

FINAL EVALUATION

of

**“Emergency program to assist
the vulnerable people in
LIBAN Woreda, Borena Zone of Oromia Regional State
FILTU Woreda, Liben Zone of Somali Regional State”**

Funded by USAID OFDA

June 2002

By: Carlo Maconi

Index of contents

1	SUMMARY	1
2	BACK GROUND	3
2.1	GOVERNMENT/POLICY SUPPORT	3
2.2	FEATURES OF THE SUB SECTOR	3
2.3	BENEFICIARIES & PARTIES INVOLVED	3
2.4	PROBLEMS TO BE ADDRESSED	5
2.5	OTHER INTERVENTIONS	6
2.6	DOCUMENTATION AVAILABLE	7
3	INTERVENTION ACHIEVED	8
3.1	OVERALL OBJECTIVE	8
3.2	PROJECT PURPOSE	8
3.3	RESULTS	8
3.4	EFFECTIVENESS	13
3.5	OVERALL OUTCOME AND IMPACT	13
3.6	ACTIVITIES	15
4	ASSUMPTION	16
5	IMPLEMENTATION	17
5.1	ORGANIZATION AND IMPLEMENTATION PROCEDURES	17
5.2	TIMETABLE	17
5.3	COSTS AND FINANCING PLAN	18
5.4	SPECIAL CONDITIONS/ACCOMPANYING MEASURES TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT	18
6	SUSTAINABILITY	19
6.1	POLICY SUPPORT	19
6.2	APPROPRIATE TECHNOLOGY	19
6.3	SOCIO CULTURAL ASPECTS	19
6.4	INSTITUTIONAL AND MANAGEMENT CAPACITY	20
7	MONITORING & EVALUATION	22
7.1	DEFINITION OF INDICATORS	22
7.2	REVIEWS/EVALUATION	22
8	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMANDATIONS	22

1 SUMMARY

COOPI is an International Non Governmental Organization based in Italy-Milan. In Ethiopia COOPI is working since 1995 and it's headquarter is located in Addis Ababa.

Among the different projects that COOPI has been implementing in draught affected areas of the country like Somali Region and low land part of Oromiya Region, the project entitled by "Emergency program to assist vulnerable people in Liben Zone-Somali National Regional state and Borena Zone-Oromia regional state" was funded by USAID/OFDA is one.

The project is located and implemented in the Oromo National Regional State - Borena Zone, Liben Woreda that is located at 690 km south of Addis Ababa, and in Somali regional state Liben Zone, Filtu Woreda that is found about 810 Km south of Addis Ababa.

Filtu Woreda is one of the three Woreda of Liben Zone in Somali National Regional State and lies in tropical climate Zone. It is bordered by Borena Zone of Oromia region (Region 4) in the West, Genale River in the North, Dolo Woreda in the Southeast and river Dawa in the South. The total land area of Filtu district is estimated to be 17,000 km². The altitude related climate is hot, grouped under "Kolla" climatic Zone. Two rainy seasons generally occur; the long rains of the mid March to May locally called "GUU" and the short rains occurring from October to November called locally "Dyer". The mean annual rainfall is between 300-500 mm.

Liben Woreda is one of the twelve Woreda of Borena Zone Oromia Regional State. It is accessible with all weather gravel road to Addis Ababa. It is bordered by Liben Zone Somali Region in the East, Dawa River in the West & South and Wadera Woreda in the North.

In all these areas the majority of the population depends on animal husbandry and on small scale farming for living in both the districts

Social services, including health facilities, schools, markets, agricultural and veterinary services, and credit institutions, are inaccessible, very limited, or too distant from the villages to be of functional use to households. However, one of the major constraints to livestock production and ultimately household livelihood security is the availability of water for human and animal consumption.

The project started in June 2000 and phased out on April 5, 2002, after the request of extensions, due to issues related to the Haydimtu borehole construction.

The main aspects covered by the project were represented by water activities with the construction of hand dug wells and the excavation and the accomplishing of two boreholes. These interventions were planned according to the geological

surveys carried out in past projects and based on the past knowledge of the areas plus additional information collected during the implementation of this one.

These activities were planned with the collaboration of the available departments in Addis Ababa and Negele town, and followed the present Governmental Guidelines realized by Governmental Institutions, Non- Governmental Organizations and local communities.

The Final Evaluation Report aims to demonstrate the coherence between the activities carried out and the requested budget expenses.

