the teacher and students in the classroom, and group work by students was a regular

phenomenon. After training, the school children had also gained enough confidence to start asking questions. During group work, multiple minds had started working and students had also shown leadership and supportive qualities when working in groups. As a result, attendance and enrolments had increased in schools. Now students shared and discussed matters related to their lessons and on other topics. Previously, the focus had been on memorizing lessons and covering syllabus, but now emphasis had shifted towards learning by doing and towards observations. Overall, the teacher training has had a positive impact on teachers' practice and students' knowledge of the subject matter, and the student outcome had improved.

From the community perspective, the teachers were of the opinion that the community had appreciated the positive changes in the classroom. No doubt, the government had provided incentive to parents to send their children to schools in the form of bags, books, and uniforms, but it was the shift in teaching methodology that had impressed them and motivated them to send their children regularly to schools. The parents had now started realizing the value of quality education and they were now taking more interest in the school education of their children by ensuring that their children attended school regularly, and that proper and complete homework was done. Overall, the community had started taking an interest in their children's education. Also, there was more sharing, trust and communication amongst communities due to this program.

Professional Development Forums (PDFs) have generated good activity at the district and provincial level and stake holders have gathered together regularly on these forums to talk about issues in PD; have planned workshops in some cases for teachers; have been able to allocate money for holding the PDFs. Overall, the PDFs have provided a culture for discourse in the districts, and the forums are resulting in helping people beginning to think about issues in PD and link them to the PDI.

Material to assist teachers in the classrooms has been developed in the form of manuals. These manuals in both Sindhi and Urdu are being field tested right now, and feedback is also sought from the provincial education departments. Once finalized, these manuals will be made available to the education departments for printing and dissemination to teachers.

The two public sector universities which have been made part of the two consortiums had never before engaged in activities pertaining to elementary education at this scale.

In fact, according to the Dean of Education of Sindh University, working with ESRA provided them their first opportunity to work on an elementary education program.

Results of the survey reported a high degree of satisfaction with the training imparted

by the teacher training institutions in Sindh (94%) and Balochistan (100%). For details of Survey results see [Appendix H](#).

4.7 Sustainability

In the case of Professional Development Infrastructure, the issue of sustainability demands a practical and feasible strategy that is focused upon working out some arrangement with the two provincial governments, whereby interventions like role of mentors/master trainers are recognized so that a more effective school support system prevails, permanent staff is placed at the Teacher Resource Centers (TRCs); material produced by ESRA is owned, used and distributed by the government; and the two consortiums are seen as entities that the two provincial governments can rely upon from time to time to handle large scale projects rather than seeking new requests for proposals from organizations whose credibility is yet to be established.

PD interventions have been focused on strengthening and supporting the existing infrastructure and system of the Government PD, i.e. Provincial Institutes of Technical Education (PITEs), Bureau of Curriculum, Elementary Colleges, Public Sector Universities & Schools. Faculty members and staff belonging to these institutions have been trained, capacitated, and assigned tasks in line with their job descriptions. Almost 1,000 mentors & master trainers have been trained in the nine districts, some 90% of whom belong to the public sector, thereby creating a large pool of experts in each district that they can utilize from time to time to meet their demands and needs. Professional Development Forums (PDF) has started to act as district platforms where stake holders gather each month to talk about issues in education and seek strategies for resolving them. District education officials, some of whom have regularly attended forum meetings have also been working on the possibility of arranging funds to keep the PDF activity going regularly. They see a definite value to these PDFs.

Finally, in view of local constraints, like one-teacher schools, insufficient number of teachers in schools, and female teachers finding it difficult to be away from home for long time periods, teacher training models should be designed in such a way that they are readily acceptable.

4.8 Limitations of the Study

Time constraint and distances limited our access and contact to all the relevant people in Balochistan. Language barrier was also evident in our meetings with students, and the teachers or ESRA management staff acted as interpreters. At times, availability of relevant people was also an issue which may have impeded an ideal situation for data collection

4.9 Conclusion

PDI has made very positive impact on all the stakeholders. A new approach towards teaching and learning is taking place. This is evident in both the provinces. The issue of sustainability is difficult and there is a need to involve all the local stakeholders in order to sustain it.

5. Youth and Adult Literacy Program

5.1 Background

For achieving the national targets for literacy in the ESR Action Plan, the GOP has set a goal to raise the literacy from 47% to 62%, with an additional 13.5 million people to be literate. In keeping with the national decentralization plans, increased responsibility for implementing literacy would lie with District Literacy Officers (DLO) as part of District Education Management Team (DEMT). The ESRA Program literacy component would be responsible for ensuring integration of literacy activities within the overall ESRA Program and establishing linkages throughout the education sector, by working through the district structure.⁴² Flexibility would be built into the approach and no one standardized model or methodology would be adopted for conducting the literacy program. This component would involve various stakeholders build ownership of literacy strategy, and build capacity in managing literacy efforts, so as to contribute to sustainability. Technologies, such as information systems would be developed by the ESRA Program to aid in managing and monitoring literacy programs. To help engender widespread ownership for a national literacy strategy, the ESRA Program would conduct a national literacy workshop as well as follow-up workshops and establish working groups to develop and manage major aspects of literacy strategy.

ESRA's literacy program was initiated in the province of Sindh in 2004 with the help of different NGOs: MASHAL, ASTHAN, IRC, HANDS, MUSVI SDS, and SGA. The overall aim was to increase the number of literates in the province by providing access to literacy programs to out of school youth and adults with the support of the NGOs and district government. RTI has developed an Integrated Literacy Model (ILM), which was piloted before being implemented in the districts of Sukkur, Khairpur, Hyderabad, and Thatta (with the exception of ASTHAN).