This report aims also to evaluate the correspondence between the original proposal and the operational issues:

- To assess the accomplishment Vs the plan, which help to distinguish the performance of the project;
- To assess the technical performance of the project implementation;
- To provide the out come of the evaluation to all the stakeholders involved in the project;
- To propose new suggestions for the sustainability of the project and /or new projects;
- To set forth the main problems encountered and the final results;
- To justify, explain and eventually to examine critically the different changes occurred in the project from the beginning up to its expiry date.

The specific activities under taken during the evaluation period includes:

- Assessment of the achievements of the project with planned activities (i.e. Plan Vs Accomplishment);
- Assess the impact of the project in terms of complementing the development effort of the regions;
- Asses the efficiency, efficiency, and effectiveness of the monitoring and reporting system of the project;
- Assess the adaptability, sustainability of the activities and out puts of the project.

This Final Evaluation Report is addressed to the Donor of the project, USAID-OFDA, and to the implementing agency (it can also be disclosed to stakeholders if necessary). This document has been drawn from 2nd April 2002 to 3rd June 2002. It has been prepared by the geologist Mr Carlo Maconi.

2 BACK GROUND

2.1 Government/policy support

The government of Ethiopia announced an economic reform program that forecasted doubling of income per capita in the planned 15 years of time. The basic strategy to achieve this programme was believed to be agriculture that is the main economic sector of the country.

The goals aimed to achieve this program were; increment of food production, promote trade from productive areas of the country to the most vulnerable areas to stabilize market price, encourage small enterprises, and diversify the agriculture and improve the health and productivity of livestock.

At the moment a special attention is given from International Organization like European Union to understand if governmental lines are applied in the project areas. These are asking collaboration to NGOs and Govern for the constitution of a clear picture of the situation about Ethiopian lows.

2.2 Features of the sub sector

The 1999 rainfall of "Hagaya short rain season" of the two areas was erratic, very low, late and unsatisfactory; the monthly rainfall registered was 28.9 mm while the first three months mean rainfall was 14.2. The alternative ways of fetching water in the area were the available hand dug wells and small number of boreholes of which most were dry due to the above reason. Natural depressions and ponds were with out water; because of less quantity the traditional 'ellas' were not in a good condition to support the community.

Besides these the severe physical condition of cattle's brought a less price in the market while the price of food grains increased. From early warning report price of cows dropped by 71% while that of food grains increased by 125%.

Consequently people in all areas were obliged to travel one to two days in search of water for human and livestock consumption and also migration of community members to nearby areas. Peoples were in need of frequent assistance in terms of improving the water and food sector of the area.

2.3 Beneficiaries & parties involved

The donor

USAID/OFDA is part of U.S Agency for International Development (USAID) Bureau for humanitarian response. Its mandate is to save lives, reduce human suffering and mitigate the economic impact of natural and man-made disaster worldwide. Its unique role is to coordinate international disaster assistance for the U S government.

OFDA funds are available for:

- Disaster relief
- Rehabilitation
- Prevention, mitigation and preparedness.

OFDA assists the vulnerable people through its collaboration with implementing partners, as Private Voluntary Organizations (PVOs)/ Non Governmental Organizations (NGOs), which help OFDA to achieve its strategic objectives of:

- Meeting the critical needs of targeted vulnerable population in emergency situation, and
- Increased adoption of mitigation measures in countries at greatest risk of natural and manmade disaster.

The implementing agency

Cooperazione Internazionale (COOPI) is an International NGO, operating in Ethiopia since 1994. In 1995, it opened its office in Negele to coordinate a rehabilitation project funded by European Union under the rehabilitation budget line. Beside this, COOPI also opened its Filtu office in 1998 to coordinate part of a project named Filtu Borena water project funded by European Union under Food Security budget line.

Hitherto, COOPI is implementing water and agriculture projects in Oromia Region (Borena Zone Liben Woreda) and Somali Region (Liben Zone Filtu Woreda). The USAID funded project entitled “Emergency program to assist vulnerable People in Liben Woreda, Borena Zone of Oromia Regional State and Filtu Woreda, Liben Zone of Somali Regional State” with the purposes of constructing 1 bore hole with motorized units, construction of pumping system and water scheme for one bore hole, 2 hand dug wells with hand pumps and 1 hand-dug well with solar pump, which are under the full management of the community after the completion.