The literacy program in Balochistan was implemented in all five districts with the help of NGOs: SEHR, LAFAAM, RCDC, TARAQEE, SPO, PPDC and HHHPO. The selection of NGOs was at the discretion of Asia Foundation, which evaluated their action plans and disseminated funds directly. Since uniformity of models was not a concern to achieve the objective of literacy, two different models were followed: Integrated Literacy Model (ILM) developed by RTI and Pakistan Literacy Model.

5.2 Objectives

The ESRA objectives of the literacy program were to:

- Increase the number of literates in youth and adults by increasing accessibility to literacy programs. The program their capacity to read and write a simple text in Sindhi/Urdu and solving two digit mathematical problems.
- Strengthen district based NGOs, CBO, and District Government to deliver effective literacy services

⁴² Source: RTI –USAID Cooperative Agreement Document

They were to provide evidence through interviews, of self confidence and self esteem due to greater awareness of self and community, increased interest in learning, importance of women's education, and skills to increase their income.

5.3 Areas Targeted for Study

In keeping with the scope of work laid out by USAID for the ESRA Youth and Adult Literacy Program evaluation, the team focused on assessing the following:

- a. Program effectiveness and achievement of standards by literacy graduates
- b. Comparison of different literacy program, offered by different NGOs
- c. Use of literacy skills by graduates, and as suggested later
- d. Stakeholders involvement, ownership building, and sustainability of the program

5.4. Findings & Recommendations

5.4.1 Program Effectiveness and Achievement of Standards by Literacy Graduates

S. No	Activity	Current Status	Recommendations
1 .	Implementation of program	<p>The teachers were selected by adult literacy coordinators, on the RTI criteria after a process of tests and interviews. These teachers received regular training (10 days). Once appointed, literacy trainees visited homes to convince parents and elders to send their sons and daughters to the center. Community mobilizers visited target centers once a week.</p> <p>However, training of some teachers remained incomplete in some areas in Sindh and Balochistan. Because of the urgency of inducting teachers in the program, some of the teachers were trained only for 3 days. This could have an adverse effect on the program.</p> <p>In contrast to Sindh, (where in all districts except Thatta ILM model was used by all NGOs) in Balochistan the literacy models varied from place to place. The use of different models could have made program monitoring more complicated and difficult for ESRA⁴³</p>	<p>RTI needs to devote more funds and time to train teachers to maximize program effectiveness. It also needs a more effective monitoring system to ensure implementation of its plans.</p> <p>Balochistan could also benefit from a greater degree of uniformity of literacy models. This could also ensure effective monitoring</p>

⁴³ Source: Interviews with ESRA Management, Coordinators, NGOs, and teachers

			<p>It is important that an effective monitoring system be set up by RTI to monitor PNGOs performance and review their plan based on the feedback from monitoring frameworks. This mechanism would help to ensure quality of training of teachers and the program launched.</p> <p>The process and approach of monitoring along with its outcomes need to be shared occasionally with the ESRA staff in the field. The success stories also need to be documented and shared with all stakeholders, so that the lessons learnt could be applied in the field.</p>
2.	Mobilization of political support	<p>In Sindh political support was also generated by the involvement of Nazims and Union Councils who were oriented with the whole component. The cooperation of these locally based influential people led to effective implementation of the program.</p> <p>In Balochistan, the lack of political involvement made program implementation more difficult as community mobilization was then left to the efforts of NGOs were traditionally looked upon with suspicion because of the conservative community members. In addition, the teachers were also not very influential in their own right.</p>	<p>Within the government structure, officials, councilors and members of UC should be mobilized and involved in awareness raising campaigns, because of the respect they command in general public.</p>

		This has also reduced the prospects of government support to sustain the program after ESRA. ⁴⁴	
3.	Achievement of literacy targets	Sindh overshoot its target by about 25% while in Balochistan the targets are currently being achieved (see Appendix I & J). ⁴⁵	Special attention needs to be given by RTI to constraining factors in Balochistan during policy planning and implementation. This would mean that more time might be needed for program implementation in Balochistan than Sindh.
4.	Generating a high level of motivation	A high level of motivation was reported by the graduate literates of both programs in Sindh and Balochistan where the program was successful. The students appreciated the course and found it very rewarding. Where it succeeded, the religious component turned out to be an important source of inspiration especially in Balochistan, for women of different ages to join the program. In Balochistan, the religious component also played a strong role in generating support from the highly influential clergy and male members of the family who finally endorsed the program for the females ⁴⁶ .	.
5.	Increase in self-esteem and confidence of the graduates	The graduates in both provinces felt a strong sense of empowerment as they could read papers, write their names, read prices, as well as expiry dates on medicines. Most importantly, this had given them self-respect ⁴⁷ .	Linking the literacy program with SMC more strongly could enhance the confidence of the literate graduates and enhance their capability to contribute to SMC.
6.	Ability to provide support to family	The parents shared that education developed a focused vision and this would help the females to bring up their own children and bring education to them. ⁴⁸	A component on how to enhance this ability should be built into the literacy program.

⁴⁴ Interviews with district government officials, steering committee members, ESRA management, coordinators and teachers

⁴⁵ Documentary analysis and interviews with ESRA Coordinators and NGOs

⁴⁶ Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, ESRA Coordinators and field visits

⁴⁷ Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, ESRA Coordinators and field visits

⁴⁸ Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, ESRA Coordinators and field visits

7.	Economic empowerment	<p>There was a sense of empowerment and control felt by the graduates over their circumstances. Especially in Sindh, the women had started saving in banks and planned to do business. They had already bought small machines to manufacture soap and were selling their products in the local village. In both provinces the community members had realized the importance of education and were in favour of continuation of the program.</p> <p>However, in Balochistan the skills component remained unaddressed by literacy programs in certain areas, and it was not offered despite being scheduled, leading to much disappointment in the graduates who were looking forward to it.⁴⁹</p>	<p>There is a need for careful assessment as to which skills are required in the market. Based on that assessment only those skills should be transferred to the graduates which are required by the market.</p> <p>With effective monitoring mechanisms, early program termination could have been addressed</p>
8.	Political empowerment	<p>In Sindh, one of the visible changes that the program brought was that now literacy graduates (including the females) felt that they could cast vote with more confidence.</p> <p>In Balochistan, there was no reference to political participation. This might be because of the strong domination of tribal set-up, people hardly think that a literacy program could offer political empowerment.⁵⁰</p>	<p>An aspect on citizenship, i.e. roles of citizens could be incorporated in the literacy program for greater awareness in the community</p>
9.	Development of interest in learning	<p>In Sindh and most of the districts in Balochistan, where the literacy program was successful, the students highly appreciated the significance of their literacy skills and convinced others to join. The women also displayed awareness regarding the need of education for their daughters.</p>	<p>In order to institutionalize these efforts, communities should be strengthened to take initiative on their own. With the help of government and NGOs, community based institutions dealing only with literacy program can be established if resources are</p>

⁴⁹ Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, ESRA Coordinators and filed visits

⁵⁰ Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, ESRA Coordinators and filed visits

⁵¹ Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, ESRA Coordinators and filed visits

		One of the major achievements of the program was to develop interest in education. In Sindh and Balochistan the community members had realized the importance of education especially for females and were in favour of continuation of the program. ⁵¹	allocated to establish Learner Resource Centers (LRCs) and sufficient guidance is provided
10.	Awareness about matters related to health and hygiene.	A valuable contribution of the literacy program was the awareness of hygiene in the graduates from Sindh and Balochistan who tried to apply this in conducting their everyday chores. ⁵²	This component should be an integral part of the training and should be further strengthened.
11.	Change in life style	<p>The graduates shared that they could manage their time effectively, and it was due to this skill that they could accomplish their household chores, as well as attend classes. After their graduation there was a remarkable improvement in their outlook on life and issues around them. The respondents reported that their life style had changed and they were willing to get further education. They shared an enhanced sense of confidence as they felt more in control of their life and more valuable to the community when people turned to these graduates for help. The literacy graduates could even help their children in their homework and also apply the basic knowledge of hygiene that they utilized in their daily life.</p> <p>However, the literacy program could not take root in some areas in Balochistan where life was very difficult and there was too much hardship involved in bare survival.⁵³</p>	

⁵² Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, literacy coordinators and filed visits

⁵³ Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, ESRA coordinators and filed visits

5.4.2 Comparison between Different Literacy Programs offered by Different NGOs

S. No	Model of Delivery	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Different types of program models that were used	<p>The whole of Sindh used the Integrated Literacy Model (ILM) with the exception of ASTHAN in Thatta, where they used their own model which has two components: basic literacy and post literacy. In Sindh literacy was imparted in Sindhi, however, Hyderabad used the model in Urdu as well, due to a large number of Urdu speaking population residing in the district. Basic literacy component dealt with imparting important reading and writing skills such as reading bills, expiry dates, names, etc. The post literacy phase dealt with imparting skills that generated income.</p> <p>In Balochistan, SEHR and LAFAAM followed the ILM model while HHHPO, TARAQEE, RCDC, PPDS and SPO followed the Pakistan Literacy Model . The Pakistan Literacy Model and ILM were different from each other not only in approach but also in content. The ILM model included English and Urdu taught with phonetics, along with basic mathematics. The Pakistan Literacy Model only included Urdu and Mathematics and some religious content. There was no post literacy program other than the ‘family reading program implemented only in certain</p>	For better coordination in the Literacy Program, there is a need for coordination between RTI administration, district government, and PNGOs. Basic information regarding progress by related partners should be shared and options for joint efforts should be explored.

⁵⁴ Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, ESRA Coordinators and field visits

		<p>areas in Killasaifullah) with some success. This too was only structured to follow the ILM Model.</p> <p>ILM emerged as a more successful model than the other because it had a clearly outlined post literacy program; secondly, it focused on phonetics; thirdly, it also included English, which is needed in the strongly bilingual environment of Pakistan⁵⁴</p>	
2.	Time span of the programs	<p>In Sindh, the training spanned over a period of 10 days that included teaching Sindhi through phonics, innovative ways of teaching reading, writing, maths, and teaching of the kalmas and four days of vocational training.</p> <p>In Balochistan, the program was to run for six months. However, in most of the female centers, it was terminated in 3-4 months, as a result of which the skills component was not covered.⁵⁵</p>	<p>The time span of the program should be closely monitored to understand what works best. More time might be required in Balochistan than Sindh for community mobilization and program implementation given the difficult terrain and cultural constraints</p>
3.	Support to teachers in the field.	<p>In Sindh, the teachers stated that the coordinators had promised to assist them in finding venues to set up learning centers, but later they were told to find the venue themselves. This caused problems as parents were not comfortable about sending their daughters to someone's house. Moreover, they had not received rent from the coordinators as had been promised earlier. Some of the teachers also complained that they had not received pay for the past three months.</p>	<p>The NGOs should ensure that teachers get the desired support to ensure program implementation.</p>

⁵⁵ Interviews with teachers, graduates, community members, ESRA Coordinators, NGOs and field visits