Local counterparts

- Offices of Oromia and Somali National Regional States
- Water Department of Borena Zone
- Zonal DPPD of Borena and Liben Zones

Target group

Parts of the population of Liben and Borena Zones of Somali and Oromia Regional State respectively were the target group of the project. Specifically Filtu District of Liben Zone Somali Region and Liben District of Borena Zone Oromia Region are the main target areas of the project with the respective community living in.

The communities are pastoralist mainly based on extensive animal husbandry, which is characterised by seasonal movement and herd diversification. Thus their

livelihood is dependent on livestock and livestock products. They are also shifting to agro pastoralist way of living as a coping strategy to the recurrent food shortage.

2.4 Problems to be addressed

Table 1 Problem identification table in the project areas

Type of problem	Priority
Shortage of water for livestock and human consumption	1
Human health problem	2
Animal health problem	3
Lack of access to education	4
Decline of range land and problem of feed	5
Food security	6
Non-availability of physical infrastructure	7
Unfavourable terms of trade between livestock and grain	8
Non-availability of livestock marketing centre	9
Tribal conflict	10

The situation of both Liben & Borena rangelands, suffered from recurrent shortage of rainfall since the 1970s. Main results coming from these conditions had a negative socio-economic impact in all the area:

- Serious depletion of water and pasture,
- Migration of people to distant places with their animals,
- Widespread livestock deaths,
- Decline in milk production,
- Human food shortage,
- Deterioration of market prices.

Increased human population together with high livestock concentration and insufficient permanent water point are the main causes for the precarious situation of this particular area that force the population to depend on food distribution activities. These activities linked with the particular situation of the area, had aggravated the existing health problems like high prevalence of malnutrition, diet disorders, and precarious condition of life that are only some of the indicators testifying the consequences of relief approach.

Past activities tried to solve the problem of water scarcity but they were still not sufficient to cover the request of urban centres like Filtu town that showed in the last year a total absence of water in the existing infrastructures.

2.5 Other interventions

Table 2 NGOs working in the intervention area

N O	Organizati on	Description	Project area	Activities
1	PCAE	Local NGO	Filtu, Dolo, Afdhere	Livestock health –veterinary, Human health , water development, Training, Micro-financing, Sanitation, Emergency Programs-relief Food and items distribution, water rationing, early warning, advocacy, education.
2	SCF/USA	Internationa l NGO	Dolo	Veterinary, Human health, training, Emergency –food and items distribution early warning.
3	SCF/USA	Internationa l NGO	Liben & Arero	Water development, Livestock, health, Human health, education, training, early warning, Emergency-food and items distributed.
4	NCA	Internationa l NGO	Filtu & Afdhere	Emergency-food & items distribution & water tankering
5	SOS- Sahel/UK	Internationa l NGO	Liben, Arero & Yebello	Programme focus on Forest management and livelihood diversification
6	GTZ/BLP DP	Bilateral Organizatio n	Liben, Dirre, Moyale &Yebello	Livestock health, Veterinary Human health, water development, Agriculture, Natural resource conservation, capacity building, training, Micro-financing, Emergency programs-relief food & items distribution, restocking, early warning, advocacy, education.
7	AMRF	Internationa l NGO	Filtu & Afdhere	Human health-capacity building of the local health institutions.
8	EESMY/S ES	Local	Liben, Kibremen gist,Bore, Dire,Arer o,Yabelo, Moyale etc.	Study on water availability and HIV/AIDS program.
9	MSF	Internationa l NGO	Arero, Udet	Health & nutrition

2.6 Documentation available

The documents looked up for the realization of this evaluation were:

- USAID Quarterly Reports
- Project Proposal “Emergency program to assist the vulnerable people in Liben Woreda and Filtu Woreda” Addis Ababa, April 2000
- “PRA selection beneficiaries method” 1999
- Geological and Hydro-geological survey – COOPI
- “Capacity-Building – An approach to People-Centered Development” Deborah Eade – Oxfam UK 1997
- “Social Survey Methods – A field guide for development workers” Paul Nichols – Oxfam UK 1991
- “Monitoring and Evaluation” Save the Children

3 INTERVENTION ACHIEVED

3.1 Overall objective

The overall objective of this project is to alleviate the emergency situation in the project area i.e. Liben Woreda of Borena Zone and Filtu Woreda of Liben Zone.

3.2 Project purpose

The main purpose of the project is to increase the availability of water in the project area with the following outputs expected:

- Improved water quality
- Increased number of water resources,
- Hand dug wells and boreholes properly functioning

3.3 Results

The comparison between activities and results (efficiency) will be analyzed within the next paragraphs.

Geological/Hydro-geological survey

The geological and hydro-geological surveys were carried out through field visits and the use of material like aerial photographs, vertical electrical soundings (VES) survey, pumping test, water analysis and all the available material collected from experiences of the organization in this area. The collected material was important for the development of the geological report that the organization was implementing.

COOPI is cooperating with national and local departments to update the collection of “experiences” that the different NGOs acquired in these areas for the realization of a general geological database at national level.

Construction of hand dug wells

In the project, the construction of three (3) hand-dug wells was planned. One of these was equipped with solar system.

In the hand-dug well planned with solar system it was noticed a technical problem that forced the organization to install (until the delivery of the solar equipping that arrived in Addis Ababa at the end of December 2001) a motor pump for almost the whole duration of the project.

This solar system was installed respecting technical parameters concerning quantity of water and social aspects of the area. The performances of this apparatus are good although some problems that occur during the summertime (cloudy period) when the sun insulation is weak and the system pumps less water.

In the other hand-dug wells, the situation encountered during this evaluation noticed a scarce attention of the beneficiaries and the committees formed for the management of these (i.e. Grass grew in the surrounding of the pump, the soak away system stuck, etc.).

All the HDW were located keeping into due consideration the technical aspect as well as the social one. According to the interviews made, the sites were finally selected only if the commitment of the local community was strong.

Problems of rocks’ hardness forced the organization to abandon a just selected place (Adesa) with some delay of the activities as consequences.

Realization and maintenance of boreholes

Drilling of one borehole with water schemes in Haydimtu and purchasing of spare parts for pumps and generators for Seru and Qurale boreholes were planned in the project proposal. The purchase was thought to be done during the procurement of the equipment for Haydimtu. The procurement then became very late and lastly difficult when the result of the Haydimtu borehole was found unsatisfactory. The following reasons can be given:

- Haydimtu borehole failed;
- To cover the expenditure of Haydimtu borehole the organization used all the allocated budget planned for the boreholes;
- The organization did not consider the purchase of all the material

At the end of the project when things were clearly delineated, a backup generator for the whole area of Filtu, which include 5 working boreholes, was purchased. This can be used in case of failures of the existing ones. The idea can be considered strategically correct (in accordance the area conditions) even if it came very late

During the project period, the Qurale PA water scheme was successfully accomplished with the construction of a generator house and distribution superstructures (like animal trough, water point, excavation and installing of water line to the animal trough and water point etc), installation of a submersible pump and other accessories for the pumping scheme. After the scheme started functioning, the organization began a consolidation program related to social and technical aspects through training, visits, informal exchanges, etc.

The planned time for the accomplishment of this water scheme noticed a month of delay (the office of the organization was closed in Filtu District) caused by a conflict between Somali and Oromo clans together with the misunderstanding between COOPI office and Zonal counterparts.

The drilling of Haydimtu borehole was accomplished on March 2002, but at that time, the result of the well was found negative. This situation pushed the organization, in agreement with the donor, to stop the digging. The construction of related superstructures of the same was left.

During the life of the project, problems with respect to the agreements with drilling company were recorded: two different times the mobilizations were planned with a national company (December 2000, January 2001) and this did not happen. Another company was selected and a new agreement was signed (mobilization planned on March 2001). Finally, only at the end of September 2001 the drill rig reached the site. The drilling operation started anyhow very late end of September 2001, which was cause of additional no-cost extension.

For all the life of the project, especially for the planned activity, decisions about strategy, time and financial support were planned timely with the help of the donor.

Hygiene and sanitation promotion works

Training of hygiene and sanitation were provided to the water committees by the project and with the collaboration of OWMERD in the three hand-dug wells of Borena Zone Liben Woreda. The training for generator operators had been carried out in Negele for the Qurale borehole and practical sessions were given on the spot as well.

Table 3 Number of beneficiaries of successful schemes

No	Name of PA	Human population
1	Kersemele	1,000
2	Adadi kerero	1,000
3	Gobicha	3,000
4	Qurale (Pumping system & distribution)	8,000

In the hygienic campaign, the social and technical parts related to the water schemes were followed up. Emphasis was given to the sanitation program, in which social promoters were involved in sensitizing the beneficiary communities in matters related to water.

From the interview with some targeted community, it seems that they understood the aim of the awareness program but, although this, they are not practicing. During the rainy seasons, it is common to see people collecting water from small depressions instead of fetching it from safe water source.