⁵⁶ Source: interviews of teachers

		In certain female centers in Balochistan especially District Chaghi, Qilla Saifullah and Gawadar, the involvement of NGOs seems to have been less than desirable, leaving the teacher with no support when the community did not respond, thus affecting the program adversely. ⁵⁶	
4.	Post program activities carried out	<p>In Balochistan, in three centers of LAFAM that followed the ILM Model, the Family Reading Program had also been started, monitored by literate graduates that had been given mentor training. LRC had also been set up and the original time frame of 3 months for these centers had been extended to 6 months. SEHR also began the program but left it mid-way as the mentors objected to the small stipend of Rs.1500; where LAFAM responded by increasing the stipend, SEHR had rolled up the program. It was felt that female centers were more successful as males were pre-occupied with other issues of earning a livelihood.</p> <p>In Balochistan, post literacy intervention was specifically planned by ILM. So, in its right spirit it could be offered only in the few places ILM model was being used.⁵⁷</p> <p>In Sindh, the community was so motivated that in some of the centres the program was being run on voluntary basis by the teachers.⁵⁸</p>	There is a need to have regular monthly meeting of adult literacy partners in respective districts. These meetings will provide opportunities to all partners to share information on the progress to date and also to share experiences while implementing the program.
5.	Community mobilization	The NGOs mobilized community for raising their awareness about literacy. In Sindh, community mobilization was highly effective, leading to high	The planning for the literacy component, especially Balochistan, needs to be revisited. More time needs to be allocated to

⁵⁷ Source: Field visits, interviews with ESRA coordinators, NGOs, and teachers

⁵⁸ Source: Field visits, interviews with ESRA coordinators, NGOs, and teachers

	<p>motivation and greater achievements as compared to Balochistan. In Sindh, the ownership in the community was high. Some parents of students stated, since they had to drop their daughters to the sessions, they also decided to join the classes and had no regrets. The involvement of political figures in community mobilization could also have accounted for more success in Sindh.</p> <p>In Balochistan, the success of community mobilization was restricted to certain areas. Without the support of the community and the relevant NGO, the teachers left on their own could hardly make any progress and this led to the early closing of several centres. Even in the centers where the learners and teachers showed great interest to re-start the program, they did not feel resourceful enough to run it on their own. It was also felt that the areas where community mobilization had been significantly successful, the outcomes of the learning were also of a higher quality as demonstrated in the graduates.</p> <p>In Balochistan, community mobilization was not so successful where life was exceptionally difficult and people had to make a lot of effort for basic amenities of life like clean water, or where the poverty was overwhelming. It was difficult for people here to relate to the significance of education.</p> <p>However, it can be said that literacy program, where it has been successful has created a sense of the value and need for education in the community.⁵⁹</p>	<p>community mobilization because of the difficult terrain and complex cultural factors than Sindh. At present the community mobilizers only work with teachers and motivate them to join the mobilizers in providing these services. Community mobilization is a specialized field; therefore, it is mandatory to assign this task to an organization with adequate expertise. To achieve success, it is essential to integrate the community mobilization process of PCP and the adult literacy component.</p>
--	--	--

⁵⁹ Source: Field visits, interviews of teachers, graduates and community members and coordinators, observations, NGOs

5.4.3 Stake holders' Involvement, Ownership Building, and Sustainability of the Program

S. No	Factors for Sustainability	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Encouraging spirit of support and volunteerism.	<p>In Sindh at the end of the course, the teachers had been asked to sign 'Help Service' agreement whereby they could continue helping/assisting students for 3 months after completion of the program (without pay). The teachers shared that this initiative had been quite successful and those who had agreed to proceed had been holding classes three-times a week. The teachers were motivated to continue teaching in the learning centers even without RTI support. However, they felt that it would strengthen their capacity if RTI support continued till more awareness and community mobilization had taken place.</p> <p>However, no such initiative was evident in Balochistan, where the communities, inspite of a strong motivation to sustain the program, did not feel capable of running the program, in the absence of any resource books and teaching material that was collected from them by the NGOs.⁶⁰</p>	An important part of the training of the teachers could be to develop resourcefulness in them so that they could be able to run the program on their own after its official completion.
2.	Awareness about importance of literacy and education.	In Sindh, and most of the districts in Balochistan, where the literacy program was successful, the graduates highly appreciated the significance of their literacy skills and were convincing other villagers and friends to	Based on the implementation experience gained so far, there is a need to document these monitoring, evaluation studies and case studies. They should reflect real intensity of

⁶⁰ Source: Field visits, interviews of teachers, graduates and community members, NGOs, ESRA Management

		become literate. In Balochistan, the women showed a deep interest and awareness regarding the need for education for their daughters and lamented the inaccessibility of schools for girls. ⁶¹	change among people, motivation of graduates and their perception after completing graduation, on how they have inculcated this change in their lives.
3.	Capacity of communities to sustain the programs	<p>In Sindh, communities have overwhelmingly welcomed these interventions and have started realizing their impact. Credit goes to RTI team for their efforts to implement this component with all contextual and programmatic complexities. In some areas, centres are being run on a voluntary basis by the teachers. This success could be attributed to the political involvement or comparatively better socio-economic conditions and relatively more exposure of the communities to outside world than Baluchi communities⁶²</p> <p>However, in Balochistan, specifically where access to basic amenities of life involves a lot of struggle, the sustainability of the program remains an issue. This is because of three reasons: firstly, in the face of other urgent issues of living, education seemed hardly relevant to them. Secondly, given the poverty in Balochistan, people did not have the resources to continue the program on their own, even where it was run successfully. Thirdly, since government was not involved in the program implementation, it seems unlikely that they will support the program once ESRA moves out.⁶³</p>	<p>Efforts carried out by communities to own this component should be recognized, and continued support should be extended to consolidate all such efforts.</p> <p>Involvement of district and provincial government could ensure ongoing support to the community for sustaining the program. ESRA initiatives could then be merged with ongoing government programs for literacy development</p>

⁶¹ Source: Interviews of Coordinators ESRA, graduates, teachers and community members

⁶² Source: Interviews of Coordinators ,ESRA Management, graduates, teachers and community members and filed visits

⁶³ Source: Interviews of Provincial and District Government Officials, graduates, teachers and community members and filed visits