These project had a good deal of positive impact on improving the livelihood of the community, specially for women and children who were the most vulnerable people to the occurring drought and responsible for fetching water by travelling long distances.

The project improved access to potable water for a total population of 13,000 people.

Efforts were also made in developing systems on community based water scheme management in order to obtain proper cost recovery and keep the schemes sustainable; because of this, four village water management committees were organized for the four accomplished schemes. These were oriented and received training concerning hygiene and sanitation and cost recovery system practiced in their places accordingly.

Table 4 Characteristics and present status of the schemes

No	Site name	Description	Depth (m)	Discharge (l/s)	Pump installed	Status
1	Kersemele	Located at 16 km. from Negele on Negele-Addis road 9km. from the road.	8m.	0. 5	Afridev	Working
2	Adadi Kararo	Located at 23 km from Negele on Negele-Addis road and 7km from Kersemele well	11m.	1	Afridev	Working
3	Gobicha	Located in the southern end of Negele town.	8.62m.	1	Solar	Working
4	Qurale	Located 60 Km North of Filtu	319	-	Submersible motor pump	Working (drilled by Food Security Project and COOPI)
5	Haydimtu	Located 20 Km from Filtu along the road to Negele	543	Less than 0.5	-	Non productive

Orientation and training works

The purpose of the training was to strength the capacity of the community on managing the constructed schemes, on the concepts of cost recovery, operation, maintenance, hygiene and sanitation.

In this aspect, continuous training have been organized and conducted on the subject of water management works, operation and maintenance of hand pump, operation of solar pump, and operation of generator for Qurale borehole, cost recovery and sanitation.

The community understood the concepts of hygiene and sanitation and cost recovery system. Though not satisfactory the cost recovery system in some PA's and other activities listed in the above paragraph seems to be practiced by the committees. However, these trainings were not deep rooted and the general result was not satisfactory.

3.4 Effectiveness

The realization of the Overall Objective (to alleviate the emergency in the project area) through pursuing of the Project Purpose (improved water quality, increase the number of water resources and hand dug wells and boreholes properly functioning) was partially achieved if compared to the real needs in the area.

The realization of the three hand-dug wells represented a small support to the particular situation of emergency of the area. Qurale borehole assumed a strategically important role to solve water problems in the area, fully satisfying the Overall Objective. It is not possible to affirm the same for the second borehole (Haydimtu) because it failed, and for the other activities like the supplying of material for Seru borehole that were not accomplished.

Sanitation and promotion works were able to reach the meaning of the Overall Objective, but not in a sufficient level to assure a clear conscience of the importance of these committees for the future sustainability.

The general knowledge of the cost recovery system did not reach the planned results in all the intervention areas. This is probably due to the scarce attention that was given after the constitution of the committees and for the changes, at district level (opening of a common bank account under the responsibility of the water departments), to improve the management of the bank accounts.

In any case, orientation and training courses were organized steadily and are to be considered a good help in the achievement of the Overall Objective.

In the project proposal, the assumptions were not specified. These strongly influenced the implementation of the activities during the life of the project. In the following pages (paragraph 4) the main problems that affected the project and that will be considered like assumptions are described.

3.5 Overall outcome and impact

The Overall Objective had been satisfied only in a part. This because not only for errors made in the accomplishment of some activities, but also for the characteristics of the project (small amount of water points to give preference to the borehole construction). The main activity was represented by Haydimtu borehole but as it failed, it did not resolve the bad situation that afflicts the area (Haydimtu is 20 km far from Filtu that has the same problems and 20 km to reach the Seru borehole with a good amount of water).

In some of the visited areas, the condition of the hand-dug wells did not show a strong care in the maintenance of structures: high grass inside fence, soil inside the drainpipe, show scarce management (and consequently) the bad working, in a long term, of the structures.

The three hand-dug wells and the finished borehole of Qurale alleviated the emergency in the different areas and in some cases, created good impacts compared to the previous life standards: in one of these, the population showed the initial process of the passage from pastoralist life style to agro-pastoralist. The results collected during interviews about this situation were translated in a positive way by the beneficiaries in term of food availability and increased sanitation conditions. Qurale borehole represented a good example of achievement toward the Overall Objective; in fact it becomes one of the first water points of the area for livestock and human consumption.

The sanitation and promotion works had contributed to reach the meaning of the Overall Objective. The situation of the population in the areas covered by this project was improved. During the field visits, continuous requests from the population about the needs of refreshment training concerning sanitation were recorded. Anyhow, due to different constraints the answer of the organization was unsatisfactory with respect to the number of these requests.

Problems about bureaucratic procedures (cash deposit, request of money for spare parts purchasing, general meaning of cost recovery, bank account situation) were not supported with refreshment training.

Because of supply of clean and potable water to the community, the following benefits were attained:

- saved time and energy by reducing long distance travel to reach water;
- improved health condition of the community;
- increased productivity (time for fetching water will be used for produce);
- created awareness on hygiene and sanitation;
- reduced use of unsafe water from “ellas”, ponds, and surface depressions;
- reduced tribal conflicts due to migrations in search of water.

3.6 Activities

The following activities were planned in the project proposal,

- Conducting a Geological/Hydro-geological and sociological survey,
- Construction of three (3) hand dug wells,
- Construction of superstructures at Qurale and Haydimtu
- Installing hand pump and solar pump,
- Drilling of Haydimtu borehole,
- Installing generator and pump in Haydimtu borehole,
- Purchase of back up spare parts and back up parts,
- Establish Village Water Committees (VWC) for the management of the water points and simple maintenance of the schemes.

From the planned activities, the following main activities were accomplished during the project lifecycle.

- Geological/Hydro-geological survey conducted,
- Three (3) hand dug wells constructed,
- Hand and solar pumps installed,
- A borehole in Hydintu Drilled,
- Back up generator and pump Purchased
- Qurale superstructure constructed
- Pumping system for Qurale purchased and installed
- Village Water Committees (VWC) established for the management of the water points and simple maintenance of the schemes.

4 ASSUMPTION

The Project Proposal did not consider any assumption. These were identified, during the field visits and classified as follow:

- security situation;
- local administration matters
- geological problems;
- The first company selected was late compared to its scheduled program. After signing the contract, they repeatedly reschedule their program, so that the implementing agency was obliged to sign another agreement with a company called, YADOT ENGINEERING, to start drilling sooner. These created a delay of the project accomplishment.
- While digging a hand dug well selected by technical parameters and community participation, a hard stone encountered at a certain depth, bolstered with clan conflict in the area forced the community as well as the contractor team to refuse deeper digging. So COOPI abandoned the area and selected a new site.

5 IMPLEMENTATION

5.1 Organization and implementation procedures

General

The implementing agency had a main office of the operation in Addis Ababa, which assured the logistic support and supervision and monitoring activities. The project had also two operative branches offices in Negele and Filtu. The Negele office, was also the centre for the accounting and material procurement/supply. Local staff and an expatriate one were employed by the project as per the needs and plan. The expatriate staff was involved in coordination of the activities between the two operational offices and management of daily activities in collaboration with the pertinent local staff. The local staff was responsible for the operational daily activities, the direct communication with beneficiaries and counterparts, store and accounting procedures, etc.

Financing and administrative organization

The program had its operative head quarter in Negele Borena where the logistic and the services could support the implementation of the project. An accountant and a casher assured the correct cash flow procedure of the organization further supervised by the presence of an expatriate staff. Cash request were made on monthly basis and the transfer of cash from Addis Ababa was made regularly in average twice in a month. The cash was transferred to a bank account opened and used only for this project, guaranteeing financial transparency. According to the interviews neither delay nor lack of funds were noticed. The compiled accounting documents were regularly sent to Addis Ababa for financial elaboration. Purchase of material and supplies at project level followed standard procedures even if the system needed to be improved.

Materials, Equipment and Works

All locally available materials and equipment were purchased in the country. Afridev model types of hand-pumps were installed, which are found to be effective and reliable by the implementing agency according to its experience. Solar pump and other materials not available in Ethiopia were purchased from COOPI office in Milan.

5.2 Timetable

Frequent rescheduling of the activities versus the time is not a good practice in the implementation of a project especially in the case of emergency oriented ones, which are thought for very short periods. Anyhow, each reschedule was communicated to the donor agency through an apposite Rescheduled Time Table annexed in each quarterly report.

5.3 Costs and financing plan

Although the donor agency financial regulation did not allow any disbursement of funds at the beginning of the project and during the period prior to the coming quarter, the implementing agency showed worthy capacities in handling expenditures anticipating the cash. On the other hand, the prompt presentation of the quarterly narrative and financial reports to the donor agency and the quick reimbursements of the expenses of the latter after the approval of the expenditures presented, allowed a smooth financial flows that positively reflected in a continue implementation of the project activities.