4.	Availability of trained teachers.	<p>In Sindh, the teachers shared that in order to make up on the shortage of teachers, especially in rural areas, complete training was not given to all the teachers. Some were inducted to teach without any training. This had caused initial problems for the teachers. However, their initial qualifications were better than teachers in Balochistan as they ranged from Intermediate to Masters.</p> <p>In Balochistan, the teachers were less educated (Matric-Intermediate) and the training of the teachers also appeared to be haphazard.⁶⁴</p>	A proper record of all trained teachers should be maintained by the DG and these should be effectively utilized.
5.	Government as a stakeholder	<p>In Sindh, there seems to be much more ownership and interest displayed by the government than in Balochistan.</p> <p>In Balochistan, there seemed to be hardly any ownership of the literacy program by the government. The district and provincial government officials showed either unawareness about the program or disinterest. They shared that they were hardly involved in the program nor were they updated about the progress of the program. As a result they could not make any meaningful contribution towards it.⁶⁵</p>	There seems to be a strong need to involve the government to a greater degree in the program so that support systems are built for the community to sustain the program when ESRA leaves.

⁶⁴ Source: Interviews of teachers

⁶⁵ ESRA district management, district and provincial government officials

5.5 Impact and Outcomes

In the 'ESRA Program Descriptions' the overall program target reported was 40,000 literacy graduates. Out of these 39508 literacy graduates are reported enrolled, while 19781 as graduated at the end of RFA 1. The results of RFA 2 are still awaited.⁶⁶ However, the target of 4000 graduates in Chaghi is yet to be initiated. In the Performance Management Plan, provided by ESRA RTI , the project target is stated as 62,692 for 2005. Out of these a target of 45477 has been reported achieved.

The literacy program also has some significant achievements to its credit. The results of the literacy assessment were quite good, particularly in Sindh. The results from Balochistan, though not so good, were also quite encouraging (see Appendix K & L). The assessments of the literacy graduates were carried out in three areas: reading, writing and mathematics. The test carried 100 marks and was divided into three sections: reading, writing, and mathematic. The writing section was allocated 50 % marks; reading section was given 30% marks and the mathematics section was allocated 20 % marks. The allocation of marks was made on the basis of the skills needed to complete the task. The writing section required the learners to write five sentences on a given topic; the reading section expected the learners to read a simple passage in Urdu / Sindhi and answer referential questions; the mathematics section required the learners to attempt two-digit subtraction and addition sums. The results indicate that the literacy graduates from Sindh scored higher with a range of score 40-100 %, than the literacy graduates in Baluchistan where the range was from 10-100%.

In Sindh and most of the parts in Balochistan, there was a noticeable demonstration of confidence, a sense of awareness and empowerment by the graduates. There was also a positive attitude displayed towards the need of education in general and female education in specific. The religious component seems to have played an integral role in the popularity and acceptance of the program, specifically in more conservative areas like Balochistan, where western interventions are traditionally eyed with suspicion.

In Sindh, the literacy program succeeded in inspiring people to the extent that they tried to run the program on a voluntary basis, after the expiry of the official time. In Balochistan also the program was popular in most districts. Some communities like some centres in Turbat, tried to run the program on their own but could not do so, as they lacked resources to continue, and in the absence of any support their efforts fizzled out.

The literacy program was apparently more successful in Sindh than in Balochistan. This could have been primarily due to a number of reasons. Firstly the political involvement in Sindh, proved to be a very successful strategy that was lacking in Balochistan. This generated whole hearted support from the communities in Sindh. Once the program was endorsed and supported by local political leaders who commanded respect, trust and authority in the masses, the positive response of the community followed

* Source: ESRA Program Description Report

easily. However, in Balochistan the program was run in a political vacuum. With no clear signals from those in power, the highly conservative communities who traditionally mistrusted the foreign interventions only responded slowly and sporadically. Unlike Sindh, when ESRA moved out the community in Balochistan had little support to sustain the program on their own.

5.6 Sustainability

The prospects of the sustainability of youth and adult literacy program seem to be much stronger in Sindh than in Balochistan. This is evident in the running of the literacy program by the communities in Sindh after ESRA withdrawal. The ownership engendered in Sindh could be attributed to the interest shown by political figures. Since the government officials and political figures were involved, the probability for the literacy program to sustain seems to be fairly strong. The cultural receptiveness of the communities, effective community mobilization and the socio-economic circumstances were all positive factors indicating the ownership of the program. These very reasons at the other end of the continuum could be accounted for making sustainability of the program an issue in Balochistan.

In Balochistan, sustainability seems to be an issue because of different factors: firstly, there was hardly any ownership of the program shared by the government officials. Since there had been little sharing and involvement of these people during the implementation of the program, it seems unlikely that the government would make an effort to continue the program. Secondly, given the poor socio-economic status of the communities in Balochistan, people find it very difficult to relate to the importance of education, where bare survival saps their energy. Even where the program was very successful, the communities have found it difficult to sustain the program because of lack of resources. This would even be more difficult, in the absence of any endorsement and appreciation of their efforts.

Another important factor to influence sustainability in Balochistan could be the insufficient time for community mobilization. The highly conservative culture, the difficult terrain and long distances demanded much more time. The socio-cultural and socio- historical background of the tribal communities of Balochistan is very different from Sindh and needs to be carefully considered. Since strong tribal affiliations dictate the life of communities and the decisions of Balochi communities, an effort to involve tribal leaders on one hand and the government on the other, could multiply the probability for the program to sustain.

5.7 Limitations of the study

The time period for the data collection made it difficult for the research team to contact all of the relevant people. This also made it impossible to get a large sample for the assessments of graduates. Though all efforts were made but given the setting, the assessments could hardly be undertaken in ideal conditions. In Balochistan, the team was not fully conversant with the language of the communities in certain areas, so facilitation had to be done by a member of ESRA management or the teacher present.

5.8 Conclusion

In broader terms, adult literacy component of ESRA program has received impressive results. Considering the difficult and daunting terrain of Balochistan, the outreach of the program and its high effectiveness is commendable. Though communities were mobilized to a large extent, the effectiveness of this component can be increased if integrated with PCP or other ESRA components.

There are a host of PNGOs engaged in this component with their inherent institutional capacities and vision for the program. There seems to be various implementation gaps identified and reported earlier. These gaps can only be reduced through effective monitoring and transparent third party validation. Secondly, there is a need for regular coordination between PNGOs, RTI and district government.

From the perspective of sustainability, a well defined institutional framework should be established at grass root level. For this purpose, measures should be taken to develop capacities of communities and their representative institution. Similarly, out of box thinking should be applied for adult literacy concept and it should be aligned with the global practices.

6. PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP

6.1 Background

In order to promote a culture of corporate giving for public education, RTI, working through the Pakistan Centre for Philanthropy (PCP) attempted to broker a small number of PPPs in its target districts by mobilizing corporate resources for improvement activities in selected public schools. The program has evolved in two phases. In Phase I (June 2003-December 20, 04), the focus was on establishing partnerships with the corporate partners and encouraging them to adopt schools. PCP was able to get the five corporate partners to commit approximately. US\$ 287,164.00 for school improvement in Phase I. Phase II (January 2005-June 2006) is focusing on sustaining the partnerships created in phase I, creating new partnerships, and assisting the government to develop frameworks for encouraging corporate philanthropy to support improvement in the quality of schools.

However, this initiative of public private partnership has been taken only in Sindh, and not in Balochistan. In Thatta district two corporate sector institutions have entered into contract with RTI through PCP and District Government, i.e. Dewan Mushtaq Group and Thatta Cement. The former adopted 12 schools in two Talukas, i.e. Mirpur Bathoro and Sujawal. Thatta Cement adopted 8 schools in Taluka Thatta. Dewan Mushtaq group contributed Rs. 5.8 Million (\$100,000) for 12 adopted schools and Thatta Cement contributed Rs. 850,000 (\$ 14,655) for 8 adopted schools during this period. The tripartite agreement between Dewan Mushtaq Group, PCP, and District Government will lapse in 2009.

6.2 Objective

The overarching objective of ESRA's PPP component is to put in place and functionalize mechanisms and systems for creating an enabling environment for public-private partnerships.

The objectives of the PPP sub-component are to: 1) mobilize the local corporate entities to give money for school improvement and 2) to help government develop frameworks for encouraging corporate philanthropies to contribute to school improvement.

6.3 Areas Targeted for Study

In this sector the study aimed to analyze the financial benefits of the public-private partnership to the district education budget. In this respect the following areas were to be examined:

- Status of cooperation between private companies and schools (established through RTI in 2004).
- Whether the district education staff was aware of the financial benefits to the district from these agreements.
- Whether the community was aware of the benefits of this partnership for their schools.
- The progress made for reviving the regulatory framework that governs public private partnerships.

The study focused mainly on the status of cooperation and the community's awareness of the benefits of this partnership.

6.4 Findings and Recommendations

6.4.1 Status of Cooperation between the Private Companies and Schools

S. No	Aspects / Areas	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Imparting training to teachers	The Principal of DMG School was of the opinion that needs assessment of teachers should be carried out before imparting training to government school teachers. For instance, instead of focusing on new teaching methodology, emphasis should be given first on Early Childhood Education and then develop them according to the new teaching methodology. In this background Dewan Mushtaq Group designed their own training based on the needs assessment of teachers and imparted 3 months training to mentors (session was held from November to February) followed by post training assessment in February. There was a visible change among teachers, evident through the post-training assessment. The teachers were more comfortable in having ECE component in training, as this would improve their skills to impart education by considering child psychology.	Teacher training should be linked with needs assessment of teachers and there should be a proper post-training need assessment followed by continuous monitoring of teachers.
2.	Improving the quality of education	First, public primary school teachers are not regular and they are not willing to change their approach towards school. Secondly, there is a strong teacher union in Sindh that	Schools should be de-linked with all sorts of political influences as there is a need to strengthen SMCs. Teacher hiring/transfer should be purely based on merit. In case of

Submitted by:

Anjum Asim Shahid Rahman, Chartered Accountants

		creates hurdles in the smooth functioning of the school. They directly interfere in appointments and transfers of teachers. Since there is a ban on teacher appointment, there is a huge dearth of quality teachers at primary schools. Thirdly, the adopter provides teachers in the schools and also develops their capacity. Teacher performance in school is monitored to ensure the quality of education. On the other hand, the government teachers are not supportive in realizing this achievement. Despite various complaints to the department of education, the officials are not responding either in transferring of teachers nor taking disciplinary action against them.	non-performing public teachers, the adopter should be entitled to request transfer of such teacher to department of education, and such requests should be entertained in a timely manner by the government department. This matter should be part of the formal agreement between the three parties.
3.	Representation and say on the SMC	As per agreement corporate representative (adopter) will be the patron of SMC and have signatory status for SMC's account. However, in real terms, the adopter doesn't have any such rights. Secondly, SMCs are not functioning in accordance with the rules and regulations prescribed in the government ordinance. Moreover, at present, the adopter cannot contribute in enhancing effectiveness of SMC, nor can they offer any training to them.	Promised role of adopters in the SMCs should be restored and their role as ensuring transparency and accountability into the affairs of SMC should be ensured.
4.	Monitoring and following of schools	In the initial period of implementation PCP and Dewan Mushtaq Group hired the services of Heaven group: a local NGO working in Thatta for monitoring and follow-up of schools in the respective area. Till the	Either by the adopter or through an NGO, there is a strong need to establish and effectively and meaningfully monitoring the mechanism. This mechanism should ensure quality of education. The process and