5.4 Special conditions/accompanying measures taken by government

Security

Due to the clash between Somali and Oromo clans in the border of the two Zones (fighting along the road and in the town of Hayasuftu), which occurred twice in the project time, the road from Filtu to Negele was blocked. This interrupted the over all activities in the area for more than two weeks over the project span. More over one site selected for hand dug well construction in the border PA of Liben Woreda (Borena Zone) was abandoned.

Emergency

Despite the good rainy season in the area, part of the communities of the project area (Filtu and Liben) were suffering from drought, which pushed the Zonal DPP Committee to carry out an assessment. This brought about organizational trouble because the stakeholders were mainly worried about receiving food rather than participating in the activities of this project.

Logistic

Sporadic shortage of diesel and chronic shortage of gasoline pushed the organization to look for time-taking alternative solutions that delayed the activities.

Hiring of rig drill was another problem that obliged the organization to rearrange programmes. This greatly affected the scheduled time because the enterprises usually failed to commence their agreed duties within the frame of the contract.

6 SUSTAINABILITY

6.1 Policy support

The Ethiopian government recently have publicized agriculture and rural based development policy that is mainly focused in the decentralization of human power and capital to the grass root. The main directions for the strategy of decentralization are; direction of diversified development, extensive utilisation of human power, reasonable utilisation of cultivable land, and intermingled development process.

This strategy of development is focusing on the rural areas, which were the main target areas of this project so believed to have great impact on the sustainability of the activities.

6.2 Appropriate technology

The solar and hand pumps installed in the three hand dug wells are among the appropriate technologies practiced during the implementation of this project. This schemes give service to the concerned community with a very less or no running costs.

In both Zones, the concept of cost coverage was introduced to the community as an integral component of the intervention to increase the sustainability of the schemes implemented during the project life.

6.3 Socio cultural aspects

For the implementation of the project the organization made use of effective net working (among the implementer project units, grass root organizations, and government departments at zonal and regional level) and cost recovery system strategies. In such a way the net working effort were used since the beginning from project planning, hydrological survey, site selection, community organizing, training of village water committees, etc. Cost recovery system has been used to maintain the financial as well as the physical sustainability of the project activities.

Sites were selected according to the priority list given by the administration and the communities that were involved in the site selection and participated on the construction of the schemes, hence developing a feeling of ownership in the community.

Before the construction of these schemes the communities were mobile for the sake of water for both livestock and human beings and pasture for livestock. From the interviews held with the beneficiaries of one of the HDW constructed by this project, some members are starting an agro pastoralist way of life, which allows them to stay permanently in the place.

The different activities of the project that the community participated to can be expressed in brief as:

- Project planning and implementation: the community played a major role in site identification, site selection, and during construction took part in direct labour activities like site clearing loading unloading of construction materials and equipment. They have also participated in election of community members for formation of water management committee and pump attendants’ selection.
- Community water supply scheme management: village water committees were established consisting of one to two women members. During our visit to different sites, we observed that the formed water committees were weak in managing the water schemes in a way that in some places they kept the revenue collected on hand.
- Community financial management: The project with the collaboration of Borena Zone WMERDD, introduced a system of financial management. Bank accounts for all the schemes were opened and revenues collected were deposited in bank. Tariffs are set by the community through technical assistance of the Zonal WMERDD,
 1. In hand dug well fitted with Solar and in the Borehole the rate is 10 cents per a 20 liters 20l-water-tank per person, 10 cents per cattle, 5 cents per goats and sheep’s, 20 cents per camel;
 2. In hand dug wells fitted with Pump the rate of payment is a bit different and every user is supposed to pay 1 (one) ETB per month. This way of collecting money reduced the efficiency of the cost recovery system.
- In general, range between 50 and 3,000 ETB were collected and deposited in their respective Leisure (bank accounts) since the schemes are functional.

6.4 Institutional and management capacity

Manpower planning and management

There were 13 (the number was found different according to the needs) workers employed by COOPI with different discipline and qualifications for the implementation of different projects activities in the two districts. The project had an accountant and a cashier for the accounting flow. The project coordinator and the accountant controlled financial flow activities. The plan for the employment of the local staff was adapted to the needs and did not perfectly reflect the initial proposed arrangement.