		<p>time they were on board, two representatives of Heaven Group carried out the effective monitoring. During these monitoring sessions both teachers and students were monitored for the quality of education and how much interest the students were taking in the classes. In case of any gap, feedback to teachers was provided.</p> <p>After Heaven left, two persons from Dewan Mushtaq Group are performing the monitoring of these schools. Within the group there is a strong feeling to activate effective monitoring for these schools.</p>	<p>approach of monitoring along with its outcomes should be documented and share among all stakeholders.</p>
5.	Strong adaptor role	<p>In real terms the adopter is providing financial resources to improve the physical infrastructure of the adopted schools, providing teachers training and also providing teachers for the school. Teaching aids and materials for students and teachers were also the responsibility of the adopters. They are not allowed to contribute in SMC affairs nor can they ask the government department of education to transfer teachers in case of non-compliance with responsibilities.</p>	<p>The adopters should have some reasonable say in the matters of SMC, as they are providing resources to schools both in financial and human terms. The role of the adopter in SMC affairs should be to ensure transparency and accountability as manifested in the government ordinance. Teacher training should be linked with needs assessment of teachers and there should be a proper post-training need assessment followed by continuous monitoring of teachers.</p>
6.	The issue of sustainability	<p>On the issue of sustainability i.e. what will be the status of these schools after 2009, there was no clear response from the adopter. They were of the views that this issue must be raised with PCP and RTI. However, stating their view about sustainability, they said that</p>	<p>The adopters should also be allowed to develop the capacities of the SMC members and create a democratic culture in these institutions. Before the phasing out of the adopter, serious efforts should be carried out to ensure maturity of SMC as an institution,</p>

		<p>unless communities become strong enough to take complete ownership of the school, this partnership should continue. There should be a strong element of support provided to SMC, so that they become mature enough, have real representation of the community, and have capacities in management and planning (particularly in school context).</p>	<p>which is capable of representing a community and has adequate capacity to own and implement education institutions. The RTI should develop their own program strategy for PPP, its outcomes and processes, and what is expected from the implementing partners. Secondly, this strategy should have a clear direction and approach about the phasing out of RTI and also of the Corporate Adopter. Strategy should address benchmarks and indicators to be achieved by the Corporate Adopter in 2009.</p> <p>Various options can be considered regarding sustainability of schools once the adopter phases out. For instance, a mature community could take over the responsibility of school ownership and management. The second option could be to link these schools with local market associations which will provide financial assistance to these schools.</p>
--	--	--	--

6.4.2 Community's awareness about the benefits of the partnership for their schools

S. No	Aspects / Areas	Current Status	Recommendations
1.	Provision of improved education facilities.	After adopting schools, people of the village have realized the impact of this investment and the gains the village is getting from better and improved education facilities. After one year of its completion, new	In order to have a real impact of the PPP component, there is a need to have a proper approach towards community mobilization, and involvement of parents in schools through the forum of SMC.

		thinking has emerged within the village regarding importance of education and community involvement in school affairs.	
2.	Realization about the role of education in improving learning standards.	Communities are becoming aware and realizing the role of better education in improving the living standards. However, they still need mobilization and support to become active and functional. PPP has just completed one year of its implementation. In the next couple of years, it is expected that communities will become more receptive and start owning the schools.	Though communities have realized the importance of education and need for improving the school environment, they need support in terms of capacity and an enhanced role through a forum (SMC) in these schools.

6.4.3 Progress made for reviewing the regulatory framework that governs public private partnership

S. No	Aspects / Areas	Current Status	Recommendation
1.	Assisting the federal government to develop policies, frameworks and operational guidelines for implementing PPPs.	The development of policies, frameworks and national guidelines for the government is currently underway. RTI's partner, Pakistan Centre for Philanthropy, has recently held several meetings with the federal and provincial education departments and made a presentation at the provincial inter-ministerial meeting. Based on their recommendations, ESRA has commissioned a senior consultant to develop national operational policy on PPPs; the work on guidelines and frameworks for PPP's is also underway.	The most important factor and contributing in realising sustainability of PPP component is the revival of the policy framework for PPP, with the consensus of all stakeholders. Both RTI and PCP have adequate information and experience in dealing with corporate adopters. Similarly, adopters and district governments have gained meaningful experience while working with each other. This policy framework should detail the role, responsibility, and liabilities of each stakeholder, spelling out ingredients of sustainability, coupled with institutional maturity of SMC.

6.5 Impact and Outcomes

Through its partner NGO, Pakistan Centre for Philanthropy, RTI has triggered and supported five model PPPs in Thatta and Ghotki districts of Sindh. Under these partnerships, an equal number of corporate entities have adopted 47 primary schools. These corporate adopters have supported, financially and by other means, physical, social and human resource improvement activities in these schools. The partnerships are at various stages of completion and are being used by the program for demonstration and creation of new PPPs (see [Appendix M](#)).

The five PPPs brokered during 2004/05 have generated substantial corporate interest and resources for primary education in some of the most backward districts of Sindh: i.e. Thatta and Ghotki. It has also brought together corporate entities and local education departments for undertaking initiatives that, on the one hand, meet the social responsibility obligations of the former and improve service delivery on the other. Since these partnerships are less than a year old, it will take some more time – about two to three years – before their effectiveness can be properly assessed.

It is encouraging to note that RTI has appointed a consultant to devise operational guidelines to enable PPPs around government primary school. These guidelines are aimed at defining the roles and responsibilities of the corporate adopter vis-à-vis the SMCs and the department of education.

Other than the performance of the government teachers in adopted schools, there seems to be positive cooperation between the corporate adopter and the school. However, in matters related to SMC, there is a need to revisit the model, with enhanced role of the adopter in SMC affairs.

In areas where schools were adopted, both SMC and communities are aware of the interventions and have realized the benefits of this partnership, and lend support through provision of their resources in terms of land as well as for improvement of the school physical infrastructure.

6.6 Limitation of the Study

Since it's a sample study, it was not possible for the consultant to visit all schools in PPP component and have meeting with all SMC representatives. However, a comprehensive meeting with concerned stakeholders was held in Thatta District. Findings of that have been reflected in the main report.

Secondly, this study was supposed to be time bound and as agreed with the donor data gathering was supposed to be covered within that time frame. It was not possible to cover all areas that falls in PPP component.

6.7 Conclusion

The corporate adopters' prime objective is to invest in profitable means and get returns over investment. Provision of basic facilities which includes education and health falls in the domain of public sector. Investing in education and health by the private sector is some sort of social service. The

idea of public private partnership was to create positive collaboration between two sectors of the society in making education and health sector more accessible and providing quality services. Ultimately, the school will remain public property and government will have to support them on continuous basis, even with or without the corporate adopter.

If the corporate sector shows a willingness to adopt schools then the corporate adopter should be provided with enough space to demonstrate the impact and difference in these schools. Getting financial and human resources from the adopter for a given number of years is not a practical approach unless they are allowed to strengthen communities and institutions so that they become mature enough to develop links with other local institutions, like market associations.

At present the tripartite agreement expects a lot from the corporate adopter and in return is the little support extended to them in creating a better education environment in the school and in improving the quality of education. In order to realize the effectiveness and meaningful impact of the PPP component, it will be pertinent to accept the adopters' role in SMC affairs and supporting them to help create better school environment and by ensuring a supportive attitude by public teachers. Effective monitoring should be carried out by RTI through district offices to ensure successful implementation.

6.8 Identification of Issues by Senior Management of ESRA

The issues identified by senior management of ESRA through interviews and self-evaluation questionnaires were similar to those identified by other stakeholders of ESRA. These included a) administration and management issues particularly inaccurate and flawed data, frequent transfer of education officials trained by ESRA, and lack of inter-departmental coordination between Education and Finance & Planning Departments, thus leading to problems in planning and budgeting ; b) lack of follow-ups; c) inadequate budgetary allocations by public sector institutions making the development activities almost entirely donor dependent; d) low government confidence in communities and their integrity and reluctance to trust them with money thus creating problems with opening bank accounts specially in remote areas where people don't have new ID cards; e) non-availability of cash grants to cover all the schools in the intervention districts; f) bureaucracy of ESRA that has made it difficult to move forward with work plan at times (i.e. hiring staff); g) lack of flexibility in a constantly changing environment such as ESRA's centralized protocol that led to delays; h) monitoring and Evaluation visits by ESRA District staff not clearly understood nor culturally sensitive; i) unclear communication between The Asia Foundation (TAF) and World Education about certification of learners and final release of funds to partner NGOs; j) hiring of qualified female staff to work in remote areas; k) overestimation by NGOs of their capacity levels to deliver literacy services to such a large number of learners; l) issues with social extremists in Noshki and Chaghi that made it more challenging to work with rural women; m) irregular attendance of learners due to harvesting seasons, extreme weather and migration; n) problems in fiscal flow from the provinces to the districts resulting in delays in implementation of education plans; o) lack of Districts ability to generate any

resources or to block grants transferred from the provinces leading to limited finances for the education sector for development activities.

The recommendations by ESRA Program Directors highlighted the need: **a)** to work more closely with the provincial and district education departments and find ways to get their endorsement in each intervention so as to develop government's ownership and will pave way for a sustainable PDI; **b)** to create a line for professional development in district education budgets so that there are funds available in the districts to plan and offer their own professional development; **c)** to provide some incentives to generate a demand for professional development amongst teachers; **d)** to provide incentives that can link to teacher career ladder, or can simply be in the form of some recognition to help elevate the status of teachers; **e)** to recognize the role of mentors/SSTs that is required to ensure provision for classroom based support to teachers; **f)** to cover 100% of the schools in the districts that ESRA is working in so as to address the issues of 'equity'; **g)** to follow a 'process' approach of improving and fine tuning of all of ESRA components for greater harmony and impact; **h)** to 'localize'; formats and models with local individual and commercial interests in PCP so that these models can be replicated in remote, rural areas of the country that do not have corporate neighbours; **i)** for interface between provinces and districts on various education related issues such as, teachers' training the post devolution period; **j)** more funding and more time to be given to train qualified female staff for promotion of literacy; **k)** increased focus on post-literacy programming from inception of the program in terms of increased funds and time; **l)** linkages with formal school to be established and a certificate of graduation from an accredited literacy program to help open up opportunities for learners' transition into formal schooling programs; **m)** Increased focus on two key areas: health and micro-enterprise (for well-being and income generation); **n)** Improved communication between implementing partner; **o)** Increased integration at a district level; **p)** improved monitoring/evaluation activities that includes capacity building for those monitors who are visiting field sites (see Appendix-O).

LIST OF APPENDICES

- Appendix-A Research Framework
- Appendix-B Research Instruments
- Appendix-C Study Samples
- Appendix-D ESRA Program Achievements for PCP in Sindh
- Appendix-E ESRA Program Achievements for PCP in Baluchistan
- Appendix-F ESRA Program Achievements for PDI in Sindh
- Appendix-G ESRA Program Achievements for PDI in Baluchistan
- Appendix-H Survey Results for PDI
- Appendix-I ESRA Program Achievements for Literacy in Sindh
- Appendix-J ESRA Program Achievements for Literacy in Baluchistan
- Appendix-K Assessments of Literacy Graduates in Sindh
- Appendix-L Assessments of Literacy Graduates in Baluchistan
- Appendix-M ESRA Program Achievements for PPP
- Appendix-N Case Studies
- Appendix-O Self Evaluation Questionnaire
- Appendix-P Approved Data Collection Tools
- Appendix-Q People Consulted/Interviewed
- Appendix-R Documents Consulted and Bibliography
- Appendix-S Filed Visit Slides