Material (property management)

Purchase of materials was carried out on pro-forma system in the field offices as well as in head office. Items required for project use were requested and

Final Evaluation

Project title: "Emergency program to assist vulnerable people in Liben and Filtu Woreda"

purchased by workers of the project units prior approval of the project coordinator and sent to head quarter or locally purchased. Fixed assets are kept in good condition in the store with bin cards fixed on them, which are controlled by stock card system.

7 MONITORING & EVALUATION

7.1 Definition of indicators

The indicators specified

Table 5 Indicators respect activities

in the proposal were the number of direct beneficiaries of the schemes and the water capacity of the schemes that the community could fetch from.

No.	Type of scheme	Place of scheme	Indicator in m ³ /day	
			Planned	Achieved
1	HDW	Gobicha	20	50
2	HDW	Kersemele	7	10
3	HDW	Adadi Kerero	7	10
4	Borehole	Qurale	50	50
Total				120

The total expected quantity of water that can be fetched in a day at the end of the activities was 174 m³/day, but due to the failure of one of the planned borehole, this quantity reduced to 120 m³/day. The total number of direct beneficiaries of the project planned was 28,000. The actual amount is 13,000

7.2 Reviews/evaluation

The donor Agency monitored and evaluated the project according to its convenience. COOPI, through its staff in Negele and Filtu sub-offices and DPPC at different level (Region/Zone/Woreda) monitored the implementation and progress of the planned activities. The plan of activities was prepared at the beginning of the project.

COOPI office in Negele used to prepare the technical report to line departments as well as to the donor agency. COOPI Addis kept the account, prepared financial reports, carried out national purchases and supervision.

Project reviews were thought and proposed to the donor agency by the implementing organization. Only after the donor agency approved the review of budget/activities the implementing agency proceeded accordingly.

8 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMANDATIONS

In general it is not possible to assert that the project reached the main object fixed in the proposal. Causes must be searched in the structure of the project planned at the time of its redaction.

- The failure of Haydimtu borehole did not let the opportunity to estimate the achievement of the overall objective. The other accomplished activities alone were not able to satisfy the emergency situation of the area.

- The activity of maintenance and purchase of materials was planned in connection with the success of the failed borehole. This meant the realization of the above mentioned activity (maintenance and purchase of materials) was directly dependent on the positive result of Haydimtu borehole.
- The area coverage of the project is very wide in respect to the number and type of activities planned, which brought about lack of centralization during implementation period;
- Most of the project’s budget was planned and consequently utilised to cover the cost of Haydimtu borehole, without giving the necessary attention to the other activities.

Problems that did not depend on the internal organisation are as follow:

- The available companies in the countries market were not reliable to cover all the drilling aspects of the borehole activities within the frame work of the scheduled time: because the drilling company did not give constant technical as well as managerial follow up during and before drilling;
- During this evaluation, it was observed that the nearest stakeholders had no documented information concerning recent rules and regulations of the government in water and social activities like the cost recovery one.
- The security situation of the area was an uncontrollable factor that conditioned the activities of the project.

The positive impact of the project activities can be summarised as follows:

- Cost recovery system is starting to show that, in some communities the awareness that they had before and what they had during this evaluation is improving. I.e. the communities of one of the project sites are thinking to cover the expenditure of purchasing of a motor pump for supporting the solar system during cloudy periods of the year.
- In some areas pastoralist communities changed into agro pastoralist. This show, sometimes, the real strong impact of the project activities to modify and conditioning community’s life. To reduce the mobility rate of part of the community during dry season could mean: increasing hygienic situation, increase the educational needs, improvement of the community in social and economic conditions. But at the same time could deteriorate the ecosystem in which they are living and different aspects that only an anthropological survey could express.
- The past project beneficiaries are requesting capacity building trainings for hygiene and sanitation and technical refreshment courses, which can be a sign of empowerment and/or increasing awareness.

In general the project represents a good base to plan new proposals that can use some of these indicators to develop new strategies of interventions. These areas are showing good synergic work together with past implemented activities for the resolution of the chronic emergency.

Is our opinion that problems and unsuccessful past activities, strategically correct, were affected and failed for problems connected with lack of knowledge concerning the real anthropological situation of the beneficiaries. These showed

Final Evaluation

Project title: "Emergency program to assist vulnerable people in Liben and Filtu Woreda"

the capacity and instruments to increase the life standard and to adapt their needs with the condition of the areas; this must be a teaching for organizations and for all future interventions.